



# El Camino College

**College Council Minutes**  
**Monday, November 5, 2018**  
**1:30 – 2:30 p.m. Library 202**

## **Attendance**

Dena Maloney, Kristie Daniel-DiGregorio, Chris Jeffries, Debbie Turano, Rose Mahowald, David McPatchell, Ann O'Brien, Jean Shankweiler, Brian Fahnestock, Ross Miyashiro, Edith Gutierrez, Jane Miyashiro, Norman Xavier/Acting Student representative

## **Absent**

Jesse Mills, Erika Solorzano

## **Agenda:**

### 1. Welcome/Approval of Minutes

There are new College Council members. Everyone introduced themselves. Edith Gutierrez is the new Management representative; the former representative was Irene Graff. Norman Xavier is the acting Student representative filling in for Joseph Mardesich.

Upon review, clarification and corrections, the October 15, 2018 meeting minutes are approved.

### 2. Board Policy Day and Writing Guide

It was suggested that we develop guidelines on how to write Board Policies and Administrative Procedures. Dr. Maloney provided an overview of the handout provided - including the difference between Board Policy and Administrative Procedures, use of correct terminology, use of the League templates as the starting point for the policies and procedures and the appropriate style guide. A sample document is illustrated. These guidelines will make our efficient Policy Review days even more productive. After feedback from College Council members, these guidelines are adopted.

The next Policy Review day is Friday, November 9 at 8:00am. There were a number of ITS related procedures that were submitted for review last time that we did not get through. They will be brought back as well as AP 3435 - Discrimination & Harassment Complaints & Investigation. Jaynie Ishikawa is providing revisions and will bring it back. We will have about ten policies and procedures that will be submitted for review.

### 3. Governance Evaluation Project

One of our goals this year is *Lead the ECC Governance Evaluation Project and develop recommendations to improve governance processes at ECC*. It has been three years since we evaluated our governance processes. Are they effective and do they support the decision making process at El Camino College? Dr. Maloney provided a handout and presented an overview of the Collegial Consultation Evaluation Project Proposal and background on the 2015 Consultation Survey. Dr. Maloney suggests we use this study as a starting point for conducting the survey again.

ASO was overlooked as a stakeholder in Collegial Consultation in 2015. It is recommended to include the ASO leadership team in the next survey to allow them to provide their input.

The process should start by bringing in the previous survey and see if there are additional questions that are important that we would like to include. Prior to this time, we should be speaking to our constituents to gather input about additional questions. Institutional Research and Planning will develop a timeline when this survey can be done. The hope is to have the survey completed and evaluated in the spring and make any recommendations for any changes by the conclusion of spring. This timeline aligns very well with our Accreditation cycle. College Council is in agreement with this plan.

### 4. Timeline/Refinement of the QFE topic selection

The QFE is incorporated in the Accreditation Timeline (Handout provided). In 2014 when we went through the accreditation process, there was a narrative and evidence on whether we met the standard or not. There was also a section for actionable improvement items. In 2008 there were about 52 items. Each item had to be addressed in the next report. In 2014 we addressed all 52 and cut back to 30 items. Since the 2014 report ACCJC underwent a huge reorganization. They have eliminated the actionable improvement items. Now we are required to create a Quality Focus Essay. This is a topic that appears repeatedly as we write the narrative and look at the evidence. The team has started collecting the evidence and has started to write the narrative. We are beginning to identify the common threads and where we want to look for improvement in the upcoming accreditation cycle.

Dr. Maloney suggested a timeline be developed in our accreditation process for the selection in writing this Quality Focus Essay. One of College Council's goals addresses this. *Consult collegially to discuss and recommend the topics for the Quality Focused Essay by February 1, 2019*. As this goal was thought through it was determined that the topics for the QFE really come out of the writing from the accreditation team as they look at evidence. College Council is not privy to all that analysis and thought process since members are not part of the writing team. College Council taking on that role does not make a lot of sense. However, College Council will play a role to consult collegially and to talk about them here in a broader audience. We will also talk about them in campus forums. Our goal needs to be tweaked. It currently puts us in the driver seat and that does not make a lot of sense.

Dr. Shankweiler went over the timeline with regards to the QFE topic

1. Sept 2018- Jan 2019 - research QFE topic areas
2. Jan 30, 2019 - identify QFE topic area
3. Feb 8 - Mar 4 - bring QFE topic areas to College Council for discussion and recommendation
4. Feb/Mar - the QFE topics will simultaneously be discussed with Academic Senate, PBC and other consultation groups,
5. May - the QFE topic should be selected and the draft writing of the essay will commence.

The QFE is new for most. Compton went through the QFE process. Refinement of the process may still take place from ACCJC. We have a dedicated Vice President from ACCJC and she will be visiting the campus.

Is the timeline acceptable to College Council with the understanding the dates are tentative and in progress? College Council is generally in agreement with the timeline and having Dr. Shankweiler's Accreditation team take the lead in determining the QFE topic rather than College Council.

Sidenote: There is a new writing guide for Accreditation. The writings should be no more than 120 pages. The writing has to be very concise and direct.

#### 5. Horticulture Discontinuance

We have spoken about this at the last couple of meetings. We did a little wordsmithing and it has been brought back to College Council. Kristie Daniel DiGregorio provided an overview of the changes that were made. The emphasis was reorganized to highlight the declining enrollment, lack of space to upgrade facilities followed by the mention of the difficulty of recruiting faculty. Changes were also made to the teach out plan. Students will be able to start and finish a certification within the three year teach out plan. The process of communicating the discontinuance was laid out in detail. The notification of the discontinuance letter to the students is reviewed. It is suggested the information of the transferability of the classes in the letter be reorganized to alleviate any mixed messages.

College Council is in agreement that the Horticulture Discontinuance is ready to be presented to the Board on the November 19, 2018 meeting and again in December for a second reading.

#### 6. Adjournment All

**Fall College Council Meetings**

- a. Friday, November 9, 2018 (Policy Day)
- b. Monday, November 19, 2018 (Board Day)
- c. Monday, December 3, 2018
- d. Monday, December 17, 2018 (Board Day)

**Spring College Council Meetings**

- a. Monday, February 18, 2019 (Board Day)
- b. Monday, March 4, 2019
- c. Monday, March 18, 2019 (Board Day)
- d. Monday, April 1, 2019
- e. Monday, April 15, 2019 (Board Day)
- f. Monday, May 6, 2019
- g. Monday, May 20, 2019 (Board Day)
- h. Monday, June 3, 2019

**2018-19 College Council Goals**

1. Lead the ECC Governance Evaluation Project and develop recommendations to improve governance processes at ECC.
2. Complete/continue development of legally required policies. Review strategies and tools to improve accessibility of BP/APs and select/implement solution.
3. Support Compton Transition Planning process to conclude partnership by June 7, 2019.
4. Consult collegially to help develop a Strategic Plan, ensuring alignment with the Chancellor's Office *Strategic Vision for Success* and findings from the Climate Survey.
5. Consult collegially to discuss and recommend the topics for the Quality Focused Essay by February 1, 2019.
6. Monitor progress on overarching initiatives, including but not limited to, Guided Pathways, Strong Workforce, and AB705 implementation

# Tips for Developing Board Policies

## 1. Know the Difference between Board Policy and Administrative Procedures

Board policy is the voice of the Board of Trustees and defines the general goals and acceptable practices for the operations of the District. It implements federal and state laws and regulations. The Board, through policy, delegates authority to the Superintendent/President to administer the District. The Superintendent/President and District employees interpret Board Policy as well as other relevant laws and regulations that govern the District.

Administrative procedures implement board policy, laws, and regulations. They address how the District's goals are achieved and define its operations. They include details of policy implementation, responsibility, accountability, and standards of practice. They are developed and implemented by the Superintendent/President, administration, faculty, and staff; they are not intended to require Board action.

## 2. Use Correct Terminology

District vs. College: Board policies and administrative procedures apply to the District, not the College. The term "District" should always be used.

Superintendent/President vs. CEO: The chief executive for the El Camino Community College District is the Superintendent/President. The more general term "CEO" should not be used.

## 3. Use Templates to Guide Wording

Effective policies and procedures are straightforward, succinct, and contain the minimum language necessary. To assist you in drafting policies, the College subscribes to a policy template service provided by the Community College League of California (CCLC). When using these templates, be aware of these categories of language:

Recommended: The wording is closely tied to law or regulation, and the language should be adopted as is or with very few changes. Examples include the conflict of interest, harassment, and discrimination policies and procedures. Changes to the language should be reviewed by our legal counsel.

Suggested or Template: The wording in the template reflects legal requirements, but is offered as a suggestion. You may use our current policy or procedure language, adopt the template language, or revise the language to fit our culture and needs. Significant changes or additions should be reviewed by our legal counsel.

Excerpts from Law/Regulation: The template language includes relevant excerpts from law and regulation that should be addressed or included in local policies and procedures. You will usually need to add language to reflect our specific circumstances.

Checklist of Concepts: The template consists of a checklist of concepts that should be addressed in the policy or procedure, but you have significant flexibility regarding the specific content of the language.

Insert Local Practice: The template states "insert current practice," because either the policy or procedure must be developed through the local decision-making process (e.g. academic freedom and the consultative process itself) or you have substantial flexibility. No sample language is provided in these cases.

## 4. Use Appropriate Style

### Fonts and Sizes

Titles: Times New Roman, 14 pt., bold

Subheadings: Times New Roman, 12 pt., bold

Body text: Times New Roman, 12 pt., left justified

### Bulleted List vs. Numbered List

When presenting information in a list, choose numbers rather than bullets if:

- The sequence of the items is critical
- There may be a need to refer to the elements by number
- The numbering has some independent meaning (example: a listing of musical tracks)

Choose bullets rather than numbers if:

- There is no need to convey chronology or ranking

### Sample Document

<b>Board Policy 2745</b>	<b>Board Self-Evaluation</b>
<p>The Board is committed to assessing its own performance as a Board in order to identify its strengths and areas in which it may improve its functioning.</p> <p>To that end, the Board establishes goals and evaluates its performance on the previous year's goals. The self-evaluation will be presented and discussed at an open meeting of the Board. The results will be used to identify accomplishments in the past year and goals for the following year.</p> <p>Reference: Accreditation Standard IV.C.10</p>	
<p>El Camino College Adopted: 4/16/01 Amended: 12/17/12, 3/20/17</p>	

**Collegial Consultation Evaluation Project Proposal**  
**College Council Meeting – November 5, 2018**

- Current planning and consultation stakeholders participated in a Consultation Survey in 2015 as an evaluation of the *Making Decisions at El Camino College* collegial consultation process
- *Making Decisions at El Camino College* is reviewed annually by consultation committees
- It is time to conduct the Consultation Survey again to determine:
  - Familiarity with the *Making Decision at El Camino College* document
  - Understanding of the decision-making process
  - Satisfaction with the aspects of collegial consultation and decision-making at El Camino College
  - Any areas needing improvement
- Participants
  - Academic Senate members
  - Calendar Committee members
  - College Council members
  - Facilities Steering Committee members
  - Planning and Budget Committee members
  - Technology Committee members
- Data will be collected by Research and Planning
- Final report will be shared at the Planning Summit (verify timeline with IRP)



### ACCREDITATION TIMELINE

DATE	ITEM
Fall 2017	Select Co-chairs & Steering Committee Identify and select document management system
February 2018	Steering Team Start Training Implement and train on document management system
March – August 2018	Collect Data / Evidence
September 2018 – January 2019	Write ISER Draft 1 Research QFE topic areas
November 2018	Draft Narratives for standards in process
November 30, 2018	Accreditation Co-Chairs and VP liaisons review draft Narratives
January 30, 2019	Identify QFE topic area ISER draft review comments back to standard teams
February 8 and March 4, 2019	College council discussion/recommendation of QFE
Feb 19 and March 5, 2019	Academic Senate discussion of QFE
February 2019	PBC and other consultation groups discussion of QFE topic
Feb – May 2019	Accreditation Co-chair examine Eligibility Requirements and Commission Policies Develop Theme for ISER
March – May 2019	Standard teams revise ISER drafts

May 2019	Select QFE topic and begin draft
Summer 2019	Continue QFE & ISER Draft 2
October 2019	Complete QFE draft
November 2019	Start Consultation & Forums
March 2020	Final ISER Draft & Consultation Complete
May 2020	Board Approval
May - August 2020	Finish Copy
August 2020	Mail Documents
October 2020	Team Visit

## Program Evaluation Task Force: Horticulture

---

### Executive Summary

El Camino College's Horticulture program has experienced significant changes in the last decade. These include the courses no longer articulating for CSU general education, declining enrollments, a lack of space to upgrade facilities, the retirement of the sole full-time instructor, and difficulty recruiting part-time instructors. As a result, a program evaluation task force was convened. Representation included Academic Affairs, the Academic Senate, Institutional Research and Planning, faculty and deans. The task force considered program data, labor market trends, and comparable institutions. A variety of alternatives were considered, including relocating courses to other academic departments within the college. After a full and open discussion, the task force concluded that the program is unable to successfully achieve or make substantial progress toward its goals and objectives. The task force recommended discontinuance of the program, provided current Horticulture students are informed and sufficiently supported so they may complete their education in a timely manner. The recommendation and the discontinuance plan were reviewed and endorsed by the Academic Senate.

### Program Evaluation Task Force

El Camino College's Horticulture program has experienced significant changes in the last decade. These include the courses no longer articulating for CSU general education and declining student enrollments. The sole full-time instructor retired in Spring 2016 and staffing classes has been a perennial challenge. For example, in Fall 2017, two rounds of job announcements for adjunct Horticulture faculty yielded only one applicant who did not meet minimum qualifications. As a result, one of the two Horticulture offerings for Spring 2018 was cancelled. In addition, the Horticulture program facilities are limited in their effectiveness and improvements would require significant capital expenditures.

As outlined in BP/AP 4021, a program evaluation task force was convened to review the viability of the Horticulture program. The task force was co-chaired by the Vice President for Academic Affairs and the Academic Senate president. Its members included two faculty, two deans and an Institutional Research representative who served in an advisory role. The members of the task force met in Fall 2016 and Spring 2017 and were as follows:

Kristie Daniel-DiGregorio (Academic Senate)  
Irene Graff (Institutional Research and Planning)  
Gloria Miranda (Dean, Behavioral and Social Sciences)  
Virginia Rapp (Dean, Business)  
Jean Shankweiler (Academic Affairs)  
Rob Shibao (Natural Sciences)  
Josh Troesh (Business).

After determining procedures, criteria and guidelines for decision-making, the task force requested the following data on the ECC Horticulture program:

- Success and Retention by course (2006-2016)
- Fill rates by course (2007-2016)

- FTES (2009-2016)
- Degrees and certificates awarded (2006-2016)
- Student demographics and enrollment characteristics (2009-2015).

The task force also considered:

- National, regional, and local job projections for Horticulture occupations, including farmer, rancher, grounds maintenance worker, landscaping worker, first line supervisor, and landscape architect.
- FTES, programs offered, staffing, and program highlights for the following six comparable programs in the region:
  - LA Pierce College
  - Mt. San Antonio College
  - Orange Coast College
  - Saddleback College
  - Long Beach City College
  - Fullerton College.
- The need for and present adequacy of resources.

### **Evaluation of Program Effectiveness**

As required by BP/AP 4021, the task force engaged in a full and open discussion of the program's effectiveness in serving the community, the college, and its students. The program data confirmed declining student enrollment and low fill and completion rates in Horticulture courses. Enrollment reached a peak of 131 students in Fall 2010. After this term, enrollment steadily decreased to 79 students in Fall 2015. The average Horticulture FTES from 2009-2010 to 2015-2016 was 29.19. From 2006-2016, Fall and Spring course fill rates averaged 69.6% and 67.7%, respectively. From 2005-2006 to 2015-2016, El Camino College has awarded 21 degrees and 30 certificates in Horticulture. Success and retention rates for most courses have consistently been below college success and retention rates.

A number of area community colleges have robust Horticulture programs. These include Long Beach City College, Saddleback College, Mt. San Antonio College, and Orange Coast College. These colleges offer a variety of specializations and have dedicated space on their campuses for their Horticulture programs. Their course offerings and student enrollments are strong. For example, Mt. San Antonio College in 2014-2015 had 433 enrollments, 20 section offerings, and 48 FTES. In contrast, El Camino College had 146 enrollments, 7 section offerings, and 14 FTES.

Labor market requirements may provide some context for understanding El Camino's declining enrollment. The academic requirements for Horticulture occupations (e.g., farmer and rancher, grounds maintenance worker, landscaping worker, first line supervisor) show the majority needing high school diplomas, whereas, the majority of positions for landscape architect require a Bachelor of Arts degree. El Camino's Horticulture program provides higher credentials than are required for most Horticulture careers, while El Camino's Horticulture degrees and certificates are not sufficient for careers in landscape architecture. This may help explain why awards of Horticulture degrees and certificates have been on the decline since 2003 nationally (-12.7%), in California (-5.6%), and in LA County (-8.4%). El Camino awarded 4 degrees and 3 certificates in 2014-2015 academic year.

The task force reviewed the adequacy of resources for the Horticulture program. Current facilities are limited in their effectiveness and improvements would require significant capital expenditures. To effectively support the Horticulture's program goals and objectives, the current greenhouse would need to be relocated and expanded and upgraded to incorporate plumbing and electricity. The greenhouse is inconveniently located, situated between Parking Structure E and Construction Technology. This location, and the lack of electricity and nearby restroom facilities, not only limits its usability but also presents safety considerations. A much-needed expansion of the facilities is not possible because there is no available space in the Master Plan.

### **Task Force Recommendations**

As required by BP/AP 4021, the task force engaged in a full and open discussion of the program's effectiveness in serving the community, the college, and its students. Previous intervention strategies were discussed. For example, advisory committees were convened to develop strategies to enhance and sustain the program. However, implementation of these strategies requires the sustained effort of a full-time instructor, a position that has been vacant since Spring 2016.

The task force considered relocating courses with moderate enrollment, success and retention rates to other academic departments within the college such as Environmental Technology or Architecture in the Industry and Technology Division. However, the focus in these departments is on landscaping, design, and plant materials while the focus of Horticulture is on the care and culture of plants. Vast revisions of the curriculum would be required to integrate Horticulture courses into the Environmental Technology or Architecture departments. A landscape architect was consulted. He explained that the Horticulture program trains nurserymen and gardeners that nurture the plants, while a landscape architecture program focuses on the design of outdoor areas to create an effect.

After a full and open discussion, the task force unanimously concluded that the program is unable to successfully achieve or make substantial progress toward its goals and objectives and should be discontinued.

### **Consultation**

As noted in AP 4021, Program Discontinuance procedures require that the Academic Senate have a consultative role in all discussions of program discontinuance. The President of the Academic Senate served as co-chair for the task force and the recommendation to discontinue El Camino College's Horticulture program was presented to the Academic Senate for two readings and a vote (May 1<sup>st</sup> and 15<sup>th</sup>, 2018). The Senate reviewed the program data, labor market trends, information on comparison colleges, a summary of the task force deliberations, a teach out plan for discontinuance of the program, and referral resources for Horticulture students. Natural Sciences senators confirmed that faculty in their division were consulted and support the recommendation to discontinue the program. The Academic Senate voted to endorse the task force recommendation to discontinue the Horticulture program on May 15<sup>th</sup>, 2018.

### **Plan for the Discontinuance of the Horticulture Program**

The following is a three-year plan for the discontinuance of the Environmental Horticulture Program, beginning in Spring 2019. The three-year time frame will not only allow students to finish a program or

certificate that they've already started, it provides sufficient time for students to begin and finish a certificate. These courses will be offered as long as qualified faculty are available to teach them.

Year 0 Fall 18: Hort-41 General Horticulture Hort-55 Plant ID Trees	Year 1 Spring 19: Hort-42 Plant Propagation Hort-56 Plant ID-Shrubs
Year 1 Fall 19: Hort-54 Landscape Design Hort-53 Soils and Fertilizers	Year 2 Spring 20: Hort-60 Landscape Irrigation Hort-46 Pest Control
Year 2 Fall 20: Hort-41 General Horticulture Hort-55 Plant ID Trees	Year 3 Spring 21: Hort-42 Plant Propagation Hort-56 Plant ID-Shrubs
Year 3 Fall 21: Hort-54 Landscape Design Hort-53 Soils and Fertilizers	

Data from Institutional Research and Planning indicates that 184 students have taken a Horticulture course since Fall 2017. Pending approval of the Horticulture discontinuance, each of these students will be contacted by email, phone and U.S. mail. They will be notified of the discontinuance of the Horticulture program, and provided with the teach out plan and the contact information for El Camino's Horticulture counselors who can design an educational plan so students can complete their educational goals in Horticulture. In addition, students will be provided information for area Horticulture programs which includes distance from the El Camino College campus, the number of degrees, certificates, and classes offered; and a link to the program website. (Please see attached letter to students.)

The college has developed a strategy to inform the larger campus community about the discontinuance of the Horticulture program. Pending approval of the Horticulture discontinuance, the El Camino College catalog and major guide sheets (which are posted to the district website and available in Counseling) will be updated to indicate that the college's Horticulture program will no longer be offered after Fall 2021. Also, a message will be posted to the MyECC student portal.

### Conclusion

Given the perennial challenges being faced by the El Camino College's Horticulture program (e.g., declining enrollments, the need for capital improvements, no full-time faculty, and difficulty recruiting adjunct instructors), the Program Evaluation Task Force recommends that the program be discontinued at the end of Fall 2021. The Academic Senate has been consulted and has endorsed this recommendation.

KDD/10.30.18



# EL CAMINO COMMUNITY COLLEGE DISTRICT

16007 Crenshaw Boulevard, Torrance, California 90506-0001

Telephone (310) 532-3670 or 1-866-ELCAMINO

[www.elcamino.edu](http://www.elcamino.edu)

December 1, 2018

Dear Student:

This letter is to inform you that the Environmental Horticulture Program will be phased out over the next three years. After Fall 2021, El Camino College will no longer offer horticulture classes. The program is being discontinued because of declining enrollments, limited facilities, and the difficulties in finding qualified horticulture instructors.

The college plans to offer the following classes over the next three years so that students can finish their programs:

Spring 2019: Hort-42 Plant Propagation Hort-56 Plant ID-Shrubs	Fall 2019: Hort-54 Landscape Design Hort-53 Soils and Fertilizers
Spring 2020: Hort-60 Landscape Irrigation Hort-46 Pest Control	Fall 2020: Hort-41 General Horticulture Hort-55 Plant ID Trees
Spring 2021: Hort-42 Plant Propagation Hort-56 Plant ID-Shrubs	Fall 2021: Hort-54 Landscape Design Hort-53 Soils and Fertilizers

El Camino College counselors can answer any questions you may have about completing a degree or certificate in Horticulture at El Camino College before the program is discontinued. Please contact Counselors Atheneus Ocampo or Angela Tuan at (310) 660-3458 during business hours. You may also make an appointment at [www.elcamino.edu/student/studentservices/counseling](http://www.elcamino.edu/student/studentservices/counseling). If you are interested in other Horticulture programs in the area, that information is provided below.

Long Beach City College (16 miles from ECC) Associate's of Science in Horticulture; Certificate <a href="https://www.lbcc.edu/program-horticulture">https://www.lbcc.edu/program-horticulture</a> 15 horticulture and floral design classes available	UCLA Extension (17 miles from ECC) Certificate; Gardening and Plants for the Landscape Specializations <a href="http://horticulture.uclaextension.edu">http://horticulture.uclaextension.edu</a> 8 horticulture classes available	Orange Coast College (32 miles from ECC) Associate's of Science in Horticulture and 5 certificates <a href="http://www.orangecoastcollege.edu/academics/divisions/math_science/horticulture/Pages/default.aspx">http://www.orangecoastcollege.edu/academics/divisions/math_science/horticulture/Pages/default.aspx</a> 28 horticulture classes offered
Mt. SAC College (39 miles from ECC) 4 Associate's of Science in Horticulture and 13 certificates available <a href="http://www.mtsac.edu/horticulture/degrees-certificates.html">http://www.mtsac.edu/horticulture/degrees-certificates.html</a> 30 horticulture classes offered	Saddleback College (50 miles from ECC) Associate's of Science in Horticulture; Certificate in Horticulture/Landscape Design <a href="https://www.saddleback.edu/atas/horticulture">https://www.saddleback.edu/atas/horticulture</a> 27 horticulture classes offered	

If you have any questions or concerns, please don't hesitate to contact me at [agrant@elcamino.edu](mailto:agrant@elcamino.edu), or call 310-660-3343.

Thank you,  
Dr. Amy Grant  
Dean of Natural Sciences