



El Camino College

College Council Minutes

Monday, October 1, 2018

1:30 – 2:30 p.m. Library 202

Attendance

Dena Maloney, Kristie Daniel-DiGregorio, Chris Jeffries, Jesse Mills, Debbie Turano, Rose Mahowald, David McPatchell, Ann O'Brien, Virginia Rapp, Adrianna Estrada, Brian Fahnestock, Jean Shankweiler, Ross Miyashiro, Irene Graff, Jane Miyashiro

Absent

Amber Gillis, Erika Solorzano, Chinua Taylor-Pearce

Agenda:

1. Welcome/Approval of Minutes

The minutes from the September 17, 2018 minutes were approved.

2. Review Policy Report & Policy Day Review

Dr. Maloney reviewed the legally required policies and procedures that are still in need of consultation by College Council. (handout provided). The 2-1/2 page list is getting smaller. Per AP 2410 *Board Policies*, the policies and procedures are assigned to the appropriate Vice President's areas before going through the policy development process before coming to College Council. . The next handout is a list of the policies and procedures that have been through consultation with College Council:

- AP 2110 - Vacancies on the Board will be presented as an information item on the Oct 15, 2018 Board meeting.
- AP 2431 will go into a subcommittee, including a Board member, to further vet the procedure with input from the Board of Trustees. The procedure will come back to College Council prior to going on any Board agenda.
- AP 6200 Budget Preparation and AP 6300 Fiscal Management went through College Council but revisions were requested and they are going to be reviewed again Friday, October 5.

The rest of the policies have been gone to the Board and have been updated on the ECC Website as well as BoardDocs.

We should be very proud of the number of policies and procedures that have been processed. Aside from processing those that are legally required, many of the policies were out of date, needed to be reviewed and/or had no procedures.

A quick demo of the policies posted on BoardDocs was provided. It was noted that BoardDocs is a better platform for organizing the policies. The concern is that not everyone is familiar with BoardDocs and may need training on how to navigate the site to view the policies. However, enough of the campus community knows how to navigate BoardDocs to view the Board agendas and meeting minutes. Finding the *Policies* tab would not be difficult. A hyperlink on the Board of Trustees page on the ECC website could automatically get you to the Board Policies posted on BoardDocs. College Council will discuss this again on October 15, 2018.

The first Policy Review day is Friday, October 5 at 8:00am at the President's office. The final list of policies and procedures for review on the 5th is still being developed. There are several procedures coming from ITS. Art Libel will be present to go over these procedures. Laura Saldarriaga from the Teachers Federation will be joining the group on Friday. Ross would like to bring the policy on Residency Determination for review on Friday.

Policies and procedures will be loaded into the My ECC portal prior to Friday's meeting. On that day we will divide up into teams. If you have any policies or procedures that need to be reviewed, please submit them to Rose. We will determine how to organize our review teams that morning.

Side Note: Compton posts its policies on BoardDocs and it is very clean and user friendly.

3. Food Service Committee Recommendation

Brian Fahnstock presented a handout with suggested representation from campus wide stakeholders for the Food Service Committee along with its purpose statement.

This Food Service Committee would serve as an advisory committee to College Council. The committee would establish a protocol for providing feedback to the vendor. A bookstore staff manager will chair the committee. A representative from the Academic Senate has already been selected - Randy Firestone. Ann O'Brien would like to be the administrator representative.

This is a great "next step". We used the informal task force to select the new food vendor. Institutionalizing a Food Service Committee that would serve as a conduit of information, to bring forward needs, requests, feedback and bring back from the vendor, any concern, issues or concepts is a great idea. The committee would meet a least quarterly.

The idea of a Suggestion Box was discussed. It would be a great topic for the first committee meeting. College Council is in agreement. The formation of the Food Service Committee will commence.

Another committee we should think about is a Safety Committee. . Rocky Bonura was t the chair of this committee so it is time to reactivate. Safety at night was a concern that came up in the Climate Survey results. The Committee will regroup, develop goals and a purpose, and provide regular reports to College Council.

Additionally, the emergency plan needs some work. The Emergency Operations Committee must be reactivated. Vice President Fahnestock will discuss this with Director of Contracts, Purchasing and Risk Management. .

4. Horticulture Discontinuance

Dr. Jean Shankweiler and Kristie Daniel-DiGregorio provided information on the discontinuance of the Horticulture program. (Handout provided)

For a number of years the Horticulture department had one full-time faculty member and no part-time faculty members. Enrollment in the courses were low - less than 50%. The full-time faculty member has retired and it is very difficult for the Dean to find part-time faculty. It is suggested, given the information, the program be discontinued. This conversation has continued over a number of years. Last year a committee was convened, in accordance to the BP and AB 4021 *Program Discontinuance* to investigate the discontinuation of the program. The committee had representation from the Deans, Academic Senate and faculty members, including one from inside the division and one outside of the division. Irene Graff was on the committee and developed the research for the investigation. The data was reviewed by the committee and it was recommended to Academic Senate that the program be discontinued. We consulted with the department, which falls within the Biology Life Science, and they have no objection to discontinuing the program. Academic Senate asked for a Teach Out plan. Dean Grant developed the Teach Out plan and how we can accommodate any currently enrolled students. Once the Teach Out plan was inserted into the proposal, Academic Senate approved the discontinuation of the Environmental Horticulture Program. The proposal went through two readings in the Academic Senate, on May 1 and May 15, 2018. . This proposal was a recommendation to the President who brought it to College Council. If it is approved in College Council, it will be brought to the Board to discontinue the program. There are robust horticulture programs nearby. Any student who wants to complete the program would have the option to complete the program at another community college. Long Beach CC has a beautiful program. The 184 students currently enrolled in the program will be contacted.

College Council discussed the following:

The dissolution of the program may seem counterintuitive since the public is currently thinking about environmental sustainability and drought tolerant landscaping. It would be useful to understand why we do not a viable horticulture program.

From data produced through the Research and Planning department, to work in landscaping all you need is a high school degree. To be a landscape architect you need a bachelor's degree. Our program does not build the skills required to be a landscape architect. Our program falls in between.

This is consistent with data collected from IR. Horticulture degrees/certificates have been in decline -13% nationally, -5.5% in California and -8.5% in Los Angeles.

Why do other colleges around us have vibrant viable horticultural programs - Long Beach, Mt. SAC, and Fullerton? What is it about their programs that they are thriving? Is it different content, skill set?

ECC did not direct toward careers in sustainability. ECC's program provided a broad overview of horticulture. (i.e. plant identification), and lacked focus for jobs over minimum wage - turf management and sustainability. Long Beach has very dedicated faculty for their program and comprehensive facilities - 4 green houses, a koi pond, hatchery, edible food cabin. Although we do have the horticulture building which is in disrepair, ECC does not have room/space for these types of facilities. Our greenhouse is inadequate to support this kind of program.

ECC students, depending on the number of courses they have completed, may be qualified to attend one of the other colleges to complete their certification/degree. The Board will be concerned about the impact on those students. Between 2005-2016, 21 degrees and 30 certificates have been awarded.

What alternate options have been considered?

The Deans of Natural Sciences and Industry and Technology researched whether the program could be incorporated into the Architecture program as landscape design. There is not enough overlap to make that a successful repurposing option. It would require rewriting new curriculum and develop new articulation agreements that would enable student to transfer to a bachelors. It would also require significant investment in facilities and faculty. Even if funding were available, where would an expanded greenhouse fit in the master plan? The other campuses have extensive land to support this program. Mt. SAC and Fullerton have direct pipelines with 4-year institutions for their programs. ECC never established that sort of pipeline. Long Beach's program is a 40 unit program that is geared toward owning your own business – gardening or floral shop.

What research has been done to determine the impact on students?

The request is to conduct some follow up with Mt. SAC, Long Beach and Fullerton and bring the matter to the Board in November. This topic will be brought back to the College Council at its next meeting.

5. Strategic Planning Committee Meeting briefing – The committee met on Friday, September 28, 2018

Topics of discussion:

- a. Service area analysis to serve as a foundation for planning
- b. Extensive report on campus climate
- c. Reveal from Ann O'Brien on messaging – more to come.

The bulk of the meeting was spent on looking at the Strategic Plan Board Policy 1200 in terms of its alignment with common practices at other colleges and the CCLC template. We also discussed the alignment of the current strategic plan's Strategic Initiatives and Objectives,

with the Educational Master Plan and Comprehensive Master. It was proposed to shorten BP 1200 so it contains only what is recommended by CCLC– Mission, Vision and Statement of Values, with some language that would be specific to ECC. The outcome of that discussion will be sent through the consultation process in the next month.

The final topic is required by the budget trailer language - By January 1, we have to have an alignment of our institutional outcomes with the Chancellor’s Office Strategic Vision. The Strategic Vision has new metrics and goals. How does El Camino College’s goals and metrics align with these? How does the student centered funding formula and the discontinuation of the student success scorecard change the playing field? The goal is to present this to the Board in November and have the Board approve the new institutional outcomes in December. The same will have to happen at Compton College as well.

A lot of things have been tied to the alignment with the Chancellor’s Office Strategic Vision for Success. Yet, there is no clarity from the Chancellor’s office on how we demonstrate alignment. The deadlines and timelines have not been definitively established. It is confusing for the entire system but ECC is on the right path. We will follow our processes and will take our aligned metrics to the Board in Nov/Dec, We will demonstrate the Board has approved them through Board Action. We will do what is necessary despite the confusion. Lastly, Ann will be invited to share the outcomes and emerged themes from the Bridging Study. She will be taking that around to all the collegial consultation groups.

6. Adjournment All

Future Meeting Dates: 1:30 p.m. in Lib. 202

D. Maloney

Reminder only

Fall College Council Meetings

- a. Monday, October 15, 2018 (Board Day)
- b. Monday November 5, 2018
- c. Friday, November 9, 2018 (Policy Day)
- d. Monday, November 19, 2018 (Board Day)
- e. Monday, December 3, 2018
- f. Monday, December 17, 2018 (Board Day)

Spring College Council Meetings

- a. Monday, February 18, 2019 (Board Day)
- b. Monday, March 4, 2019
- c. Monday, March 18, 2019 (Board Day)
- d. Monday, April 1, 2019
- e. Monday, April 15, 2019 (Board Day)
- f. Monday, May 6, 2019
- g. Monday, May 20, 2019 (Board Day)

h. Monday, June 3, 2019

2018-19 College Council Goals

1. Lead the ECC Governance Evaluation Project and develop recommendations to improve governance processes at ECC.
2. Complete/continue development of legally required policies. Review strategies and tools to improve accessibility of BP/APs and select/implement solution.
3. Support Compton Transition Planning process to conclude partnership by June 7, 2019.
4. Consult collegially to help develop a Strategic Plan, ensuring alignment with the Chancellor's Office *Strategic Vision for Success* and findings from the Climate Survey.
5. Consult collegially to discuss and recommend the topics for the Quality Focused Essay by February 1, 2019.
6. Monitor progress on overarching initiatives, including but not limited to, Guided Pathways, Strong Workforce, and AB705 implementation

Food Service Committee

The Food Service Committee serves as an advisory committee to College Council in an effort to deliver the highest quality food service on campus.

The committee will consist of the following members:

- The Food Service Vendor
- Bookstore Director
- Bookstore Assistant Director (Chair)
- One student selected by the Associated Student Organization
- One student selected by the Student Trustee
- Two classified staff members selected by the classified union
- One faculty member selected by the Faculty Senate
- One faculty member selected by the faculty union
- One administrator selected by the President

Committee Purpose

The primary purpose of the Food Service Committee is to provide a direct channel of feedback, support and guidance for food service operations on campus. The Committee will meet at least quarterly and will evaluate current operations, recent events, upcoming opportunities and campus climate/comments to help identify actions that will correct deficiencies and improve food service delivery.

Commissions from food service operations, (food service vender, food trucks, and campus vending) will be identified and accounted for in a separate Food Service Operations Fund. Those funds may be used in direct support of current operations and service improvements. The Food Service Committee will monitor those funds and make recommendations to College Council and ultimately to the Board of Trustees for allocation and expenditure.

The goal of these deliberations is to ultimately improve all aspects of the food service experience at the College. This may include subsidies for menu items, subsidies for events and purchases of materials in support of entertainment or comfort in and around food service venues on campus.

Program Evaluation Task Force: Horticulture

Executive Summary

El Camino College's Horticulture program has experienced significant changes in the last decade. These include the courses no longer articulating for CSU general education, the retirement of the sole full-time instructor, difficulty recruiting part-time instructors, declining student enrollments, and a lack of space to upgrade facilities. As a result, a program evaluation task force was convened. Representation included Academic Affairs, the Academic Senate, Institutional Research and Planning, faculty and deans. The task force considered program data, labor market trends, and comparable institutions. A variety of alternatives were considered, including relocating courses to other academic departments within the college. After a full and open discussion, the task force concluded that the program is unable to successfully achieve or make substantial progress toward its goals and objectives. The task force recommended discontinuance of the program, provided current Horticulture students are informed and sufficiently supported so they may complete their education in a timely manner. The recommendation and the discontinuance plan were reviewed and endorsed by the Academic Senate.

Program Evaluation Task Force

El Camino College's Horticulture program has experienced significant changes in the last decade. These include the courses no longer articulating for CSU general education and declining student enrollments. The sole full-time instructor retired in Spring 2016 and staffing classes has been a perennial challenge. For example, in Fall 2017, two rounds of job announcements for adjunct Horticulture faculty yielded only one applicant who did not meet minimum qualifications. As a result, one of the two Horticulture offerings for Spring 2018 was cancelled.

As outlined in BP/AP 4021, a program evaluation task force was convened to review the viability of the Horticulture program. The task force was co-chaired by the Vice President for Academic Affairs and the Academic Senate president. Its members included two faculty, two deans and an Institutional Research representative who served in an advisory role. The members of the task force met in Fall 2016 and Spring 2017 and were as follows:

Kristie Daniel-DiGregorio (Academic Senate)
Irene Graff (Institutional Research and Planning)
Gloria Miranda (Dean, Behavioral and Social Sciences)
Virginia Rapp (Dean, Business)
Jean Shankweiler (Academic Affairs)
Rob Shibao (Natural Sciences)
Josh Troesh (Business).

After determining procedures, criteria and guidelines for decision-making, the task force requested the following data on the ECC Horticulture program:

- Success and Retention by course (2006-2016)
- Fill rates by course (2007-2016)
- FTES (2009-2016)

- Degrees and certificates awarded (2006-2016)
- Student demographics and enrollment characteristics (2009-2015).

The task force also considered:

- National, regional, and local job projections for Horticulture occupations, including farmer, rancher, grounds maintenance worker, landscaping worker, first line supervisor, and landscape architect.
- FTES, programs offered, staffing, and program highlights for the following six comparable programs in the region:
 - LA Pierce College
 - Mt. San Antonio College
 - Orange Coast College
 - Saddleback College
 - Long Beach City College
 - Fullerton College.
- The need for and present adequacy of resources.

Evaluation of Program Effectiveness

As required by BP/AP 4021, the task force engaged in a full and open discussion of the program's effectiveness in serving the community, the college, and its students.

The program data confirmed declining student enrollment and low fill and completion rates in Horticulture courses. Enrollment reached a peak of 131 students in Fall 2010. After this term, enrollment steadily decreased to 79 students in Fall 2015. The average Horticulture FTES from 2009-2010 to 2015-2016 was 29.19. From 2006-2016, Fall and Spring course fill rates averaged 69.6% and 67.7%, respectively. From 2005-2006 to 2015-2016, El Camino College has awarded 21 degrees and 30 certificates in Horticulture. Success and retention rates for most courses have consistently been below college success and retention rates.

A number of area community colleges have robust Horticulture programs. These include Saddleback College, Mt. San Antonio College, and Orange Coast College. These colleges offer a variety of specializations and have dedicated space on their campuses for their Horticulture programs. Their course offerings and student enrollments are strong. For example, Mt. San Antonio College in 2014-2015 had 433 enrollments, 20 section offerings, and 48 FTES. In contrast, El Camino College had 146 enrollments, 7 section offerings, and 14 FTES.

Labor market requirements may provide some context for understanding El Camino's declining enrollment. The academic requirements for Horticulture occupations (e.g., farmer and rancher, grounds maintenance worker, landscaping worker, first line supervisor) show the majority needing high school diplomas, whereas, the majority of positions for landscape architect require a Bachelor of Arts degree. El Camino's Horticulture program provides higher credentials than are required for most Horticulture careers, while El Camino's Horticulture degrees and certificates are not sufficient for careers in landscape architecture. This may help explain why awards of Horticulture degrees and certificates have been on the decline since 2003 nationally (-12.7%), in California (-5.6%), and in LA County (-8.4%). El Camino awarded 4 degrees and 3 certificates in 2014-2015 academic year.

The task force reviewed the adequacy of resources for the Horticulture program. Current facilities are limited in their effectiveness and improvements would require significant capital expenditures. To effectively support the Horticulture's program goals and objectives, the current greenhouse would need to be relocated and expanded and upgraded to incorporate plumbing and electricity. The greenhouse is inconveniently located, situated between Parking Structure E and Construction Technology. This location, and the lack of electricity and nearby restroom facilities, not only limits its usability but also presents safety considerations. A much-needed expansion of the facilities is not possible because there is no available space in the Master Plan.

Task Force Recommendations

As required by BP/AP 4021, the task force engaged in a full and open discussion of the program's effectiveness in serving the community, the college, and its students. Previous intervention strategies were discussed. For example, advisory committees were convened to develop strategies to enhance and sustain the program. However, implementation of these strategies requires the sustained effort of a full-time instructor, a position that has been vacant since Spring 2016.

The task force considered relocating courses with moderate enrollment, success and retention rates to other academic departments within the college such as Environmental Technology or Architecture in the Industry and Technology Division. However, the focus in these departments is on landscaping, design, and plant materials while the focus of Horticulture is on the care and culture of plants. Vast revisions of the curriculum would be required to integrate Horticulture courses into the Environmental Technology or Architecture departments. A landscape architect was consulted. He explained that the Horticulture program trains nurserymen and gardeners that nurture the plants, while a landscape architecture program focuses on the design of outdoor areas to create an effect.

After a full and open discussion, the task force unanimously concluded that the program is unable to successfully achieve or make substantial progress toward its goals and objectives and should be discontinued.

Consultation

As noted in AP 4021, Program Discontinuance procedures require that the Academic Senate have a consultative role in all discussions of program discontinuance. The President of the Academic Senate served as co-chair for the task force and the recommendation to discontinue El Camino College's Horticulture program was presented to the Academic Senate for two readings and a vote (May 1st and 15th, 2018). The Senate reviewed the program data, labor market trends, information on comparison colleges, a summary of the task force deliberations, a teach out plan for discontinuance of the program, and referral resources for Horticulture students. Natural Sciences senators confirmed that faculty in their division were consulted and support the recommendation to discontinue the program. The Academic Senate voted to endorse the task force recommendation to discontinue the Horticulture program on May 15th, 2018.

Plan for the Discontinuance of the Horticulture Program

The following is a three-year plan for the discontinuance of the Environmental Horticulture Program, beginning in Spring 2019. The three-year time frame will allow some students to finish a program or

certificate that they've already started. These courses will be offered as long as qualified faculty can be hired to teach them.

Year 0 Fall 18: Hort-41 General Horticulture Hort-55 Plant ID Trees	Year 1 Spring 19: Hort-42 Plant Propagation Hort-56 Plant ID-Shrubs
Year 1 Fall 19: Hort-54 Landscape Design Hort-53 Soils and Fertilizers	Year 2 Spring 20: Hort-60 Landscape Irrigation Hort-46 Pest Control
Year 2 Fall 20: Hort-41 General Horticulture Hort-55 Plant ID Trees	Year 3 Spring 21: Hort-42 Plant Propagation Hort-56 Plant ID-Shrubs
Year 3 Fall 21: Hort-54 Landscape Design Hort-53 Soils and Fertilizers	

Data from Institutional Research and Planning indicates that 184 students have taken a Horticulture course since Fall 2017. Each of these students has been or will be contacted by email, phone and U.S. mail. In addition, they will be provided information for area Horticulture programs which includes distance from the El Camino College campus, the number of degrees, certificates, and classes offered; and a link to the program website.

Conclusion

Given the perennial challenges being faced by the El Camino College’s Horticulture program (e.g., declining enrollments, no full-time faculty, difficulty recruiting adjunct instructors, need for capital improvements), the Program Evaluation Task Force recommends that the program be discontinued at the end of Fall 2021. The Academic Senate has been consulted and has endorsed this recommendation.