

## **Standard Four: Educational Programs**

*The institution offers collegiate-level programs in recognized fields of study that culminate in identified student competencies leading to degrees and certificates. The provisions of this standard are broadly applicable to all educational activities offered in the name of the institution, regardless of where or how presented, or by whom taught.*

---

### **A. General Provisions**

**A.1** *The institution seeks to meet the varied educational needs of its students through programs consistent with its instructional mission and purposes and the demographics and economics of its community.*

#### **Descriptive Summary:**

El Camino College makes a continuous effort to identify and meet the educational needs of its diverse student population. Staff identify students needs through campuswide program review efforts, student interest surveys, vocational advisory committee input, and enrollment trends. Planning documents, such as the El Camino College Technology Plan (4.1), demonstrate the college's efforts to plan for and meet the students' academic, career, personal growth, and lifelong learning needs. To reflect the changing demographics and economic needs of the college's students and the community, many campus constituencies, including the District Planning Council, review and refine college-wide goals and objectives on a regular basis.

Beginning in February, 1998, the Dean of Planning, Research and Development held meetings with individuals and groups, including the Board of Trustees, the District Planning Council, the Academic Senate, individual faculty members, faculty, and staff gathered at division and department meetings, college committees, college administrators, and community leaders, to review the educational programs and support services currently in place. Thereafter, the Dean of Planning, Research, and Development outlined a planning process that

all instructional and support service units would follow to effectively develop a future direction and to identify the major issues related to educational and facilities planning.

The District Planning Council began the planning process with an examination of the internal and external environments that influence the future development of both the instructional and support service areas. With the assistance of a research analyst, the Dean of Planning, Research and Development subsequently reached a series of conclusions on such topics as instructional and support service program development, instructional delivery, the potential for additional educational centers within the community, and the staffing and financial support that would be needed to operationalize these improvements.

When planning for the improvement of current programs, all educational programs participate in program review (4.2), during which time faculty members develop review processes and generate recommendations that reflect the current state of the department (curriculum resources, community demographics, and demand). Furthermore, through the efforts of the Office of Institutional Research, the college now has the ability to evaluate demographics, business and community needs, and student demands for services (4.3). Since its last accreditation, the college hired a Director of Institutional Research and two institutional research analysts, who further enable the college to evaluate its programs and services.

In addition, the college offers a comprehensive curriculum designed to meet a diverse range of

student educational needs. Courses in English as a Second Language, as well as developmental English and mathematics, serve students who need additional preparation to successfully complete college-level assignments. Similarly, the Instructional Services Division offers a number of courses to assist students with study skills, grammar, vocabulary, and prewriting. Further, students with employment or retraining goals can select from courses in 60 career and vocational areas. Thirty-three certificates of completion and 32 certificates of competence are available in vocational programs, including respiratory care, legal assistant, fire and emergency technology, art gallery management, and childhood education. The college also offers associate in arts degrees in 29 programs and associate in science degrees in 47 programs. A majority of the credit courses offered each semester meet the needs of students who intend to transfer to four-year colleges and universities. Moreover, the college provides vocational and lifelong learning curriculum through its credit courses and through not-for-credit, fee-based courses offered through community education.

The college also provides special programs and services to students with unique or non-traditional needs. Such special programs and services include the Honors Transfer Program, Extended Opportunities Programs and Services (EOP&S), the Puente Project, the Disabled Students Programs and Services (DSP&S), the Tutorial Center, the Learning Resource Center, the Writing Center, the Technical and Occupational Programs (TOP) learning lab, the Alliance for Minority Participation (AMP) Program, the California Work Opportunities and Responsibilities to Kids (CalWORKs) Program, the Afternoon College Program, and the First Year Experience Program. Recently, the Mathematical Sciences Division has established a local Mathematics, Engineering and Science Achievement (MESA) Program through the California Community College Program (CCCP). The program serves between 100 and 120 math, science, and engineering students who wish to transfer to four-year colleges but face barriers in terms of academic support ser-

vices, financial resources, transfer information, and knowledge of the college's courses and resources. MESA employs a number of interventions to increase diversity within the program and to increase the successful course completion and transfer rates of the targeted students. Also, under the Director of Humanities, faculty have worked to create a Learning Community Alliance, which is designed to increase successful course completion and transfer rates by strategically linking select courses. In addition to all of these special programs, the Associated Students of El Camino College provide students with opportunities to participate in student government, clubs, and a variety of social activities.

### **Self Evaluation:**

El Camino College ensures that courses and programs reflect both the instructional mission of the college, as well as the diverse educational needs of the campus community in a number of ways. First, the college develops and maintains a class schedule designed to accommodate a wide variety of student needs, including those of full-time and part-time students and those with career and family responsibilities. The college offers classes in the day and evening, Monday through Friday, and approximately 66 sections of classes on Saturdays, as well as four sections of classes on Sundays. The college typically offers summer classes in three sessions of various lengths (4.4), in order to provide ongoing, continuous summer opportunities for students. Second, for students needing more flexible, non-traditional schedules, the college has made every effort to offer courses of varied lengths to meet the identified needs of students and the community. Such efforts are evident in distance education, short term, weekend, and Afternoon College course offerings. Third, the college also routinely offers courses which reflect its diverse population. Examples include African Dance and History of the Chicano in the United States. Finally, in the interest of serving as many students as possible, programs such as the Puente Project (which was originally developed to increase the number of Mexican

American/Latino students transferring to four-year colleges and universities) and Project Success (which initially targeted recent African American high college graduates) are now open to all students. However, as a series of informal inquiries concerning the college's special programs revealed, diversifying the population of students served by some of these programs has not solved one of the most critical problems, a lack of awareness concerning services provided. Since the college's special programs have not always been aggressively marketed, academic division staff and students are sometimes unaware of the services these programs offer.

Many of the foregoing assertions concerning the college's efforts to respond to the needs of the students have been validated by the results of the Noel-Levitz student survey where, when asked to respond to the statement, "The courses and programs offered meet the needs of current students," 52% of the students surveyed indicated they were satisfied or very satisfied, and 21% indicated they were somewhat satisfied. Similarly, when asked to respond to the statement, "There is a good variety of courses provided on this campus," 61% of the respondents indicated they were satisfied or very satisfied, and 18% indicated they were somewhat satisfied (4.5).

***A.2. Programs and courses leading to degrees are offered in a manner which provides students the opportunity to complete the program as announced, within a reasonable time.***

**Descriptive Summary:**

The college makes a concerted effort to plan and offer courses and programs in ways that allow students to complete program requirements in a timely manner. Individual divisions, in conjunction with the Vice President of Academic Affairs, carefully plan and monitor program or degree and transfer courses throughout the schedule development process.

To provide students with the courses they need, the college regularly schedules approximately 2,500 sections of classes each fall and spring semester (4.6) along with about 600 sections in the summer. During the schedule development process, faculty and division deans review courses that filled early during the previous registration period, and they develop additional sections for the upcoming schedule in an attempt to ensure that students will be able to enroll in the courses they need. Although certain transfer, degree, or developmental courses in math, English, and computer information systems are routinely oversubscribed, the division deans attempt to increase class offerings in these areas during the registration periods. Also, during each scheduling cycle, the deans review classes that were canceled during the previous semester and make changes in the number, location, or time of offerings to ensure their continued availability in subsequent semesters. Division deans also have some latitude in applying class size standards, and they may allow necessary but low-enrolled courses to remain open in order to facilitate students progress toward the completion of their programs or degrees.

To further assist students in planning a timely course of study, all courses have detailed descriptions in the college catalog, which include prerequisite and co-requisite requirements. The catalog also identifies certificate and degree requirements, along with transfer requirements, and it lists courses with their appropriate California Articulation Number (CAN) to facilitate student planning and transfer. (4.7). Finally, staff periodically review the catalog to update all course information and requirements in order to optimize student opportunity and progress.

**Self Evaluation:**

In the interest of serving the students most effectively, deans and faculty members develop sequences of courses and particular schedules of classes with great attention to the student. Despite careful planning, however, deans have

expressed concerns during staff meetings because they feel they are unable to offer a sufficient number of courses in all programs. Students face impacted classes in several areas, such as developmental math and English, as well as computer information systems. Although the reasons differ somewhat for individual programs, the consensus of the deans is that the general problems are inadequate utilization of classroom space, inadequate media and technological equipment, and an inadequate campus infrastructure.

Recently, a member of the Business Division selected an informal sampling of degrees and programs to assess whether or not a student could complete the program within a two-year time frame. This individual selected automotive technology, business, art, computer information systems, mathematics, physical science, and Spanish for the limited study. All of the programs which students began in Fall, 1998, could be completed in a two-year period (4.8). This two-year completion time does not imply that a student could choose any course to satisfy the requirements, but that at least one option was available that would allow him/her to complete the certificate/degree. In addition, in some cases, students would have to be flexible in their schedules, taking day and evening courses. However, for students beginning the same programs in Fall, 1999, at least one program has not offered an advanced class for certificate completion (Computer Information Systems 47), and, due to the specialization of the subject matter in this class, there are no alternative course selections available. Also, several other programs, such as art and automotive technology, have limited course choices.

Some programs are designed for daytime students, while others are designed for evening students. For example, although both day and evening classes are offered in the Legal Assistant Program, this particular program is clearly designed for evening students because the majority of students enrolled in the program are working adults. On the other hand, many of the office administration classes are designed

for daytime students since the majority of these students are preparing to enter the workforce. Division deans analyze the needs of the students, and they make adjustments to class offerings to satisfy student needs, but, as is evident from the schedule of classes, evening students clearly have fewer overall program options than do daytime students.

Further, advanced courses for certification programs face problems such as infrequent scheduling and limited instructional resources. Because of the advanced nature of the courses, fewer students enroll in them, so offering such courses more frequently would result in course cancellations. Consequently, division deans only offer many of the advanced courses once during a two-year time frame, and some of these courses may be offered at a less than convenient time. Thus, students must be carefully counseled, so they will not miss the opportunity to enroll in these courses. In at least one division, however, students who declare a major (in this case, theater arts) receive a list of courses offered on a rotational basis, so they can plan their schedules accordingly. If more divisions were to adopt this practice, the students who need advanced courses would be better served.

***A.3. When programs are eliminated or program requirements are significantly changed, the institution makes appropriate arrangements so that enrolled students may complete their education in a timely manner with a minimum of disruption.***

#### **Descriptive Summary:**

El Camino College gives careful consideration to the impact any program changes may have upon enrolled students' abilities to complete a program without disruption. Before proposals for program changes are approved, the College Curriculum Committee (CCC) reviews and discusses the ramifications for students. All program changes approved by the CCC are submitted for approval to the Board of Trustees. After the Board approves the program changes, they

are published in the following year's catalog.

When a program is modified or eliminated, the college staff counsel students regarding the changes and offers appropriate alternative programs or courses as needed. Divisions also phase out programs slated for elimination in a manner that allows students currently in the program to complete their degree or certificate. Students affected by the changes may request course substitutions or other program adjustments at any time through the college's petition process.

Based on the student's entrance data, the college grants him/her catalog rights, which stay in effect as long as he/she is a continuing student. Continuous enrollment is defined as enrollment at El Camino College for at least one semester (excluding summer) each calendar year. Students who maintain continuous attendance may opt to fulfill the catalog requirements in effect at the time they began attending the college, or they may opt to fulfill the requirements in effect at the time they graduate from the college (4.7, p. 32). Although there is no specified procedure that is followed by all divisions, the College Curriculum Committee, the academic divisions, and the counseling staff work together to ensure the student's catalog rights. In addition, counselors participate in division and curriculum meetings where faculty propose and approve changes.

Most programs inactivated within the last six years, such as Russian in the Humanities Division and aquatics in the Health Sciences and Athletics Division, had no students enrolled in the program.

#### **Self Evaluation:**

The college takes the elimination or change of programs seriously, and staff are sensitive to the impact changes may have on students' educational goals and objectives. The college has been reluctant to eliminate programs unless enrollment has significantly diminished and/or the cost of continuing the program completely

outweighs the benefits to students. When a program is eliminated, the college makes every effort to diminish the impact on the students. The division deans and faculty, the College Curriculum Committee, and other relevant college staff closely monitor course and program modifications. The practice of phasing in program changes over one or more semesters lessens their impact on students, and, as already noted, students always have recourse regarding changes in requirements. The college's policy of allowing students options with regard to catalog requirements is also supportive of student needs.

***A.4. The institution provides sufficient human, financial, and physical (including technological) resources to support its educational programs and to facilitate achievement of the goals and objectives of those programs regardless of the service location or instructional delivery method.***

#### **Descriptive Summary:**

El Camino College has sufficient, although limited, human, financial and physical resources to support its educational programs. The human resources to support the college's programs are substantial, with 385 classified staff including police officers, 345 full-time and 549 part-time faculty, 25 educational managers, 44 supervisory and classified managers, and nine confidential employees. Additionally, a large staff of non-contract hourly personnel provide needed services in support of instruction, student support services, and administrative services. During the 1999-2000 academic year, full-time faculty accounted for 68.3% of the college's instruction, and adjunct faculty accounted for 31.7% of the college's instruction. With the addition of 15 new tenure-track faculty members and the replacement of six faculty members who retired or resigned, the instructional needs of the college are well served, though both program growth and change require continuous adjustment and planning.

El Camino College's physical resources are extensive. The 126-acre campus supports 35 educational facilities. The college is the largest single campus district in the California community college system in terms of gross square footage, accounting for 1.2 million square feet. The main campus, in addition, has 756,578 assignable square feet that include classrooms, large lecture halls, laboratories, studios, computer facilities, and other facilities, such as the athletic field, music rooms, and specialized centers and labs.

In addition to traditional course delivery, the college offers its educational programs through a variety of delivery modes (e.g., distance education) and at a variety of locations (e.g., at local high schools, One-Stop centers and other off-campus sites). For instance, during Spring, 2001, the college offered approximately 24 distance education courses in addition to 20 courses at various venues off campus.

Growth in the use of computer technology has been significant at the college over the last ten years. The college added approximately 200 computers to its inventory in 2000. With the computing inventory now at 2,311 systems, the college continues to invest heavily in computing technology and technical support while also replacing computers every three to five years. Over the last few years, the college has increased the quality and quantity of computers available to students in locations such as the library, the Media Technology Center, and the writing and computer labs. In addition, the college issues notebook and desktop personal computers to all full-time academic faculty, and the campus has been networked for Internet access. The distribution of laptop computers, the networking, and an increase in media equipment in the classrooms have permitted faculty to prepare and use instructional aids during class time. In the past few years, staff development funds provided for computer training for faculty, and many faculty members have taken advantage of this training to learn how to use their laptop computers in classroom presentations. The college likewise allocates money for

the support of instructional computing labs located on campus. A staff of technicians maintains and upgrades these laboratories at regular intervals to ensure reasonable currency in the available software and equipment.

In 1996, the college established the El Camino College Technology Committee, the Academic Technology Committee, and the Information Technology Services (ITS) Advisory Committee to evaluate the state and function of instructional technology on the campus and to make recommendations for change and improvement. Through the efforts of these committees, the college developed a Technology Plan to guide its instructional programs and services. The plan emphasizes both student and faculty computer access and the systematic maintenance of high-grade instructional computing facilities.

#### **Self Evaluation:**

Though the college has made an effort to incorporate technological resources on campus, the campus physical resources are presently minimally adequate, particularly with regard to classroom and faculty office space. The divisions work together to allocate existing classroom space for heavily impacted programs, but scheduling enough classes at the most convenient times for students remains a problematic, ongoing challenge.

With respect to human resources, the college annually funds new and replacement faculty positions in an attempt to satisfy the 75:25 ratio mandated by AB 1725. During the 2000-2001 academic year, for example, Partnership for Excellence dollars funded fifteen additional positions. In addition, while classified office support for educational programs is presently adequate, it should be noted that, as programs add computer-assisted instruction labs, and as the student population increases, the need for classified technical support and student support services, including tutors, will increase.

In response to student need, the college presently offers a good balance of its programs in the

evening and an increasing number of classes on Friday and Saturday, with a few courses now being offered on Sunday. The administration has been generally responsive to the need for support services at these times, providing labs, library hours, Special Resource Center services, and program supervision. However, the college does not provide evening and weekend faculty and students with less obvious support, such as clerical help, mailroom/production services, health services, and academic support services that are offered to weekday faculty and students.

Financial resources continue to be minimally adequate in meeting the maintenance of programs, as well as the growth needs of the college. As a result, instructional programs are not always endowed with the latest technology, and students must sometimes work with inadequate or outdated equipment. This is evident in the computing area where obsolescence is a continuing problem. Using block grant and Partnership for Excellence funds, the college has mounted major efforts in recent years to address this ongoing problem, but adequate funding for instructional technology and equipment remains a continual challenge. The college has adopted a technology plan, which recommends an upgrade/replacement schedule for all computers in academic labs every three years on a rotational basis. The President's Cabinet has also asked the Budget Development Committee to support the Cabinet's goal to provide funds for upgrading all academic labs every three years, a goal which was met during the 2000-2001 academic year, but which may not be met in future years due to limited funding. As the number of labs grows each year, there will be a corresponding need for money to finance upgrades and replacements.

***A.5 The institution designs and maintains academic advising programs to meet student needs for information and advice and adequately informs and prepares faculty and other personnel responsible for the advising function.***

### **Descriptive Summary:**

Faculty members do not normally advise students, other than to offer discipline specific advice, but academic advising and counseling is available to all students through the Counseling Division. Nineteen full-time counselors provide academic and career or vocational counseling to the college's students on a scheduled basis. Drop-in advisement is also available throughout the day and evening, Monday through Thursday from 10:00 a.m. to 6:00 p.m., to accommodate students who have questions that do not require transcript review. Also, assigned counselors handle specialized tasks such as vocational, career, or athletics advisement, and specially trained others provide services to students in EOP&S, the International Students Program, the Financial Aid Office, the Special Resource Center, the Transfer Center, Project Success, Puente Project, and the First Year Experience Program.

The Counseling Division assigns to specific disciplines counselors who become very conversant in the requirements of their assigned disciplines. As a result, they are able to provide highly specific academic advisement. They also meet with approximately 10,000 undeclared major students a year to assist them with academic planning.

Academic advising is a component of the matriculation process. The college encourages students to meet with a counselor during their first semester in order to develop an individual educational plan. Students file applications for admission and declare whether they are interested in a certificate or a degree and/or in transferring to a four-year university. They may then go to the Assessment/Testing Center for placement testing in English, English as a Second Language, and mathematics classes. In addition, students may take specialized tests in automotive technology, chemistry, mathematics, and technical mathematics. The college encourages students to participate in orientation activities related to the availability of counseling services. College personnel also explain other campus

services and activities. Finally, students may meet with a counselor who interprets test scores, discusses goals, and recommends programs.

The college permanently assigns adjunct counselors to local high schools within the district and surrounding area to meet with high school students and answer their questions about enrolling at El Camino College. The function of the high school counselors is to increase dual enrollment, to better prepare high school students for college, and to encourage students to enroll at El Camino after they graduate. Currently, the college assigns 13 counselors to 25 participating high schools. Each counselor spends 10 hours per week at two high school campuses.

Finally, the Instructional Services Division offers six different courses covering career planning, educational planning, college and workplace success, athletic educational planning, and human development, many of which are taught by counselors. These courses help students to access their cognitive and affective domains, to explore career opportunities, and to talk to faculty and community members when developing career plans.

#### **Self Evaluation:**

The college provides extensive and appropriate counseling and advising programs and services to meet student needs, and the college's counseling staff is well equipped with information and interviewing skills to assist students in planning their course of study. In addition, a number of special programs and services effectively provide specialized counseling and advisement services to academically and economically challenged students, as well as disabled students, ethnic minorities, athletes, and special populations. These services meet a wide range of student needs. Finally, human development courses allow students to explore personal and career-related issues, which cannot be effectively addressed in a single counseling session.

The effectiveness of the college's advising services has been validated by the recent results of the counseling program review process, where students favorably evaluated academic advising (4.9). Overall, student satisfaction was 76.1%. Students indicated satisfaction with hours of operation (69%), response time (64.7%), staff helpfulness (71.2%), and staff knowledge (76.5%). The students counseled also gave counselors positive evaluations (4.10). In addition, students completing the Noel-Levitz student surveys also evaluated the college's academic advising services, though the results of these surveys were somewhat less favorable. Satisfaction ratings on all items pertaining to advising services ranged from 34%-42% in the very satisfied category and from 17%-21% in the somewhat satisfied category (4.5). When analyzing the results of the Noel-Levitz student surveys, it is important to note that, on all questions pertaining to academic advising, 21%-24% of the respondents indicated they were neutral, perhaps because not all of the college's students avail themselves of counseling services. That said, however, it should likewise be noted that there is a significant performance gap between the value students place on having academic [advisors who are] concerned about [their] success as individual[s], and the satisfaction ratings students accorded this same item. Thus, the college's counseling staff may need to address this discrepancy.

With respect to course offerings, interviews with counselors reveal that some believe Human Development 8 (Orientation to College Educational Planning and Guidance) needs to be better marketed to new students, and that there is a need to offer more human development courses. In addition, although the assignment of counselors to specific disciplines allows them to maintain current knowledge of the trends and changes in their disciplines at the university level, a special concern is how to better serve the undeclared major students, who, according to the Dean of Counseling and some of her staff, are especially susceptible to progress probation, academic probation, and dismissal from the college.

## **B. Degree and Certificate Programs**

***B.1 The institution demonstrates that its degrees and programs, wherever and however offered, support the mission of the institution. Degree and certificate programs have a coherent design and are characterized by appropriate length, breadth, depth, sequencing of courses, synthesis of learning, and use of information and learning resources.***

### **Descriptive Summary:**

El Camino College offers associate degrees in arts and science and a variety of certificate programs that conform to the California Code of Regulations, Title 5: Education (4.11). The college catalog delineates all requirements for associate degrees and certificate programs (4.7). Furthermore, the college carries out its mission to offer quality comprehensive educational opportunities to its diverse communities in several ways. First, a generous selection of general education courses is available to all students (4.6). As an example, a student who wished to take History 1A during the Fall, 2000, semester had a choice of 20 sections, of which four were evening classes, one was an instructional television course, and one was an online course. Second, the college offers a broad variety of courses in specific subject areas so that students may have a choice of courses that can be used for their major. Third, to assist transfer students, the college catalog clearly explains course transferability and indicates which courses are specifically transferable to the California State University and the University of California systems. Finally, to meet the needs of students enrolled in vocational programs, the college offers 65 distinct certificate programs, some of which lead to certificates of competence and some of which lead to certificates of completion. For many of these programs, it is possible for a student to earn either type of certificate. The college also offers 31 vocational programs leading to an associate degree.

The faculty members who propose new courses

or programs or who propose changes to existing courses or programs take their proposals to the division curriculum committees and, when applicable, to advisory committees for examination and suggestions for improvement. The proposals are then submitted to the College Curriculum Committee for approval before being forwarded to the Board of Trustees for final approval. This process ensures that the courses in degree and certificate programs are adequate in number and sequencing, will complement each other, and will provide the necessary depth and breadth of content and subject matter. To determine that the existing programs fulfill the above criteria and continue to meet student needs, there is also ongoing periodic program review by faculty members, and, where appropriate, by external accrediting bodies. Also, the vocational programs have advisory committees, which provide valuable insights concerning changes in workplace conditions.

Furthermore, the college's library staff carefully examine the adequacy of information and learning resources at several levels. All new course proposals must go to the collection development librarian who confirms that library resources are available to support the new courses. Otherwise, library staff take appropriate steps to ensure that there are adequate resources before the course is offered. Additionally, library staff consistently encourage faculty members to request supplemental materials for their classes. And, finally, library staff periodically discard obsolete materials; however, staff invite faculty members in the appropriate subject areas to examine materials targeted for disposal in order to safeguard classics.

### **Self Evaluation:**

The division curriculum committees, the College Curriculum Committee, the external accrediting bodies for select programs, and the advisory committees for vocational programs serve as an excellent means of ensuring that the college meets this standard. The College Curriculum Committee upholds rigorous academic standards, and the vocational program advi-

sory committees work closely with program directors and/or deans to make certain that current workplace standards are incorporated into vocational programs.

Further, by carefully screening and evaluating degree and certificate programs via program reviews, advisory committee reviews, and external accrediting body reviews, the college is able to uphold the integrity of its programs and meet the needs of rapidly changing workplace conditions.

***B.2 The institution identifies its degrees and certificates in ways which are consistent with the program content, degree objectives, and student mastery of knowledge and skills, including, where appropriate, career preparation and competencies.***

**Descriptive Summary:**

The college catalog lists all degree and certificate programs, along with their required courses, the number of units needed, the courses that can be used to fulfill electives, and, where appropriate, the kind of work for which the program prepares the student. The catalog also lists all 76 degree programs by type. Each program features a description, with clearly stated learning outcomes, as well as individual course descriptions. Each course description in the college catalog explains the content of the course and, where appropriate, the expected outcomes and mastery of skills. In addition, the catalog refers associate degree transfer students to counseling guide sheets which have been specifically designed to assist these students in selecting appropriate courses for their majors (4.12).

The 65 certificate programs and 76 associate degree programs offered at El Camino College cover a broad intellectual spectrum, and all of the programs offer approved courses which meet degree requirements, certificate requirements, general education requirements, transfer requirements, or basic skills needs.

**Self Evaluation:**

The college meets this standard in three different ways. First, staff update the catalog annually so that it accurately reflects the addition or revision of courses and programs. Second, divisions are now reviewing and revising program descriptions for accuracy. Third, divisions review all established degree and certificate programs, and the Chancellor's Office approves all new degree and certificate programs. Advisory committees and external accrediting bodies also monitor several of the college's programs. Each of these reviews verifies that courses leading to degrees and certificates are, in fact, consistent with program objectives.

Despite the college's efforts to describe all degree and certificate programs completely and accurately, the catalog does not clearly explain the difference between the A.A. and A.S. degrees. Clarifying the distinction between these two degrees would certainly help students to more effectively plan their course of study. Unfortunately, since criteria for inclusion in either degree category have not been determined, it is impossible to specify the difference between the two degree categories. For this reason, the college created a task force to review the general education requirements for both the A.A. and A.S. degrees so that criteria for course inclusion within the degree categories can be established.

***B.3 The institution identifies and makes public expected learning outcomes for its degree and certificate programs. Students completing programs demonstrate achievement of those stated learning outcomes.***

**Descriptive Summary:**

The Division and College Curriculum Committees carefully examine learning outcomes for all the college's programs. The courses that comprise these programs have their own expected learning outcomes. Course outlines of record list course objectives in behaviorally

measurable terms (4.13). All course outlines are on file in the library and are available to the public.

The college catalog lists all of the degree and certificate programs together with their course requirements. Each listed program includes a program description that specifies required courses and electives, expected student outcomes, and, where appropriate, the benefits of enrolling in the program. For example, prior to listing the major requirements, the program description for anthropology reads as follows:

The anthropology program provides a foundation in the fields of socio-cultural anthropology, biological anthropology, and archaeology, as they relate to the physical and behavioral aspects of the world's populations of the past and the present. Students in this program will be able to discern the basic issues facing anthropologists, apply the methodologies that anthropologists use to approach the problems in the field, and critically evaluate the record of past accomplishments. This major prepares students for career opportunities in museums, educational, archeological and medical institutions, international development consulting organizations, social welfare, and state and national management entities. Competencies will be assessed through examinations and projects.

Since instructors employ a variety of assessment techniques, such as objective examinations, oral reports, research papers and portfolios, successful course completion assures the achievement of the learning outcomes stated in the course outlines of record. Similarly, the fact that a student is able to successfully complete all of the courses necessary to be awarded a degree or certificate indicates that he/she has achieved the learning outcomes stated in the program description, primarily because these outcomes have been derived from individual course descriptions within the program. In addition, after completing certain programs, students must pass state licensing exams, which further indicates that specified learning outcomes have been achieved.

### **Self Evaluation:**

Because the Division and College Curriculum Committees examine and approve the course outlines, these outlines manifest explicit and measurable learning outcomes. Furthermore, the college catalog, the course outlines of record, and individual program brochures effectively publicize learning outcomes. In fact, divisions have recently revised and updated their catalog program descriptions so that learning outcomes are stated consistently. Some divisions also state outcomes in terms of what the student will be qualified to do upon completion of the program.

To evaluate student achievement, instructors in all courses have designated effective methods that are listed in each course outline. However, while achievement in individual courses is continually assessed, there is currently no mechanism in place, other than successful course completion, to assess whether or not students who complete academic programs demonstrate achievement of stated learning outcomes. Demonstrated achievement is more common in some vocational programs where students may be required to pass externally mandated proficiency or state licensing exams after completing their course of study.

***B.4 All degree programs are designed to provide students a significant introduction to the broad areas of knowledge, their theories and methods of inquiry, and focused study in at least one area of inquiry or established interdisciplinary core.***

### **Descriptive Summary:**

El Camino College requires both breadth and depth in its degree programs. For an associate in arts or an associate in science degree, students must complete at least 60 units in degree-applicable college courses. Coursework in an approved transfer major or associate degree program must be included in these 60 units. As part of the required 60 units, students must take

at least 18 units in the major and appropriate general education courses. The required general education courses in natural sciences, social and behavioral sciences, humanities, language/rationality, and contemporary health/physical education ensure that the student will be introduced to a breadth of knowledge (4.7, pp. 32-35). The courses a student takes in his or her major provide an area of focused study.

#### **Self Evaluation:**

Although the degree requirements currently in place are comprehensive, the general education component of the A.A. and A.S. degrees has not been reviewed in over 12 years. Consequently, members of the College Curriculum Committee and the Academic Senate have expressed concerns that the current general education requirements may not adequately meet the needs of the student body. They note that the current requirements lack a cultural diversity and a computer literacy and information technology component. They also note that the current requirements contain a physical education requirement, which may not be feasible. For this reason, the A.A./A.S. Degree Task Force is presently reviewing the general education component for both the A.A. and A.S. degrees.

#### ***B.5 Students completing degree programs demonstrate competence in the use of language and computation.***

##### **Descriptive Summary:**

As stated in the college catalog, students pursuing an associate degree must achieve minimum competency in reading and writing, a requirement they satisfy by completing their associate degree general education coursework. Students must also demonstrate mathematics competency, either by passing the Mathematics Competency Test or by completing one of the mathematics-based courses specified in the catalog. Students may also demonstrate competency via credit by examination or appropriate Advanced Placement (AP) examination scores.

#### **Self Evaluation:**

As noted in the evaluation of substandard B.3, currently the only assessment instrument in place to demonstrate competency is successful course completion. Therefore, students who successfully complete courses such as English 1A (Reading and Composition) and Mathematics 40 (Elementary Algebra) are said to have achieved competence in the use of language and computation, but without a process for assessing the mastery of learning outcomes in English and math beyond successful course completion, it is impossible to say with absolute certainty whether students completing degree programs are, in fact, achieving mastery in these areas. Currently, faculty assess student competence in English and math through numerous assignments, including research papers, oral reports, specific projects, fieldwork (where appropriate), and homework which requires skill demonstration and problem solving. Faculty also assess student competence via objective short answer/multiple choice and/or in-class essay examinations.

The results of the Noel-Levitz student survey indicate that a number of students believe their English and mathematical skills have improved as a result of taking courses here. In fact, 56% of the students surveyed indicated they were satisfied or very satisfied in response to the following statement: As a result of taking English classes here, students are able to write at the college level. Twenty-one percent of the students indicated they were somewhat satisfied when responding to the same item. With respect to mathematics, 50% of the students surveyed reported they were satisfied or very satisfied in response to the following statement: As a result of taking math classes here, students have developed college level math skills. Eighteen percent of the students surveyed indicated they were somewhat satisfied in response to the same item.

The results of the Noel-Levitz faculty and staff survey were not as positive concerning the development of the students English and math

skills. Only 37% of the staff agreed or strongly agreed that students are able to write at the college level, as a result of taking English classes here, and only 38% agreed or strongly agreed that students are developing college level math skills, as a result of taking mathematics courses here. Twenty-three percent of those responding to the statement regarding college level English skills, and 24% of those responding to the statement regarding college level math skills somewhat agreed with the truth of the foregoing statements (4.5). The low ratings accorded these items could be indicative of the frustration that some staff members may be feeling because students are not retaining material from class to class, and/or because not all faculty members are adhering to the same grading standards. Whatever the case, since faculty and staff members may be better able than students to gauge the development of college level English and math skills in students, the results of the faculty and staff surveys in this area clearly warrant further investigation.

***B.6 The institution documents the technical and professional competence of students completing its vocational and occupational programs.***

**Descriptive Summary:**

The official course outlines of record for vocational and occupational courses specify the learning outcomes students will achieve after completing each course. The course outlines also specify the methods of evaluation faculty members will use to document student achievement (4.14). Further, in a number of programs, the college documents student competencies via the successful completion of fieldwork experience and/or the passing of externally-mandated examinations. For example, the college's nursing students are subject to clinical evaluations, and they must also pass the National Council Licensure Exam for Registered Nurses (NCLEX-RN). Similarly, radiologic technology students take state and/or national certification examinations after completing 25 months of

clinical training. Cosmetology students must log 1,600 hours of field experience before taking the California State Board of Barbering and Cosmetology Licensing Exam. Police academy recruits must take and pass a course approved by P.O.S.T. (California Peace Officers Standards and Training). Emergency medical technician (E.M.T.) students must take the Los Angeles County Department of Health Services EMT-1 Exam, and those studying to become paramedics must take an additional test to be certified as an EMT-P. Welding students take the Los Angeles City Structural Welding Certification Exam, and automotive technology students take the Automotive Service Excellence Certification tests. Air conditioning and refrigeration students take the E.P.A. Certification Exam, construction technology students take the California State Licensing Board Contractors Licensure Exam, and electronics students may take the COMPTIA A+ Certification Exam or the FCC General Radio-Telephone Operator's License Exam. Finally, per American Bar Association requirements, the college sends surveys to employers of its paralegal graduates to assess their competence on the job.

**Self Evaluation:**

The college effectively administers the process of documenting student competence in vocational and occupational programs. Because a number of outside agencies (the Board of Registered Nurses, the National League for Nursing Accrediting Commission, the California State Department of Health Services-Radiologic Health Branch, the Joint Review Committee on Education in Radiologic Technology, P.O.S.T., the State Board of Cosmetology, and the Environmental Protection Agency) accredit or certify the college's programs, they promote effective documentation of student achievement (4.15). Moreover, as evidenced by student performance on the licensure or certification exams, the college's vocational and occupational programs produce professionally and technically competent graduates. For example, the first time pass rate on the

NCLEX-RN for the 1999-2000 academic year was 93%. Similarly, 100% of the college's radiologic technology students passed the Department of Health Services state certification exam for the 1999-2000 academic year, while 87% passed the American Registry of Radiologic Technologists national exam. In addition, over 60% of the college's cosmetology students passed the practical and written portions of their state licensing exam during the first and second quarters of 2000, and the vast majority of attorneys who completed the 1999 Paralegal Employer Survey rated the training of the college's paralegal graduates as excellent or very good (4.16).

## C. General Education

*C.1 The institution requires of all degree programs a component of general education that is published in clear and complete terms in its general catalog.*

### Descriptive Summary:

The El Camino College requirement for the associate in arts degree and the associate in science degree (vocational or transfer) includes completion of a minimum of 18 semester units of general education courses. In the college catalog the institution publishes the specific requirements for each degree, along with a menu of relevant courses. The catalog also specifies the total number of units of general education courses required, as well as the number of units required from courses within each sub-area of general education (i.e., natural sciences, social and behavioral sciences, humanities, language and rationality, and contemporary health and physical education). Further, the catalog lists the specific courses that students can take to meet these requirements.

Additionally, the college catalog lists the California State University general education requirements and the Intersegmental General Education Transfer Curriculum (IGETC) require-

ments for those students intending to transfer to a CSU or UC campus (4.7, pp. 37-39).

### Self Evaluation:

In its catalog, the college publishes all general education requirements for both transfer and non-transfer degrees. However, the current general education component outlined in the catalog may not meet the needs of students who are preparing to enter a culturally diverse, technologically sophisticated workplace. Thus, the A.A./A.S. Degree Task Force is currently meeting to assess whether or not to revise the college's general education component.

*C.2 The general education component is based on a philosophy and rationale that are clearly stated. Criteria are provided by which the appropriateness of each course in the general education component is determined.*

### Descriptive Summary:

Currently, the college's general education component is based on Board Policy 6121: the El Camino College Philosophy of Education and Objectives (4.17). To date, criteria for inclusion in the college's general education patterns have been based on Title 5, Section 55806 (Minimum Requirements for the Associate Degree) and upon the CSU general education and CSU/UC IGETC patterns. Courses originate at the division level, and the dean then forwards them to the College Curriculum Committee where they are screened for college-level rigor and for the appropriateness of their inclusion in the college's general education patterns.

### Self Evaluation:

Board Policy 6121, approved on May 27, 1963, is clearly outdated and is not, in fact, a philosophy of general education; it is merely a philosophy of education. For this reason, the College Curriculum Committee opted to create a Philosophy of General Education statement by revising Board Policy 6121 at its Strategic

Planning Day session on September 8, 2000, a revision the committee formally approved at its next meeting on September 12, 2000.

Thereafter, the CCC forwarded the revised document to the Academic Senate's Educational Policies Committee (EPC), which wrote its own Philosophy of General Education statement based on Title 5, Section 55805. The EPC sent this statement to the CCC, and the CCC combined its philosophy statement with the EPC's philosophy statement. The CCC then forwarded the combined statement to the Academic Senate, where it was formally approved, and it is now undergoing Board approval.

Also, as noted in the evaluation of substandard B.4, the college's general education patterns have not been reviewed in over 12 years; these patterns may not, therefore, meet the needs of current students. Therefore, the college has created a task force to (1) define the parameters of the A.A. and A.S. degrees, (2) establish the criteria for placement of a given degree within the A.A. and A.S. patterns, (3) establish criteria for course inclusion in the general education patterns, (4) consider inclusion of computer literacy, technology, cultural diversity, and service learning within the general education patterns, (5) determine if current general education patterns meet the needs of students, and (6) determine if the current physical education requirement is feasible. This task force is expected to complete its work in Spring, 2002.

***C.3 The general education program introduces the content and methodology of the major areas of knowledge: the humanities and fine arts, the natural sciences, and the social sciences. The general education program provides the opportunity for students to develop the intellectual skills, information technology facility, affective and creative capabilities, social attitudes, and an appreciation for cultural diversity that will make them effective learners and citizens.***

### **Descriptive Summary:**

El Camino College's general education requirements provide students with a range of intellectual skills. Students pursuing any associate in arts or associate in science degree must complete courses in the areas of natural sciences, behavioral and social sciences, humanities, and language and rationality. These students must also demonstrate mathematics competency and complete courses in health and physical education for the A.A. degree or in health and/or physical education for the A.S. degree. Students may select from an extensive list of general education courses in each area (e.g., anatomy, anthropology, oceanography, economics, political science, psychology, art, music, dance, English, and foreign languages). Many courses in the areas of American studies, women's studies, history, political science, anthropology, and sociology specifically address cultural diversity. Courses in computer information systems and computer science specifically address the development of information technology facility, and courses from a considerable number of areas now include applications of technology, such as the use of the World Wide Web for research, word processing for the preparation of reports or essays, and correspondence with faculty via e-mail. Additionally, courses in music, dance, and other arts afford students the opportunity to develop their creative abilities. Finally, instructors in all general education courses challenge students to further develop their intellectual skills by incorporating critical thinking assignments into the curriculum.

Students who intend to transfer will satisfy their general education requirements via IGETC, the UC or CSU campus-specific breadth pattern, or the CSU lower division general education certification pattern, all of which introduce students to the major areas of knowledge, in addition to helping them develop relevant abilities, skills, and attitudes.

### **Self Evaluation:**

The current general education requirements are

both diverse and comprehensive. However, the general education pattern does not specifically require that students complete a course with an information technology or cultural diversity component. For this reason, as noted in the appraisal of substandards B.2, B.4, and C.2, the college established a task force to discuss the inclusion of a required computer literacy, technology, and cultural diversity component within the college's general education pattern.

***C.4 Students completing the institution's general education program demonstrate competence in oral and written communication, scientific and quantitative reasoning, and critical analysis/logical thinking.***

**Descriptive Summary:**

Students enrolled in general education courses must master the learning outcomes specified in the course outlines and demonstrate competence in the indicated areas. Thus, students can demonstrate competence through successful course completion, via submission of appropriate AP examination scores or through credit by examination. Students must take and pass an English composition course to demonstrate competence in written communication, a natural sciences course to demonstrate competence in scientific reasoning, and a course in communication and analytical thinking to demonstrate competence in critical analysis/logical thinking. All credit courses, including those in the general education pattern, must meet Title 5-mandated critical thinking requirements. Students demonstrate competence in quantitative reasoning by successfully passing the Mathematics Competency Test or by completing one of the mathematics-based courses specified in the college catalog. Presently, students evidence competence in oral communication from successfully completing all specified general education courses.

**Self Evaluation:**

Students completing the general education program at El Camino College are said to meet this standard. However, as noted in the evaluation of substandards B.3 and B.5, currently, there is no assessment instrument in place, aside from successful course completion, to validate this statement. With respect to course completion, every semester, the Office of Institutional Research prepares a report entitled Grade Distribution and Success and Retention Rates. According to this report for Fall, 2000, in every division except for Mathematical Sciences, 58%-70% of the college's students did, in fact, successfully complete their courses (4.18). To address the performance gap in mathematics, the Mathematical Sciences Division recently revised the math placement test cut scores to more accurately place students in appropriate courses. In addition to the college's own course completion data, the successful completion of upper division university courses by the college's former students would seem to indicate that demonstrated competence is achieved after students complete their general education requirements. For example, in 1999, research from the UCLA Office of Academic Planning and Budget indicated that El Camino College students who transfer to UCLA successfully complete their upper division coursework and graduate in a timely manner. In fact, ECC students transferring to UCLA from Fall, 1987, to Fall, 1998, graduated in an average of 7.42 quarters with a G.P.A. of 3.10. Their performance compares favorably with the other 105 California community college transfer students, who completed their UCLA graduation requirements in 7.65 quarters with a G.P.A. of 3.10 (4.19).

## D. Curriculum and Instruction

***D.1 The institution has clearly defined processes for establishing and evaluating all of its educational programs. These processes recognize the central role of faculty in developing, implementing, and evaluating the educational programs. Program evaluations are integrated into overall institutional evaluation and planning and are conducted on a regular basis.***

### **Descriptive Summary:**

The development of curriculum, which includes courses, degree requirements, certificate requirements, and articulation agreements, originates with faculty and requires departmental approval, as well as review and endorsement by a division curriculum committee. Divisions then forward proposals to the College Curriculum Committee, a standing committee of the Academic Senate, for review and evaluation. The CCC examines the proposals for compliance with Title 5 and district requirements and subsequently recommends to the Board of Trustees all additions to and revisions of the college's curriculum. A faculty representative chairs the CCC, which is composed of the following voting representatives: one faculty member from each academic division, one counselor, the Vice President of Academic Affairs, and one academic dean. The committee's ex officio members include the Articulation Officer, an Associated Students Organization representative, the Chair Elect, the Curriculum Advisor, the Dean of Counseling, the Director of Workforce Education, the immediate past chair, and a Student Services Advisor-Evaluations Unit.

The CCC assigns divisions a date to submit curriculum proposals at least once during the academic year. Divisions also have the opportunity to submit proposals throughout the year via the Extenuating Circumstances and/or Special Topics Procedures. The college encourages a faculty discipline representative to attend the meeting of the CCC to respond to any questions

or concerns. It also requires division deans to attend CCC meetings to defend curriculum from their division.

In addition to the ongoing curriculum review process, the Program Review Coordinator schedules academic programs for full evaluation once every six years. Program review is the responsibility of the faculty and the Office of Academic Affairs. The college assesses programs for their effectiveness in meeting the needs of students and the goals of the institution. Program review is a two-year process. During the first year, faculty in a department conduct a self study, which addresses six major areas: (1) overview and responses to previous recommendations, (2) program environment, (3) program curriculum, (4) program resources, (5) program effectiveness and efficiency, and (6) recommendations for the coming three years. A department's full-time faculty ordinarily determine the composition of the self study team. If full-time faculty are unable to determine members of the self study team, or if a department is staffed entirely with adjunct faculty, the dean of the division is responsible for forming the team. The second year of the program review process is devoted to a validation of the self study. The College Validation Committee (comprised of three Vice President of Academic Affairs appointees and six Academic Senate President appointees) divides itself into validation subcommittees to review the self studies. After the validation subcommittees have reported their findings back to the College Validation Committee, the committee writes an executive summary report containing recommendations for the future of the program. Upon completion of the Validation Committee's report, the committee chair meets with the Vice President of Academic Affairs, the Academic Senate President, the chair of the self study team, and the division dean for the program to synthesize the work of the self study and validation teams and to arrive at the recommendations to be forwarded to the Board of Trustees for action and implementation (4.2).

El Camino College carried out its first program review cycle during the 1992-1993 academic year. Several years later, during the 1997-1998 academic year, a committee composed of faculty and administrators met to review the entire process. The changes this committee recommended (all of which were designed to make the program review process more user-friendly, to promote consistency in the self study writing and validation process, and to help programs accredited by outside agencies avoid duplicating their efforts when conducting program reviews) were formally approved by the Academic Senate on May 26, 1998.

### **Self Evaluation:**

Since the implementation of the Curriculum Review Task Force's (CRFT) recommendations, the CCC has become a much more efficient and focused body (4.20). To demonstrate, during the past two years, the committee has been able to review over 300 course proposals (4.21). Despite the implementation of the CRTF's recommendations, however, the CCC is still facing two critical challenges. First, the committee needs to develop a course review plan so that the college will be in compliance with Title 5 regulations mandating regular course review. Second, the committee continues to struggle with a burgeoning workload which is the result of improper screening of course proposals at the division level. If division curriculum committees more effectively prepared and screened their course proposals, the committee would be able to address broader curricular issues, such as the design and implementation of course descriptions for the college's Schedule of Classes.

As is evident from a number of informal survey responses, the college's program review process does not function nearly as efficiently as its curriculum review process (4.22). Ideally, program review should afford departments an opportunity to closely examine their programs, but, in reality, the process itself is so riddled with problems that few of the completed program reviews

have been truly beneficial to their departments and to the college as a whole. These reviews have primarily been used to justify faculty hires or equipment needs.

The program review process has many difficulties. First, the process itself is tedious, time-consuming, and confusing, in part because it is based upon the accreditation self study process, and those who have not served on accreditation teams or standards committees do not understand what it is they are being asked to do, nor do they understand the value of the self study process. Second, despite the efforts of the Office of Institutional Research, time constraints and the need to prioritize research requests have made it difficult for departments to obtain and interpret reliable statistical data. It has also been difficult for departments to design and administer meaningful surveys. Third, since the college offers scant incentives for faculty participation, except for the awarding of flex credit, soliciting faculty participation in the process has been very difficult. During the first year of program review, self study chairs received a \$1,000 stipend, but they currently receive 15 hours of flex credit. Faculty who participate in the process may also receive up to 15 hours of flex credit. Fourth, the review process itself lacks a meaningful mechanism to require that programs conduct self studies every six years, that they produce well-written, sufficiently detailed self studies, and that they take active steps to address any deficiencies in their programs. Evidently, having the Budget Development Committee allocate funds to programs for planning based on needs assessment and/or program review (4.2, p. 3) has not proven to be a sufficient incentive for conducting these reviews. Fifth, because the results of program reviews are not currently linked to the recently instituted unit action plans or to the Educational Master Plan, those who participate in program reviews have questioned the process since they have not always seen their final recommendations being implemented, perhaps because their recommendations are too extensive. Finally, due to conflicting time commitments, it has been difficult to schedule the writ-

ing of executive summaries, and it has been equally difficult to follow up with departments who need to conduct program reviews.

As a result of the aforementioned issues, of the college's 72 identified programs, there are currently 15 programs (21%) which have not completed their first review. During the 1999-2000 academic year, only one program actually completed its review and entered the validation phase, and only five programs have begun the second phase of the six-year process.

To address some of these concerns, the Program Review Coordinator has been working with the Director of Institutional Research and with the President of the Academic Senate to identify specific information which will be made available to all programs undergoing review to help the process move more smoothly. Also, the Office of Institutional Research is currently working with the Program Review Coordinator to explore the possibility of modifying the program review process so that it can be linked to the unit action planning process.

***D.2 The institution ensures the quality of instruction, academic rigor, and educational effectiveness of all of its courses and programs regardless of service location or instructional delivery method.***

**Descriptive Summary:**

The high quality of instruction begins with effective hiring and evaluation procedures, both of which are delineated in the El Camino College Federation of Teachers contract with the district and in district policy for hiring and evaluation. The college evaluates all instructors in accordance with specific evaluation procedures and timelines, regardless of where or how a course is taught. Course and program quality and rigor are also an integral part of the curriculum and program review processes. All courses adhere to the same standards of quality outlined in *The Curriculum Handbook for El Camino College* (4.23) and in *The Curriculum*

*Standards Handbook for California Community Colleges* (4.24). Moreover, the CCC carefully reviews all courses for behaviorally measurable outcomes and for compliance with Title 5 critical thinking regulations. The program review process likewise assesses educational effectiveness through the gathering and analysis of both quantitative and qualitative data, which is then used to determine how effectively a given program is achieving its stated goals and objectives.

Academic standards are no different for courses taught through non-traditional methods and at non-traditional sites. Such courses include those offered through distance education, contract education, and international education, as well as those offered at the One-Stop centers. These courses are also included in the college's program review process.

The Instructional Services Division administers distance education, and the Distance Education Advisory Committee and the College Curriculum Committee monitor the program. Many distance education courses are versions of regular academic courses offered on campus and must, therefore, adhere to the same state and district standards of quality.

During the 2001-2002 academic year, there will be approximately 15 contract education classes that may be taken by students for credit, primarily in the areas of business and industry. Credit contract education classes are held to the same academic standards and requirements as on-campus courses.

The Study Abroad Program provides students the opportunity to earn course credit while living abroad. International courses meet the same academic standards as on-campus courses, and most of them satisfy general education requirements and are transferable to the CSU and UC systems.

One-Stop center courses provide students with the opportunity to take classes in a local district community when attending courses on campus

is inconvenient or prohibitive. One-Stop center courses meet the same academic standards as on-campus courses.

### **Self Evaluation:**

The college meets this standard. First, it has established procedures to ensure that there is consistency in the hiring of qualified faculty, regardless of where or how a course is offered. For example, the Human Resources Department advertises all faculty positions the same way, and divisions screen all candidates in a comparable manner. Human Resources posts faculty job announcements for a prescribed period of time, and divisions convene diverse screening committees to select applicants based on their ability to meet or exceed the minimum qualifications for the position. Second, the faculty evaluation procedures currently in place likewise ensure the quality of instruction offered in all classes. Instructors must complete extensive self evaluations wherein they identify their strengths and weaknesses and set specific goals for the continued improvement of instruction. They are likewise evaluated by their students, by a peer, and, if applicable, by the division dean or director. Because these evaluations are based on criteria ranging from subject knowledge to pedagogical effectiveness, the college ensures the quality of probationary and tenured faculty. There is no difference in the faculty evaluation process for instructors teaching contract or international education courses, although international education students are asked to evaluate the Study Abroad Program in addition to the actual course(s) they take (4.25). Finally, the college's course outlines, which include behaviorally measurable outcomes, methods of evaluation, and critical thinking assignments, further serve to ensure academic rigor since the contract requires that all instructors adhere to the course outlines when teaching a course. In fact, as part of the aforementioned faculty evaluation process, instructors submit syllabi and assignments, which their evaluators carefully review for compliance with the course outlines.

The results of the Noel-Levitz student surveys serve to substantiate the foregoing assertions. In fact, according to the Office of Institutional Research, the quality of instruction students receive in their classes is ranked fifth on a list of ten items with which survey respondents expressed the most satisfaction. Specifically, of the students surveyed, 56% reported they were satisfied or very satisfied in response to the statement, The quality of instruction I receive in most of my classes is excellent while 21% indicated they were somewhat satisfied in response to this same item. In addition, 54% of the survey respondents indicated they were satisfied or very satisfied in response to the statement, Nearly all of the faculty are knowledgeable in their fields while 19% indicated they were somewhat satisfied with this same item (4.5).

***D.3 The evaluation of student learning and the award of credit are based upon clearly stated and published criteria. Credit awarded is consistent with student learning and is based upon generally accepted norms and equivalencies.***

### **Descriptive Summary:**

The faculty list procedures for student assessment, in both traditional and electronically delivered instructional formats, on the course outlines of record, which are available in the Curriculum Office, the library, and the instructional division offices. In addition, instructors provide students with syllabi that specify the grading standards for their courses. Finally, the college catalog and the class schedule contain a description of the grades and grade points students may earn in their classes.

Credits earned for each course are delineated in the course outlines of record, and they are published in the catalog and in the class schedule. In accordance with the course outlines of record, faculty evaluate student achievement in each class by a grade based upon written performances and skill demonstration, including problem solving.

Once the faculty assign a final grade, students earn credit for the course. Credit is based upon the following standard: 18 hours of lecture or 54 hours of laboratory is equivalent to one unit. Students may also receive credit by taking AP exams and/or credit by examinations. The college catalog clearly states the conditions under which a student may be awarded credit through these processes.

**Self Evaluation:**

The college meets this standard through the consistent application of established policies concerning the evaluation of student learning and the awarding of credit. However, it should be noted that although there is a process in place to assess the appropriateness of the student outcomes delineated on the college's course outlines of record, the lack of a course review cycle prohibits the assurance that all course outlines currently include effective evaluation procedures.

***D.4 The institution has clearly stated transfer of credit policies. In accepting transfer credits to fulfill degree requirements, the institution certifies that the credits accepted, including those for general education, achieve educational objectives comparable to its own courses. Where patterns of transfer between institutions are established, efforts are undertaken to formulate articulation agreements.***

**Descriptive Summary:**

The college's catalog clearly indicates the acceptance procedure for credits earned for college-level courses taken at other colleges and/or through the United States Armed Forces (4.7, p.11). Upon receipt of a student's official transcript, the college's Evaluation Unit makes a decision concerning the transfer of credit. If the college is to certify that courses meet a degree or certificate requirement, the Evaluation Unit determines course equivalency in consultation with the college's Counseling Division. No distinction is made in this process for alternative

instructional delivery methods. Credit for military service may be granted for the contemporary health component of the associate degree requirements. In addition, veterans may receive credit for up to six elective units, depending on length of service. Finally, incoming high school students may receive up to 15 units for appropriate AP examination scores.

To facilitate the transfer of credits, the college has entered into a number of articulation agreements with public and private institutions of higher learning. El Camino College likewise participates in the California Articulation Numbering System (CAN) and the Articulation System Stimulating Interinstitutional Student Transfer (ASSIST). The college has also developed formal teacher education preparation articulation agreements with local CSUs.

**Self Evaluation:**

Although the catalog states the basis upon which credits are accepted, it does not actually state the college's policies for accepting transfer of credits. To assist students who are attempting to receive credit for coursework completed at other institutions, the college should clearly state transfer of credit policies in the catalog. Also, most faculty members do not understand the articulation agreements that the college has established with other institutions of higher learning. If faculty members understood the nature of the college's articulation agreements, they could more effectively create courses which are designed to meet the needs of the student body.

***D.5 The institution utilizes a range of delivery systems and modes of instruction compatible with the objectives of the curriculum and appropriate to the needs of its students.***

**Descriptive Summary:**

El Camino College affords students the opportunity to take courses through a variety of delivery systems. The college offers a wide range of traditional day/evening classes, weekend class-

es, study abroad classes, distance education classes, independent study classes, Cooperative Career Education classes, and off-site classes at local businesses, high schools, and One-Stop centers as well as at the Federal Correction Institution at Terminal Island where, it should be noted, the student retention rate is nearly one hundred percent. Moreover, all classes are well supported by services for students with disabilities, and some classes incorporate online and computer-assisted instruction as well. The college also offers a number of community education classes in response to the public's interests (4.26). Finally, the Workplace Learning Resource Center offers customized training courses, which are designed to meet the needs of business and industry, and the Community Advancement Division offers specialized courses of study for CalWORKs students.

To accomplish the objectives of each course and to meet the needs of students, faculty employ a variety of instructional modes. In accordance with the college's course outlines, faculty use traditional lecture/lab instructional formats, as well as collaborative learning techniques, supervised tutoring, multimedia presentations, field trips, and presentations by experts in the field. In addition, the college has recently established learning communities on campus. Under the Director of Humanities, courses are strategically linked so that students can benefit from interdisciplinary instruction.

#### **Self Evaluation:**

The college has made a concerted effort to provide students with a broad range of instructional delivery methods, as supported by the results of the Noel-Levitz student and staff surveys where 49% of the students reported they were satisfied or very satisfied in response to the statement, The college offers a sufficient variety of instructional delivery methods, while 19% indicated they were somewhat satisfied, and 24% indicated they were neutral. In response to the same item, 66% of the staff agreed or

strongly agreed that the college offers a sufficient variety of instructional delivery methods, while 19% somewhat agreed (4.5).

The college's most recent efforts to explore innovative instructional delivery methods through the development of learning communities is commendable, and surveys completed by the students enrolled in linked courses indicate that the students support the concept of learning communities (4.27). However, these courses have been underenrolled, in part because they need to be more aggressively marketed so that more students will become aware of the advantages of enrolling in linked courses.

Finally, while the student body has certainly benefited from the variety of instructional delivery methods available on campus, the needs of one group in particular, namely, the college's burgeoning developmental population, may require more careful consideration. According to data compiled by the Office of Institutional Research, between February and September 2000, only 9.4% of the 5,320 students in the dataset tested into transfer-level mathematics courses, and only 22.6% of the 4,830 students in the dataset tested into transfer-level English courses (4.28). While it is true that learning communities may assist the students who do not test into transfer-level courses, not all of the college's developmental students will be able to enroll in linked courses. For this reason, alternative instructional delivery methods, which are designed to meet the unique needs of developmental learners, should be incorporated into the college's curriculum as well.

**D.6** *The institution provides evidence that all courses and programs, both credit and non-credit, whether conducted on or off-campus by traditional or non-traditional delivery systems, are designed, approved, administered, and periodically evaluated under established institutional procedures. This provision applies to continuing and community education, contract and other special programs conducted in the name of the institution.*

**Descriptive Summary:**

The process for designing, approving, and periodically evaluating curriculum varies slightly, depending upon the nature of the course or program. The College Curriculum Committee evaluates credit and non-credit courses for compliance with local and state regulations before recommending approval to the Board of Trustees. The college subjects programs to an identical evaluation and approval process, and they also undergo a formalized program review process. Once these courses and programs are fully approved, they are administered by the academic deans at the division level and, at the college level, by the Vice President of Academic Affairs. *The Curriculum Handbook for El Camino College* and the college's official course outlines of record reflect the process. Courses offered through community education have an internal design and review process. The college subsequently forwards community education courses to the Board of Trustees for approval. Individual program directors and/or the Dean of Community Advancement then monitor these courses and programs.

**Self Evaluation:**

Because the Chancellor's Office consistently approves the college's courses, the process for designing, approving, and evaluating credit and non-credit courses works effectively. Except for concerns regarding program review, the process for designing and approving programs also works effectively. For quality assurance, the college holds all of these courses and programs

to the same rigorous standards, regardless of where or how they will be offered.

With regard to community education, contract education and the college's special programs, the main concern seems to be a lack of communication between these constituencies, academic divisions, and the CCC. While the CCC is not responsible for course /program approval, the Community Education personnel should periodically inform the committee of curriculum development that falls outside its purview. Because there is currently no mechanism in place to foster this communication, overlapping of programs and perhaps courses has occurred. As a first step toward addressing this problem, the vice presidents of Academic Affairs and Student and Community Advancement have formed a committee comprised of Community Education and Academic Affairs representatives to ensure that the Community Education Program is not in conflict with the academic divisions.

**D.7** *Institutions offering curricula through electronic delivery systems operate in conformity with applicable Commission policies and statements on Principles of Good Practice in Distance Education.*

**Descriptive Summary:**

The college offers approximately 42 online courses, none of which is part of an established electronically delivered degree or certificate program. However, almost all of the college's online courses satisfy a specific degree or certificate program requirement. The process for reviewing online courses ensures that these courses adhere to all Title 5 regulations and to the Commission's Principles of Good Practice in Distance Education. Specifically, the Distance Education Advisory Committee examines each distance education course proposal for adherence to local and state requirements. Thereafter, the CCC reviews every distance education course individually. For courses that are only offered through distance education, the

committee reviews outlines to verify that both the rigor of the course and the behaviorally measurable outcomes are appropriate for a college-level course. For a distance education version of an existing course, the committee reviews an addendum to monitor the inclusion of regular effective contact between instructors and students, methods of evaluation, and critical thinking assignments (4.29).

Additionally, when selecting instructors for online courses, the college adheres to the same hiring standards as those used for instructors teaching traditional classes. The Distance Education Advisory Committee requires online instructors to attend training sessions for online instruction provided by the Staff Development Office. These training sessions are designed to ensure that instructors consistently employ effective online teaching methodologies.

**Self Evaluation:**

Although the provisions of this substandard primarily apply to programs offered via distance education, as per the annual distance education report to the Chancellor's Office (4.30), the college's distance education courses closely adhere to applicable Commission policies and statements concerning electronically delivered curricula. In addition, the curriculum review process, which all distance education courses must undergo, ensures that these courses are held to the same standards of quality as their traditional counterparts.

The training distance education faculty receive is in place to promote instructional quality. The Distance Education Office, together with the distance education trainer, developed a list of competencies instructors must achieve before they are certified to teach online, and each instructor evaluates the quality of the training received. However, currently there is no mechanism in place to ensure consistency in the training, nor is there a mechanism in place to ensure that faculty periodically participate in training updates.

Finally, because the demand for distance education courses is growing nationwide, and there are a number of other colleges and universities which offer programs through distance education, the college needs to explore whether or not it is feasible to offer electronically delivered degree programs. Offering electronically delivered degree programs might also help the college better serve the growing number of full-time working students who find attending classes on campus inconvenient or prohibitive. With respect to creating an electronically delivered degree program, although the Distance Education Advisory Committee monitors the development of courses and the training of faculty, the committee's current structure is not conducive to the creation of a degree program, something which will require broader participation campuswide.

***D.8 Institutions offering curricula in foreign locations to students other than U.S. nationals operate in conformity with applicable Commission policies and guidelines.***

**Descriptive Summary:**

At the present time, El Camino College does not offer curricula in foreign locations to students other than U.S. nationals.

**Self Evaluation:**

Because offering curricula in foreign locations to students other than U.S. nationals is not cost effective, the college does not believe this practice is an institutional priority.

**Planning Agenda:**

Æ Market aggressively the college's special programs and services. (4A.1)

Æ Devise a plan providing evening and weekend students with appropriate academic and student support services. (4A.4)

Æ Develop a stable budget for meeting the college's rapidly changing academic technology needs. (4A.4)

Æ Develop a plan that addresses the needs of the college's undeclared majors. (4A.5)

Æ Design a process for assessing the demonstrated achievement of learning outcomes other than course completion. (4B.3)

Æ Review current grading standards and develop minimum competencies in English and mathematics courses. (4B.5)

Æ Redesign the instructional program review process to eliminate the current deficiencies and ensure it is linked to the planning process. (4D.1)

Æ Develop and publish a well-defined policy on the transfer of credit for coursework completed at other institutions. (4D.4)

Æ Provide ongoing workshops to educate the faculty in the articulation process. (4D.4)

Æ Expand and market the college's range of delivery systems and modes of instruction, particularly those for developmental learners. (4D.5)

Æ Develop a faculty training program for online instruction that provides consistency and periodic updates. (4D.7)

Æ Explore the feasibility of offering electronically delivered degree programs. (4D.7)

## References:

- 4.1 El Camino College Technology Plan
- 4.2 A Guide for Academic Program Review (1999-2000)
- 4.3 Five Mile Radius Demographics and Income Forecast
- 4.4 Schedule of Classes (Summer 2001)
- 4.5 Noel-Levitz Student Satisfaction and Institutional Priorities Surveys
- 4.6 Schedule of Classes (Fall 2000 and Spring 2001)
- 4.7 El Camino College Catalog (2000-1)
- 4.8 El Camino College Degree, Certificate and Program Completion Comparison from Catalog 1998-2001
- 4.9 Counseling Division Program Review Survey Results
- 4.10 Counseling Evaluation Card
- 4.11 California Code of Regulations (55806)
- 4.12 Counseling Guide Sheets
- 4.13 Sample Course Outline of Record
- 4.14 Sample Course Outline of Record (Vocational Education)
- 4.15 Sample External Accrediting Documents (Nursing Program)
- 4.16 Licensing/Certification Exam Results
- 4.17 Board Policy 6121
- 4.18 Grade Distribution and Success and Retention Rates (Fall 2000)
- 4.19 Transfers At UCLA (Fall 1987 — Fall 1998)
- 4.20 Curriculum Review Task Force Report
- 4.21 Summary of 1998-9 Curriculum Review
- 4.22 Informal Program Review Process Survey Results
- 4.23 *Curriculum Handbook for El Camino College*
- 4.24 *Curriculum Standards Handbook for California Community Colleges*
- 4.25 Faculty Evaluation Materials
- 4.26 Community Education Schedule of Classes (Spring 2001)
- 4.27 Learning Community Alliance Student Poll
- 4.28 Student Performance on Placement Tests, Fall 2000
- 4.29 Distance Education Addendum to the Course Outline of Record
- 4.30 Distance Education Report to the Chancellor s Office