

# **EVALUATION REPORT**

## **EL CAMINO COLLEGE**

16007 Crenshaw Blvd.  
Torrance, CA 90506

A Report Prepared for the Accrediting Commission  
For Community and Junior Colleges

This report represents the findings of the evaluation team that visited  
El Camino College October 6 – 9, 2008

Donald F. Averill, Ed.D.  
Team Chair

**El Camino College**  
**Comprehensive Evaluation Visit Team**  
**Monday, October 6 – Thursday, October 9, 2008**

Dr. Donald Averill (**Chair**)  
Chancellor Emeritus  
San Bernardino CCD

Kevin Fleming (**Assistant**)  
Dir. Centers for Excellence  
San Bernardino CCD

Dr. Celia Barberena  
President  
Chabot College

Dr. Sharon Lowry  
Vice President, Academic  
Affairs  
Antelope Valley College

Dr. Kevin Bontenbal  
Instructional Technology Librarian  
Cuesta College

Dr. Richard Mahon  
Associate Professor  
Humanities  
Riverside City College

Dr. Jane de Leon  
Dean of Planning, Research & Professional  
Development  
American River College

Dr. Steve Maradian  
Vice President  
Accrediting Commission for  
Community and Junior  
Colleges

Dr. William Karns  
Vice Chancellor, Education & Technology  
Los Rios Community College District

Ms. Kindred Murillo  
Vice Chancellor Districtwide  
Administrative Services  
Contra Costa CCD

Ms. Eva Kinsman  
Member, Board of Trustees  
Copper Mountain College CCD

Ms. Rhea Riegel  
Institutional Research  
Coordinator  
Fresno City College

Ms. Mona Lee  
Dean of Student Services and Kahikoluamea  
Kapi'olani Community College

Mr. Brian Thieboux  
Professor, English, Business  
& Institutional Research  
Palo Verde College

## SUMMARY

The Visiting Committee Chair and his assistant conducted a pre-visit to the campus to complete a site review, meet the steering committee and district personnel and to work out the final logistics for the team visit. The discussion included the dynamics for conducting a site review of the main campus as well as the El Camino College (ECC) Compton Center.

Prior to the visit all evaluation team members participated in the team training in Los Angeles. This gave the visiting committee chair and the assistant an opportunity to meet with the team and to work out logistics, assignments, and preliminary findings or analyses with the team. The college distributed the self study report prior to the visit and all team members were asked to read the complete self study and analyze the whole self study report. In addition, the team members were required to provide a detailed analysis of the self study report based upon their specific assignment to one of the four standards. The team assignments were electronically sent to the team chair and from there each member's work was distributed to the other team members. The team arrived at the college ready to fully participate in the accreditation

Due to the historical memorandum of Understanding (MOU) between El Camino Community College District (CCD) and the Compton CCD, and to the fact that the Compton CCD has a Special Trustee and the additional oversight of the Fiscal Crises and Management Assistance Team (FCMAT), the team chair prepared a report on the three previous FCMAT reports on the Compton CCD. This information was reviewed with the team prior to the visit. Extensive steps were taken to make the team aware that they were accrediting El Camino College and addressing how it was applying the standards at all of its sites and in its online instructional program. The team was not there to make judgments about the accredited status of the Compton CCD.

A fourteen-member team appointed by the Accrediting Commission for Community and Junior Colleges (ACCJC) of the Western Association of Schools and Colleges conducted a comprehensive visit of El Camino College, including its ECC Compton Center, from October 6 – 9, 2008. Team members interviewed a broad representation of the campus community, held two open forums, met with the five members of the Board of Trustees, and the Student Trustee. In addition the visiting team met with each standard committee in order to acquire a thorough understanding of El Camino College's instructional program, services for students, organizational culture, climate, and student population.

The purpose of the visit was to evaluate the quality of the institution by comparing its performance to the standards of accreditation. The team reviewed the college's self-study report to determine how well the college had addressed the recommendations of the previous visiting team, to see how the college compared its practices to the ACCJC Standards. The team analyzed the institution's adherence to the Standards and provided recommendations regarding quality assurance and institutional improvement in order to

assist the college in strengthening its programs and services. The team also, made a recommendation to the Accrediting Commission regarding the accredited status of El Camino College.

Each team member prepared written reactions to the El Camino College self study, identified questions to be addressed by the college, and determined individuals and groups to be interviewed. Meetings were established with each Standard Committee, the Board of Trustees, the administration and appropriate individuals on the campuses. The team met collectively to review the self-study report and discuss themes to address. Members of the team met with the co-chairs of their primary and secondary assignments and were introduced to college officials and members of the self-study steering committee.

To provide for a complete review of the degree to which the El Camino College Compton Center is meeting the accreditation standards, a member of each of the five assigned teams was charged with a review of the four standards related to the center operation. Standard II was separated into two teams; one for instruction and one for non-instructional services.

The 2008 visiting team found the self-study to be well organized and easy to use. The team felt that all standards were addressed, but were skeptical of the degree in which each section of the report proclaimed that the college had met the standard. As to be expected the report was understated on some points and the team was pleased to find that the progress of the work between El Camino College and the El Camino College Compton Center reflected better progress than was reported in the self study.

## **COMMENDATIONS**

El Camino College is to be commended for:

1. Extending their assistance, support and training to the faculty, staff, administration, and community of the Compton CCD to retain access to community college education within their community.
2. The effort that has been taken at the college and the El Camino College Compton Center to integrate very different organizations to work toward common goals and direction to meet accreditation standards.
3. The dialogue between the faculty and staff organization at El Camino and the ECC Compton Center and the collaboration taking place to bring the Center into compliance with the Commission standards
4. High degree of coordination taking place between the college and ECC Compton Center in the delivery of student services programs.

## RECOMMENDATIONS

1. As cited in previous (1990, 1996, and 2002) accreditation recommendations the college should complete the full implementation of its process for tracking planning, program review, budgeting, and evaluation process and complete the cycle to assure that all the departments and sites (including the ECC Compton Center) of the college participate in the program review process, and that the results of program review clearly link to institutional planning and the allocation of resources. (I.B.3; I.B.3; II.A.2.e.; II.A.2.f; III.B.1; III.B.1.a; III.B.2.a; III.b.2.b)
2. The college should immediately define and publish a timeline in respect to how it will develop and implement student learning outcomes at the course, program and degree levels, establish systems to assess student learning outcomes and use the results of such assessments to make improvements in the delivery of student learning, to ensure that the College shall attain, by 2012, the level of Proficiency in the *ACCJC Rubric for Evaluating Institutional Effectiveness—Part III: Student Learning Outcomes*. The college should immediately implement processes to communicate to students expected student learning outcomes in course outlines, course syllabi, college catalog and/or other effective channels (II.A.1.a; II.A.1.c; II.A.2.a-b; II.A.2.f; II.A.6)
3. The college should revise its curriculum review processes and cycles so that all curriculum across the college is reviewed consistently, that the cycle of review assures the currency of the curriculum, and that the curriculum review and program review processes are integrated so that an important element of program review (the determination that program curriculum needs revision, addition or deletion to remain current) will be part of the actual program review process. (II.A.2; II.A.2.a; II.A.2.b; II.A.2.c; II.A.2.d; II.A.2.e)
4. The college needs to assure that online courses and programs are consistent in meeting the same level of rigor as on campus programs, that all services available on campus are available online, that student learning outcomes are incorporated into these offerings and that this information is clearly communicated to students taking these courses. (II.A.1.b; II.A.2.; II.A.2.a.2; II.A.6; II.A.7)
5. El Camino College and the ECC Compton Center need to fully integrate SLO assessment into the faculty evaluation process. The ECC Compton Center must implement its faculty evaluations and use the results of these evaluations to encourage instructional improvements and faculty development plans. (III.A.1.b; III.A.1.c)
6. El Camino College must develop a fiscal management plan at all sites, matched to its revenues, to assure the fiscal soundness of the institution. (III.D.2.c, III.D.2.d, III.D.2.g; III.D.3)

7. El Camino College should develop a staffing plan for all sites which assures the effectiveness of human resources, includes written criteria for all personnel, and assigns individuals to duties appropriate to their expertise and the needs of the institution (III.A.1.a, III.A.1.b).
8. El Camino College develop a facilities master plan for all sites, linked to educational planning, and integrate this plan with the institution's overall planning process (III.B.1.a, III.B.2.a, III.B.2.b)
9. The Board of Trustees of El Camino Community College District must include in its code of ethics a clearly defined policy for dealing with behavior that violates this code. (Standard IV.B.h)

## **INTRODUCTION**

### **History**

El Camino College was first accredited in 1952 by the Western College Association, and has been accredited by the ACCJC since 1963, when the Western Association of Schools and Colleges was formed. Its main campus is on an expansive, 126-acre site with an open, tree-lined quad area. The College has a diverse student body of nearly 30,000 students who attend classes in the 30 buildings across campus. The architecture is mid-century modern. The first classes were offered in 1946. The College's last comprehensive evaluation occurred in 2002, and its accreditation was reaffirmed. The College also submitted follow up reports to the commission in spring 2003, 2005, 2006, and 2007 as well as fall 2006 and 2007. Some of these reports dealt with the College's development of the Compton Educational Center, a second campus of El Camino College first implemented in fall 2006.

The District sought and obtained voter approval for Measure E, a \$394 million facility and equipment bond in 2002, the largest successful bond for a single campus community college district. This bond was the first-ever in the college's history. It enabled structural improvements in many of the buildings and funded new structures and infrastructure on a campus nearly 55 years old. The 1,150 full- and part-time faculty members teach approximately 2,336 sections of pre-baccalaureate, transfer, and vocational courses in 850 programs each semester. Students and community members enjoy cultural and entertainment events in the 2,048-seat Marsee Auditorium cheer at football games in Murdock Stadium, or study in the 120,000-volume Schauerman Library. The new Humanities Building, the first new academic building on campus in four decades, opened in early 2008 and serves as part of a revitalized entrance to the campus.

The five-member Board of Trustees oversees El Camino College's policy and fiscal issues. The board members represent the nine Los Angeles county cities and unincorporated areas served by the District: El Segundo, Hawthorne, Hermosa Beach, Inglewood, Lawndale, Lennox, Manhattan Beach, Redondo Beach, and Torrance. Much like the

founding board members, the current board comprises individuals dedicated to ensuring that El Camino College continues to set the standard for community college education.

On August 22, 2006, the Board of Trustees approved an agreement between El Camino Community College District and the Compton Community College District to establish the El Camino College Compton Center on the site of the former Compton College, which lost its accreditation in August 2006. El Camino College agreed to establish a center to serve the Compton District service area with the hope to establish an independent accredited college at the end of eight to 10 years.

The service area in the Compton District includes the communities of Carson, Compton, Lynwood, the northern section of Long Beach, and Paramount. On August 23, 2006, the ECC Compton Center officially became part of El Camino College.

## **RESPONSES TO RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE PREVIOUS EVALUATION TEAM**

- 1. As cited in previous (1990, 1996) accreditation recommendations, the college must improve and implement effective program review processes. All segments of the college community need to collaborate to develop and Implement a streamlined, meaningful, and timely program review process for Academic Affairs and Administrative Services and link the outcomes to planning and budget processes. (Standards 3A.4, 3B.3)*

During the period since the 2002 Comprehensive Evaluation and the Focused Midterm Report of March 15, 2005, El Camino College had three visits to identify its progress in meeting the Commission recommendations: a) “The College must improve and implement program review and linking the results to planning and budgeting;” and b) “budget development process needs to be structurally linked to the institutional planning process.” The Focused Midterm report progress did not indicate satisfactory compliance with these two areas. This is of significance, as these recommendations appear to have been issues in both the 1990 and 1996 comprehensive evaluation reports.

In the June 29, 2007 letter from the ACCJC regarding the Progress Report it was noted that “The Commission wishes to inform the College that of its expectation at the time of the comprehensive evaluation in fall 2008, El Camino College demonstrate that resource allocation based on program review and planning including assessment of SLO’s has been institutionalized.”

A review of the three focused reports and the visits that were completed show that the college worked on the recommendations and established a process for moving from the Educational Master Plan goals and objectives through program review,

budget allocation and evaluation. Two different data tools were used to track the progress on these actions by instruction, student services, and administration. The final tracking tool, *Plan Builder*, was implemented in the last few months and many of those using the tool were just beginning to enter and track data.

April 17, 2007 Progress Visit Report states “The College has demonstrated sufficient progress towards this recommendation. The college is preparing their self study for the fall 2008 accreditation team visit. The evaluation of the budget decision making process should be a key element in the self study since it would have been implemented for one full budget cycle by that time”.

In verifying the institutionalization of the linkage of program review and planning to resource allocation, El Camino campus has gone through one complete cycle of the process of linkage and is working out the flaws. The process is set up and the institution is working at getting the process through a second evaluation cycle.

Despite this noted progress and the extensive work by the campus constituencies the visiting team continues to have concern about the fact that approximately 25 percent of the programs offered by El Camino College have not been reviewed in over 12 years. The review of curriculum is on a ten year cycle and many of these have not been reviewed in that timeline. Finally, there is no evidence that the data that has been collected is used to establish a pattern of continuous improvement. The visiting team feels strongly, that this recommendation needs continued attention.

2. ***The team recommends that the college review and establish a consistently applied, thorough, objective, and accountable system of classified staff performance review, focused on individual growth and performance improvement (Standards 7B.1, 7B.2, 7B.3)***

The recommendation was addressed in the Focused Midterm Report of 2005. The evaluation systems are developed, implemented, and monitored. Extensive changes have been incorporated in human resources and appropriate staff development has been provided for the classified employees. The recommendation as stated in the 2002 Comprehensive Visit has been met.

Somewhat related to this recommendation, but separate because of the employee relationship of employees at Compton CCD, is the need to provide for a classification study of many of the classified positions at that site. This work needs to be completed jointly by the two parties involved in the MOU to operate the ECC Compton Center. This matter is further discussed in Standard III A.

3. ***As cited in both the 1990 and 1996 accreditation recommendations, the budget development process needs to be structurally linked to the institutional planning and program review process. This linkage should include the Educational Mas-***



*ter Plan, Facilities Master Plan, Technology Master Plan, staffing plan, and other institutional planning efforts. (Standards 9.A.1, 9.A.3)*

Most of the progress on this recommendation has been reflected in the comments from the first assessment of the recommendations from the previous visit above. The campus involved all of its constituent groups in developing a model to accomplish this task. Two different interactions were tested and the planning tool for tracking progress was changed. The evidence shows that the college completed one cycle of the process and the last focused visit indicated that substantial progress had been made on the recommendation.

This visiting team agrees that the college has made progress on the model and that one planning cycle has been completed. There are different levels of accomplishment on the model in instruction, student services, and the management areas. Some of this work was not completed by some of these segments until shortly before the visiting team arrived. The visiting team was further concerned about gaps in program review and curriculum review that should have been integral to a comprehensive process for linking planning to budgeting, review, and decision making to apply continuous improvement within the College. This Recommendation still needs to be fully implemented.

4. *The college's 1992 governance policy and current consultation procedures needs to be updated and clarified into one governance policy and procedure system in order to create an understandable and more effective governance system that clearly reflects the roles and responsibilities of all constituents. (Standard 10.B.8)*

El Camino College collaborated extensively with the college constituencies to clarify and modify the collegial consultation model. The evidence shows that all constituent groups have involvement in the collegial process and communications on the campus are open.

Some concern was stated by the Academic Senate at El Camino College regarding the application on the eleven areas of collegial consultation that are identified as within the purview of the Academic Senate. This discussion centers on whether the college shall use "Depend primarily upon" or "mutual agreement" in the decision making process. The El Camino College Academic Senate has asked for technical assistance from the state regarding this issue and that had not been implemented at the time of the visit.

The Board of Trustees and the college have joined the Community College League of California (CCLC) Policy and Procedure Service. This process provides for the ongoing update of policies and procedures and provides legal advice on operating within the intent of California statute on district policies and procedures. This recommendation has been met.

As a side note, there is a mixed bag on policies and procedures at the ECC Compton Center. Instructional programs are being operated under the policies of El Camino College. However, many of the other functional areas that are under the purview of Compton CCD and the Special Trustee are in the process of being incorporated into agreements between the Special Trustee and the President of El Camino College.

## **ELIGIBILITY REQUIREMENTS**

### **1. AUTHORITY**

El Camino Community College District conforms to the statutes under the California Education Code, the California Code of Regulations Title 5 Education Division 6, and California Community Colleges. It further subscribes to the Accrediting Commission for Community and Junior Colleges (ACCJC) Standards for Accreditation. El Camino Community College District derives its authority to operate, as a degree granting institution, from statute (California Education Code 70902). The college meets the minimum conditions for community colleges set forth in Title 5, Chapter 2, and Subchapter 1.

El Camino College opened the El Camino College Compton Community Educational Center in August 2006. The educational center is the result of partnership with the Compton Community College District to provide educational programs and services to the residents of the district. This is a unique arrangement in the State of California and the California Community College system. All educational programs and services are operated under the direction and legal auspices of El Camino Community College District. El Camino College understands and supports the long term effort to obtain accreditation status of the newly formed El Camino College Compton Center into a College in the future. **El Camino College meets this eligibility requirement.**

### **2. MISSION**

The El Camino College (ECC) mission statement was re-written in 2007 and is designed to address the needs of the community. The mission statement was reviewed by all college constituencies, including representatives from the ECC Compton Center and approved by the Board of Trustees.

The major change to ECC's mission since the last accreditation review is the establishment of the educational center in the Compton Community College District services area on the grounds of the former Compton College. Two significant changes to the ECC mission were made: first, a new geographical service area that is not contiguous to the El Camino Community College District was added to the ECC services area; and, second, a comprehensive educational center was opened in August 2006.

The mission statement is found in several campus documents, including the Educational Master Plan and College Catalog. The college publishes it on the web site, increasing its public availability. ECC has a separate website for the ECC Compton Community Educational Center, more commonly known as the ECC Compton Center. **El Camino College meets this eligibility requirement.**

### **3. GOVERNING BOARD**

The ECC governing board and its jurisdiction has not changed. The establishment of an educational center in a new service area will not affect the authority of the El Camino Community College District Board of Trustees. El Camino Community College District is governed by a five-member board. Each member is elected for a four-year term from one of five trustee areas that make up the college district in district wide elections. The Board is stable and has strong leadership and support from the community.

The Board members do not have any employment, family, or personal financial interests related to either the college or the district. Two current Board members were ECC employees; however, both retired from the district several years prior to their election to the Board. The students have advisory voting status for the Student Board member, and the Academic Senate President reports to the Board on a regular basis.

The ECC governing board is independent of the Compton Special Trustee. Jurisdiction for the Compton Community College District remains under the auspices of the CCC Chancellor and her authority to appoint a Special Trustee. The Special Trustee is given the authority to assume all of the powers of the Compton Community College District Board of Trustees. **El Camino College meets this eligibility requirement.**

### **4. CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER**

The major role and responsibility of the El Camino College Superintendent/President is to serve as the chief executive officer (CEO) of the ECC Board of Trustees to administer Board policies and provide oversight of the District.

On matters related to the management of the ECC Compton Center, the Superintendent/President and the Compton District Special Trustee mutually agree on the appointment of the Provost/CEO of the Compton Center and Compton Community College District. Other key management and faculty positions for the Center (faculty, staff and managers are Compton employees) are approved by the Superintendent/President through his participation in the final interview with the Provost. The Compton Provost reports to the Superintendent/President on educational policies, programs, and services; and to the Special Trustee on fiscal, operational, and bond programs. The Provost coordinates with the Vice President of Academic Affairs on

instructional and Academic matters; the Vice President of Student Services on student support services matters; the Vice President of Administrative Services on fiscal, facilities, and bond programs; and with the Vice President of Human Resources on personnel matters. **El Camino College meets this eligibility requirement.**

## 5. ADMINISTRATIVE CAPACITY

The college has a reputation for educational excellence within its service area. El Camino College is fiscally sound and academic and student services programs have qualified leadership. The administration is capable of providing the administrative oversight necessary to ensure that the institution continues to offer quality programs. ECC has sufficient administrative, faculty, and support staff to address the needs of its students and the institution. Since opening the Compton Center the college added three additional administrators to assist the vice presidents.

The college has sufficient span of control to adequately manage the ECC Compton Center. The Center management staff work closely with the main campus administration through direct reporting, participation in the Council of Dean/Directors, committees, and other joint efforts. Management development workshops are held monthly for all administrators to develop their knowledge and skills in a variety of areas including accreditation policies and procedures.

The management team at the ECC Compton Center has suffered from continuity up to and including the highest administrative levels. There is still a significant use of interim administrators, but the visit confirmed that stability is being achieved on that campus with the hope that it will be able to move forward on implementing change. While outside reports from agencies involved in the oversight of Compton CCD have found members of the staff unqualified in business operations, this assessment found that the implementation of the July 2, 2008 agreement has provided sufficient span of control over these operations to address this concern. **El Camino College meets this eligibility requirement.**

## 6. OPERATIONAL STATUS

Students at the main campus and Center enroll in a variety of courses that can lead to either a two-year degree, certificate of achievement/accomplishment in one of seventy-seven programs. The majority of courses are transferable, and the college strives to maintain a curriculum that is both comprehensive and balanced. **El Camino College meets this eligibility requirement.**

## 7. DEGREES

A Transfer Studies AA/AS Degree was adopted, but since the Board of Governors Title 5 revisions, this degree was revised into a certificate program. The General Studies degree was revised to meet the new conditions of Title 5 requiring students to major in a subject area with a minimum of 18 units. A significant number of the

students are enrolled in these degrees and certificates at the main campus and at the ECC Compton Center. **El Camino College meets this eligibility requirement.**

## **8. EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS**

The majority of El Camino College's offerings are in programs that either lead to an Associate in Arts or Associate in Science degree, as described in the college catalog. A significant number of students are enrolled in these courses. The catalog clearly indicates whether or not the courses are degree applicable and transferable to the UC and CSU. The curriculum offerings of El Camino College have been adopted by the Academic Senate at the ECC Compton Center. The ECC Compton Center faculty has been able to submit 2 programs and 24 courses previously offered at the Center for approval by the El Camino College Curriculum Committee. **El Camino College meets this eligibility requirement.**

## **9. ACADEMIC CREDIT**

Academic credit is based on Title 5, Section 55002.5. A unit is the value placed on three hours of a student's time per week in pursuit of educational goals. Students attending El Camino College find a wide array of degree and certificate programs in academic and vocational fields. These programs have sufficient content and length and maintain appropriate levels of quality and rigor for the degrees and certificates offered. Twenty-four educational courses for the ECC Compton Center were approved by the El Camino College Curriculum Committee. The ECC Compton faculty is represented on that committee. **El Camino College meets this eligibility requirement.**

## **10. STUDENT LEARNING ACHIEVEMENT**

The El Camino College office of Institutional Research collects and reports information about student success and retention for the college, its programs and courses, by division, department and section. This information is made available on the Institutional Research and Planning webpage of the college website. In addition, the college uses Cognos Data Cube Information software to archive information. The Information Technology Services Office generates the required MIS student information data reports to the state Chancellor's Office.

The college matriculation policies strongly encourage students to complete the matriculation process starting with application, assessment, orientation to college, and educational planning. The college offers courses in Academic Strategies and in Educational and Career Planning for all students. Progress is being made on the development of student learning outcomes which have been identified to some extent at the class, program and institutional level at El Camino College. More work is needed in this area to meet the level of sustainability on the ACCJC rubrics at the main

campus and the ECC Compton Center **Progress is being made toward meeting this eligibility requirement.**

## **11. GENERAL EDUCATION**

The general education curriculum promotes critical thinking and analytical skills, clear and precise expression, cultural and artistic sensitivity, personal growth, health, and self-understanding (Title 5, Section 55806). The courses approved for general education have the required breadth to promote intellectual inquiry. The quality and rigor of these courses are consistent with the academic standards appropriate to higher education. General Education is one area where El Camino College has established core competencies and student learning outcomes. **El Camino College meets this eligibility requirement.**

## **12. ACADEMIC FREEDOM**

El Camino College Board of Trustees approved Board Policy 4030 Academic Freedom at their August 21, 2006 meeting. The policy is available on the college website. This policy reflects the academic freedom rights of faculty and students. **El Camino College meets this eligibility requirement.**

## **13. FACULTY**

El Camino College has 333 full-time instructors and 572 part-time faculty members. The names, degrees, and year of hire of full-time faculty are listed in the college catalog. While information regarding part-time faculty is kept in the division offices, the names, degrees, and year of hire of the part-time faculty who have taught ten consecutive semesters are also published in the college catalog. The college lists faculty responsibilities in faculty handbooks and the Agreement between the El Camino College Federation of Teachers and the district.

The Compton Center employs 83 full-time faculty members and very few part-time faculty members. The El Camino College Compton Center Catalog also lists Compton faculty member names, degrees, and year of hire. The Compton Federation of Teachers represents Compton faculty members. **El Camino College meets this eligibility requirement.**

## **14. STUDENT SERVICES**

El Camino College acknowledges the importance of providing appropriate student support services and student development programs to facilitate student success for its diverse population on campus, at the Center, and as much as possible to online students.

Student Services Center provides a large array of services designed to assist students in achieving their academic and vocational goals including, but not limited to, Ad-

missions and Records, Counseling, Career Center, Transfer Center, Project Success, Puente, Outreach and School Relations, International Students Program, EOP&S/CARE, Career Placement Services, CalWORKs, Financial Aid, First Year Experience, Student Development, Veterans, and the Special Resources Center (DSP&S). The Special Resource Center is a model center, with state-of-the art facilities, to assist students with both physical and learning disabilities. These programs are for the most part replicated at the Compton Center. **El Camino College meets this eligibility requirement.**

## **15. ADMISSIONS**

Student information for El Camino and Compton students is collected and stored separately. Compton students are matriculated as El Camino students. The college's admissions policies are consistent with its mission and conform to guidelines outlined in state law and district policy. **El Camino College meets this eligibility requirement.**

## **16. INFORMATION AND LEARNING RESOURCES**

To support its mission El Camino College provides students and staff with access to information and learning resources. The library is open 67.5 hours per week, including Saturday, with many of the resources available off-campus through the internet. The Library Media Technology Center, located in the basement of the Schauerman Library provides student access to computer resources, including peripherals such as scanners and adaptive access tools, standard office software, and full Internet access.

The college developed a comprehensive technology plan to evaluate technology needs and a process to address them. The campus-networking system uses fiber optics to connect all major buildings (all classrooms, laboratories, and offices) on campus with high-speed connections to the wide area network.

The ECC Center students have access to the Library and Learning Resources Services at the center and the main campus and vice versa for main campus students wishing to use similar services at the Center. Library catalogs are not commingled, so students wishing to use both resources must register at each library. **El Camino College meets this eligibility requirement.**

## **17. FINANCIAL RESOURCES**

El Camino College receives funding from the State of California (through apportionment based on the number of full time equivalent students), local taxes, tuition, and income producing local programs. The college has successfully competed for additional funds and grants to support its mission and educational programs. The college carefully tracks and documents all income and expenditures. ECC maintains a minimum of five percent of the general fund budget as a reserve for contingencies.

Funding for the Compton Community College District is separate, guaranteed for three academic years, and will be adjusted according to FTES enrollment. The enabling legislation authorized a state loan for \$30 million for Compton's budget to be stabilized over a five year period. There is a structural deficit in the adopted budget that is stabilized by the state loan. El Camino College estimates that it may take up to five years to restore full enrollment at the Center. The current status of the Compton College CCD budget would not meet this eligibility requirement. However, the team considers this to be beyond the scope of our review and subject to the review of FCMAT and the Chancellors Office. **El Camino College meets this eligibility requirement.**

## **18. FINANCIAL ACCOUNTABILITY**

An independent firm audits the El Camino Community College District on an annual basis. The firm conducts the audit in accordance with generally excepted auditing standards and the standards applicable to financial audits contained in the Government Auditing Standards, issued by the Comptroller General of the United States. The firm prepares the audit for the Board of Trustees that notes findings, exceptions, and recommendations. Key personnel implement the findings and recommendations, as necessary.

Compton Community College District funding is separate from El Camino Community College District even though both utilize enterprise resource planning system (Datatel – Colleague). The integrity of each budget is kept separate by assigning different accounting codes to each site. The Vice President of Administrative Services works closely with the Special Trustee and the Provost to ensure the budgeting and accounting systems are working correctly. The enabling legislation requires the Compton Community College District to be reviewed every six months by Fiscal Crises and Management Assistance Team (FCMAT) to evaluate progress in the five operational areas of management: financial management; academic achievement; personnel management; facilities management; and governance/community relations. At the time of the visit, the Compton CCD had not closed its 2006 – 2007 books or completed the appropriate audits and therefore does not meet the eligibility requirement. However, at the time of the visiting team visit, the year ending 2007 books had been closed and the audit completed. Since this is a review of the accreditation status of El Camino College this finding is outside the scope of this review and is subject to the review of FCMAT. **El Camino College meets this eligibility requirement.**

## **19. INSTITUTIONAL PLANNING AND EVALUATION**

El Camino College has made considerable progress in this area since the 2002 accreditation team visit. The Planning and Budgeting Committee (PBC), a standing committee, is advisory to the President and meets every two weeks to review and endorse plans and the annual budget. The committee recently created an application



process that requires all applicants to submit a pre and post evaluation of any plan that is funded. The PBC is chaired by the Dean of Enrollment Services.

Planning and budgeting for the educational center coexists with El Camino where appropriate. In coordination with the Provost, Chief Business Officer, the Special Trustee, and the Vice President of Administrative Services oversee the Compton Community College District is adhering to the FCMAT standards.

The visiting team found that substantial progress has been made in developing the infrastructure and data system to support linkage of planning, program review, funding and evaluation. However, there are a significant number of programs that have never had program review through a mechanism that was just recently completed. The visiting team is concerned that the college constituencies complete the planned cycle and establish sustainability in this area. The ECC Compton Center either needs to subscribe to the El Camino College Educational master Plan or develop its own plan. The visiting team finds that ECC Compton Center does not meet this eligibility requirement and El Camino College substantially meets the requirement, but must complete the cycle and achieve sustainability in this eligibility requirement.

## **20. PUBLIC INFORMATION**

El Camino College reviews and publishes a printed and online catalog every academic year. The college catalog is accurate, current, and provides all of the information necessary for students and the public to learn about the college. The Director of Community Relations chairs a web oversight committee that includes all of the constituent groups to advise necessary changes on the website. **El Camino College meets this eligibility requirement.**

## **21. RELATIONS WITH THE ACCREDITING COMMISSION**

El Camino College is substantially in compliance with all of the Standards for Accreditation and maintains an active and positive relationship with the Commission and its officers. Throughout this process of evaluation to enter into the ECC Compton Center partnership, El Camino maintained close communication with the President of the Commission and staff members to ensure it proceeded correctly to understand the nature of Compton's deficiencies, deadlines, agreements made with the Commission and to seek guidance. This relationship continues through this process of writing the Substantive Change Report and it is expected El Camino will continue to seek guidance as the partnership proceeds. El Camino's long term goal is the re-accreditation of Compton College. **El Camino College meets this eligibility requirement.**

## **ADDRESSING ACCREDITATION THEMES**

### **Dialogue:**

The dialogue at El Camino Community College is valued and is deemed critical in the development and strengthening of both strategic plans and academic programs. When disagreement or dissent arises, it is handled with respect and approached with collegiality. All employees, regardless of title or location, are provided the opportunity to engage in open and honest dialogue designed to solicit feedback, improve the planning process, and enhance the programs and services the college provides. The complicated organizational and governance structures related to ECC Compton Center are well understood by key constituents and the formal partnership has caused self-reflection and intentional dialogue about institutional improvement at both campuses. As an unintended result of the partnership, a mutually beneficial exchange of ideas, rooted in collegiality and a genuine dedication to student learning, is now occurring throughout the institution, but particularly at the organization level among academic senates and collective bargaining units.

The El Camino Community College constituencies state they are committed to an inclusive dialogue and providing the opportunity to facilitate group learning, however, there are some areas warranting additional representation from the ECC Compton Center in institutional planning and curricular processes. The main campus constituency would be served well by full participation in dialogue activities particularly as they relate to the development of student learning outcomes.

### **Student Learning Outcomes:**

El Camino Community College has collaboratively created five core competencies that serve as Student Learning Outcomes at the certificate and degree levels which enhance the existing mission statement and demonstrate efforts to focus on student learning outcomes.

The college is engaged in the early development stage of Student Learning Outcomes at the course and program levels. There is evidence that constructive dialogue has occurred and existing organizational structures support developing SLOs, evident by both faculty contracts including SLOs as part of the evaluation process. However the college has not established an institutional framework for indentifying (consistent nomenclature), documenting (within syllabus or course of record), nor communicating SLOs to students. Moreover, the college has not yet developed assessment strategies for SLOs at the course, program, certificate, and degree levels in accordance with the standards.

Although the college has recognized the importance of moving forward with the identification and assessment of SLOs, establishing a heightened sense of urgency and creating a plan for development is needed to ensure SLOs become the basis for program evaluation and continuous improvement. While some courses, programs, degrees and certificates have SLOs developed to level three of the Commission rubric, it would be safe to say that

El Camino College is currently at level two. The campus would be served well to review the accomplishments in the SLOs in student services as a potential model for college implementation.

### **Institutional Commitments:**

Guided by El Camino College's recently (April, 2007) renewed mission, El Camino Community College provides ample evidence that its instructional programs and learning support focus on student learning. Integrated student services offer exceptional support toward the achievement of student's educational goals. The college's various committee structures, effective leadership at all levels and funding allocation process are all designed to serve the ultimate needs of students and to ensure that instructional programs are responsive to the needs of the college's diverse community.

### **Evaluation, Planning and Improvement:**

The college utilizes institutional research resulting in ample evidence of data collection through surveys, reports, and evaluations which inform institutional planning. The college reviews its mission statement on a regular basis, collects and analyzes student satisfaction data, and has developed plans to implement a community survey within the Compton Center's service area to inform marketing and student learning activities. All data is made publically accessible.

El Camino Community College has assessed their process for integrating planning and budgeting and as a result began transitioning this year to new planning software (*Plan Builder*) aimed to assist the college in achieving their stated goals and complying with previous recommendations. However, the visiting team noted the college has yet to provide evidence that it is making decisions regarding the improvement of institutional effectiveness in an ongoing and systematic cycle of evaluation, integrated planning, resource allocation, implementation, and reevaluation. The mechanisms are in place, but have not fully been implemented through a complete cycle.

Similarly, the college has made recent progress in regards to the Program Review process but is not yet operating at a proficient level in which program reviews inform the campus on progress toward the educational master plan. Some exemplary departments discussed and improved program effectiveness and the college has established a plan to review programs in the near future. Yet the Program Review process is not implemented regularly (some programs have not been reviewed since 1993), it is not institution-wide (there is a lack of inclusion of ECC Compton Center courses in the process), nor is there sufficient evidence of future timelines for continuous program review. While the infrastructure for tracking the planning, program review, budgeting, evaluation and continuous improvement provides a means at reaching the level of proficiency on the Commission planning rubric, the lack of completion of a full cycle leaves the planning rubric at level 2.

**Organization:**

The organizational structure of El Camino Community College District is designed to support and promote student learning and achieving their institutional mission. The planning committees are organized to address the broad instructional-related concerns of curriculum, budgeting, planning, student services, governance and many other important facets. The college's planning and Budget Committee, Academic Senate, and College Council, among others, provide broader constituencies an opportunity to participate in the decision making process and contribute to student learning.

The organizational processes are (on paper) designed to be inclusive, informational, and intentional in efforts to support and demonstrate the college's mission. However, additional efforts need to be made to ensure the faculty and classified staff, at large, is not only invited but participate in making institutional improvements. Aside from the designated faculty and staff leadership, the visiting team observed a lack of participation from these groups during our visit which was predominately attended by the administration. Conversely, the visiting team did observe the facilitation and inclusion of the ECC Compton Center throughout the communication and decision making structures.

**Institutional Integrity:**

El Camino Community College District is well known for the rigor of its courses, its highly professional staff, and its value to the community. An effective, efficient, participatory governance process contributes to this reputation along with honest and dedicated leadership.

The college provides the community and members of the college with clearly and accurately written publications, including a regularly published Presidential newsletter which provides transparency and increased dissemination of information. The college demands and enforces academic honesty on the part of students and faculty, although the evidence indicates inconsistency with announcing the implementation of said policy in course syllabi.

The self-study report does not adequately reflect the wide-spread evaluation and self-reflection that occurred as a result of the Compton partnership. The team observed this self-reflection was more prevalent than previously documented and the partnership was executed in a spirit of truthfulness, understanding, and fairness in dealings with students and employees.

## **STANDARD ONE: INSTITUTIONAL MISSION AND EFFECTIVENESS**

### **General Comments:**

The visiting team working with all Standards read the complete self study and prepared a report on their perceptions of the self study. The second assignment focused on specific standards and allowed the team to measure progress toward meeting the standard and validating information both electronically as supplied by the college and through source documents included in the team room. Discussions were held each day to assess progress by each standard and to determine areas where further validation would be necessary.

In August 2006, El Camino College agreed to establish the El Camino College Compton Center on the site of the former Compton College. Implementing an agreement as challenging as it is historic for the Community College system has compelled the faculty and staff to discharge their responsibilities for running the college and its new center while simultaneously engaging in the introspection and dialogue necessary to merge two culturally different organizations. Some might even observe that the introspection and dialogue carried out over these last 26 months far exceed the degree of introspection and dialogue that normally accompany the preparation of an accreditation self study. As stated at the open meetings held at El Camino College and Compton Center on October 8, 2008, faculty, staff and students affirm that the work begun two years ago has strengthened both of their organizations.

### **Findings and Evidence:**

Sixty representatives of the administration, faculty, staff, and students of El Camino College and Compton Center collaboratively reviewed and revised the mission statement at the two-day planning summit in April 2007. After extensive discussion the participants found themselves returning to the 2004 mission statement, “The Mission of El Camino College is to meet the educational needs of our diverse community and ensure student success by offering quality, comprehensive educational opportunities” and re-affirmed the validity of the organizational purpose described in the 2004 statement with main themes woven into the new mission statement for El Camino College and the Compton Center (I.A.1-3)

From an organizational perspective, the revised mission statement affirms that the partnership of El Camino College and Compton Center is based on a shared sense of organizational purpose. El Camino College and ECC Compton Center can point to what has been accomplished under the mission statement: for Compton Center, a partnership that has resulted in improved operations at Compton Center and acknowledgement at the Center of El Camino’s role in these improved operations; for El Camino College, an augmentation of its influence and contribution to the community because its geographic service area has expanded and made it a regional institution. (I.A.1)

On June 18, 2007, the mission statement was approved as part of the Strategic Plan 2007-2010 by the Board of Trustees at El Camino College and the Special Trustee at the Compton District and has been published in all major college publications, in the Board of Trustees agenda, and on the college website. Annual review by the constituencies and shared governance groups represented in the College Council ensure that the mission statement is sustained as a vital document of principle for El Camino College and the ECC Compton Center (I.A.2; I.A.3).

In the attempt to meet the recommendations made by visiting teams for previous accreditation cycles, the college has begun implementing a systematic process that tracks requests for funding new initiatives and recommendations from strategic planning to program review and budgeting. Based on the *Plan Builder* software, this systematic process includes a separate narrative attachment for describing the assessment of the outcomes resulting from funded projects. Recommendations and requests are entered into the *Plan Builder* application as unit plans, and these are reviewed and revised by division deans. Unit plans are then forwarded to the vice presidents for prioritization, after which the Planning and Budget Committee (PBC) reviews all the plans and makes recommendations for funding to the college president. This planning process is cyclical, with activity primarily occurring in the fall term. The PBC uses spring term for budget development. *It is important to note that the college changed the planning tool during the development of the self study and the full impact of the tool has not been applied to a planning cycle.* (I.B.1)

The college appears to have made efforts to provide training on outcomes assessment and SLO development, with active support from both administration and Academic Senate. The college's Assessment of Learning Committee (ALC) has taken a leadership role in the SLO development and outcomes assessment processes. However, several problems must be resolved before the college can be said to have moved from the development to the sustainability phase: the discussion about whether *objectives* are the same as *learning outcomes* must be resolved. Also, faculty must agree on how to communicate student learning outcomes to students, including, for example, whether SLOs should be included in course outlines and syllabi. (I.B.1)

The college has a clear set of core goals and objectives, and has recently adopted the use of college-wide indicators to measure the effectiveness of implemented plans. As with the new systematic process for linking planning to budget, the college-wide measures have not been in place long enough to show how well the selected measures will assess the college's progress toward its strategic goals. While there were holes in the completion of SLOs, for instance, there were also examples of programs that have completed a cycle through evaluation and have instituted changes to the program based on the evaluative data. (I.B.2.)

The college's decision-making process makes use of a wide range of data, much of it provided by the office of Institutional Research and publicly available on the IR website. As mentioned above, the planning process supported by *Plan Builder* appears to be

thoughtful, data driven, and systematic. Also, the college's planning process uses program review recommendations (when program reviews have been completed) to create unit plans, and the flow of the unit plans through the review and prioritization process leads to funding decisions made by the president. The college's assessment results are publicly available to all constituencies on the El Camino website. However, no systematic data collection method yet exists for SLO assessment results; where these results are collected they are not widely communicated. Further, the process should be used at the ECC Compton Center as well as at the Torrance campus. (I.B.3; I.B.4; I.B.5)

Some evidence that the college is moving forward in its effort to evaluate its planning and allocation processes and makes modifications as a result of that evaluation is seen in the recent conversion from *Q-Builder* planning software to a word document to *Plan Builder* to track program review recommendations as unit plans that become an integral part of the college's planning and budget process. Nevertheless, the challenge remains for the college to demonstrate its consistent and systematic assessment both of its planning processes and of the results of the decisions resulting from the planning cycle. (I.B.6)

The visiting team finds three situations that contradict the college's assertion that it meets this standard. The college appears not to have completed a full cycle of program reviews: some programs have not completed a review since the early to mid-1990s, and some programs have apparently never completed a review. Further, no evidence of a systematic, formal evaluation of the program review process exists, although it was changed at the beginning of this year to simplify the self-study and to add Student Learning Outcomes (SLOs). Finally, the SLO assessments are currently under development and in most cases have not reached the evaluation phase. (I.B.7)

### **Conclusions:**

The college has provided evidence to show full inclusion on the process used to develop a mission statement that reflects the broader college community resulting from its agreement to operate the ECC Compton Center.

The administrative leadership, faculty, and staff are to be commended for following through on the achievement of the April 2007 planning summit. In spite of the many difficulties inherent in establishing the ECC Compton Center site as a center of El Camino College, the extraordinary effort of all constituencies has produced a collegial partnership that has strengthened both the college and its center. The college meets Standard IA.

The visiting team did not find sustained improvement in El Camino Colleges effort to address the recommendation on planning, program review, budgeting and continuous improvement from the 2002 visit. While an extensive effort has been applied to developing a new infrastructure and planning tool *Plan Builder*, the evidence revealed that the college needs to move strongly to closing-the-loop" in its planning cycle to reach the sustainability level currently expected in the standard. The college does not fully meet Standard IB.

## **Recommendations**

1. As cited in previous (1990, 1996, and 2002) accreditation recommendations the college should complete the full implementation of its process for tracking planning, program review, budgeting, and evaluation process and complete the cycle to assure that all the departments and sites (including the ECC Compton Center) of the college participate in the program review process, and that the results of program review clearly link to institutional planning and the allocation of resources. (I.B.3; I.B.3; II.A.2.e., II.A.2.f; III.B.1; III.B.1.a; III.B.2.a; III.b.2.b)



## **STANDARD TWO: STUDENT LEARNING AND SUPPORT**

### **General Comments:**

El Camino College faculty and staff involved in the instructional program take pride in the learning opportunities they create for their students. There is commitment to the pursuit of quality instruction--particularly evidenced by their curriculum development and recently developed review processes--that speaks to their determination to provide their students with the best services they can.

In addition, the difficult tasks of integrating the part of the curriculum that came with the ECC Compton Center posed challenges to the faculty in both locations. It is clear from the interviews conducted by the team that staff from both sites feels they have gained from the partnership, and the willingness of the two staffs to work together speaks eloquently to their professionalism and shared sense of dedication to the students in the communities they serve.

The college constituencies have worked during the last year to design and implement the infrastructure and tools for the development of a workable program review model and initiating the development and assessment of student learning outcomes (SLOs). Despite the college staff's considerable dialogue and effort, the assessment and publication of student learning outcomes is essentially still at the beginning of the development level.

In addition, the newest model of program review exhibits a disconnect between the program review and curriculum review timelines. In many respects the team's review of the El Camino College curriculum indicates that it meet the standards including achieving the College's mission, use of appropriate delivery modes, inclusion of general education requirements in degree programs, attainment of licensure standards for vocational programs, and publishing of policies and practices governing transfer of credit, catalog rights, academic freedom and student honesty. However, a review of the course outline review revealed that approximately 25 percent of the offerings have not been reviewed by the college in more than ten years.

The faculty at the ECC Compton Center has been included in the curriculum committee and has now fully integrated the El Camino College curriculum at that site. In addition twenty-four courses have been adopted from the former Compton College curriculum by both academic senates and curriculum committees. In spite of intentions to link those efforts, the large numbers of programs that have not yet completed a full cycle of program review indicate that the college is not yet at the "sustainable continuous quality improvement" level of program review

### **Findings and Evidence:**

The visiting teams found evidence that the El Camino College instructional programs meet the mission of the college and upholds its integrity and thus meet this element of the

standard. The recently modified curriculum review process includes documentation on how the course will fit in the current program and meet the college's mission and goals. El Camino College has the capability to demonstrate the integrity of its academic offerings through a thorough curriculum review process, articulation with transfer institutions, and compliance with outside accreditation agencies for specific programs provided this new model is fully implemented.

Curriculum is reviewed and approved by the College Curriculum Committee. All instructional programs are to be assessed for currency on a six-year cycle of course reviews. The process for the course review (from a design perspective) is very robust, detailed and quality oriented, as evidenced by the course outlines of record. However, interviews with Academic Affairs, faculty, and deans and review of curriculum review charts indicate that the process is not consistent in meeting the proposed timeline. In some cases ten years was cited as the standard timeline, which raises significant concerns about how the college assures the currency of its curricular offerings. (II.2.A.1.b; II.A.2.e.)

El Camino College is clearly committed to utilizing data to meet the varied student needs. A review of the college's institutional research included comparisons of data on students on the main campus and at the ECC Compton Center in the college's Fact Book. The new Program Review format (implemented fall 2008) for Academic Affairs contains standard data sets, optional demographic profile of students, and degree and certificate awards. The goal of this data is to provide a complete understanding of the success and challenges which the program/department faces regarding student success and retention.

The inclusion of the CC Compton Center in the Program Review process is still developing. Part of the difficulty is the time taken to address the constraints acquired between the two faculties at the time the MOU was put in place. Fortunately, the visiting team finds that faculty on both sites have embraced the intent of the Agreement and now future attention can be given to integrating the ECC Compton Center faculty into the curriculum and program review process. (II.A.1.a)

El Camino College utilizes a variety of delivery systems and modes of instruction including face-to-face mode, hybrid or entirely online offerings, telecourses, and two-way interactive video courses. The approval process is the same for ECC Compton Center courses. Currently, there are 133 online courses, 16 telecourses, and one two way interactive video course approved. Although the approval process for distance education is very thorough, the review of distance education curriculum showed that approval does not appear to be consistent with the changes being made to on-campus curriculum review process and the program review process.

The Distance Education Advisory Committee (DEAC) verified that faculty members are required to be trained on distance education delivery prior to teaching a distance education course. DEAC confirmed that students taking distance education courses have access to online registration, online counseling, and online library and resource materials. Faculty members who teach online use the same course outline of record as the face-to-

face courses. When present, Student Learning Outcomes are also the same. The review of approved distance courses and general education requirements for Option 1 of the A.A. and A.S. degrees verified that those requirements could be completed via distance education. With the addition of three or more distance education courses in various programs, a student could complete over 50% of a degree online. (II.A.7)

The team examined a sample of six distance education courses in detail. Three of the six courses described the instructor's academic integrity policy in a fashion consistent with the college's adopted policy on academic integrity while two described course standards apparently at odds with the college's adopted policy. One made no mention of the policy. (II.A.7)

In the class section reviewed, students received a course syllabus that specifies learning objectives consistent with those in the institution's officially approved course outline, two of the classes observed described "goals," one described "objectives," one described "outcomes" and two were silent on the issue. (II.A.6)

Of most concern, however, is the question of whether the content of these online courses is at the same level of quality as face to face classes. Students interviewed by visiting team members had very high praise of the quality of instruction they received in their classes at El Camino College and it was not clear that the course content of online classes were at that standard.

Since it appears that El Camino College will need to apply for a substantive change request as a result of crossing the threshold whereby students can complete 50% or more of a degree online, it would be wise for El Camino College to evaluate whether the adoption of Etudes has led to a decline in quality of online courses and whether online courses achieve the same level of quality as face to face courses at El Camino College. (II.A.1.b; II.A.2; II.A.2.a.2)

The faculties of El Camino College have embraced the need to identify and assess SLOs for courses, programs, certificates and degrees and using the results for improvement. Five Core Competencies, which replaced the Institutional Learning Objectives, are required for students completing their course of study at El Camino College. Assessments are yet to be determined for the Core Competencies. These Core Competencies are to serve as the framework under which program-level and course-level SLOs and assessments are organized. This initiative is led by three SLO coordinators and the Assessment of Learning Committee at the Torrance site. However, ECC Compton Center faculty has limited involvement in the creation of SLOs at this time. El Camino College implementation of SLOs is in the beginning of the development stage. Timelines are identified for further development and assessment. What is not clear to the visiting team is how the effective communication of SLOs to the students will be accomplished. (II.A.1.c)

There is evidence in the documents provided to the visiting team and in the interviews it conducted with college staff that El Camino College assures the quality and improvement of the *modes* of instruction offered in its name. The El Camino College Curriculum

Handbook gives useful direction for the design and review of courses and programs. Faculty clearly have been active in the as-yet uncompleted process of determining student learning outcomes at the course, program, degree and certificate level. The team heard comments about the positive outcomes of the SLO development process that indicated that in many cases the process strengthened dialogue about instructional strategies and assessments. (II.A.2.a)

Examination of team room documents and interviews with college staff affirm that there is a well-developed model for curriculum review process and what appears to be a commitment to more regular and scheduled curriculum review as evidenced by the existence of a master list of course review. While there is no specific mention in the self study of advisory committees in the development of courses and programs, there is evidence in the existence of an annual advisory committee dinner and in the testimony of college staff that the college makes use of advisory committees when that is appropriate. (II.A.2.e.)

While still in its early stages, there is evidence (in the template and in the testimony from staff about the template) that the updated program review model will provide good information in respect to the breadth, rigor and sequencing of the instruction offered. These findings are complicated by the fact that the process and infrastructure for program review, including the implementation of CurricUNET have been developed in the last academic year and the CurricUNET software is just now being installed. This may explain why the current cycle for program review exceeds in many cases that of the expected four-year program review cycle for most courses and the two year cycle for career technical programs. (II.A.2; II.A.2.a; II.A.2.b; II.2.A.2.c; II.2.A.2.d; II.A.2.e)

It is important to note that despite strong efforts in dialogue and discussion about the processes involved, the newest program review model was just introduced, and it was difficult to determine if the faculty at the ECC Compton Center is involved in the completion of program reviews. Part of this state of events is that the ECC Compton Center faculty was required to adopt the El Camino College curriculum. It took some time before the dialogue and integration of efforts between the two faculties took place. Now that integration provides the capability to include the ECC Compton Center faculty in future program review. In completing this transition, the ECC Compton Center faculty was successful in incorporating twenty-four courses through the curriculum review process at both campuses.

When asked to assess the level of development of program review at El Camino College, some college staff involved with the development of the current program review model indicated that the program review process is at the “proficiency” level of the Commission’s rubric, not the sustainability level expected on program review by the Commission. Thus the team believes that while progress has been made in respect to program review at the college, the institution still has significant work yet to perform in the area of program review, including the completion of all program reviews to reach the sustainability level. (II.2.A.e, II.2.A.f)

It is important to note that the college awards course credit based on the achievement of “course objectives.” The Academic Senate at El Camino College has indicated it will not place SLOs in the course outlines at least until the new Curricunet course/curriculum management system is in place. The visiting team has a great deal of concern about the progress being made to reach the level of sustainability on the Commission rubric for SLOs. There is significant progress to be made to reach the expected level by 2012 and the current development of SLOs at any level are not consistently communicated to students or to the college community in its publication of its syllabi, course outlines or catalogs. In discussion with the faculty at the ECC Compton Center it was found that the development of SLOs was proceeding and being integrated into course outlines. However, that work was lost when the ECC Compton Center adopted the El Camino College curriculum. (II.2.A.2.g; II.2.A.2.h; II.2.A.2.i)

El Camino College recognizes the need to provide a multidimensional, multicultural, and integrative general education curriculum, as the core of the associate degree. This is stated in Board Policy 4025 and in the 2008-2009 El Camino College Catalog. General education criteria for an Associate in Arts and Associate in Science degrees include six areas: Natural Sciences, Social and Behavioral Sciences, Humanities, Language and Rationality (English Composition and Communication and Analytical Thinking), Health and Physical Education, and Mathematics Competency. General education courses are recommended by faculty members from the discipline and approved by the College Curriculum Committee following criteria described in broad terms reflecting student learning. (II.A.3.a)

Based on the impression that it is the intent that the Core Competencies adopted by the campus encompass the general education requirements, the basic competencies expected of accredited institutions under the Commission are met. While the competencies are comprehensive, the visiting team feels the College may want to review its efforts to address computer literacy as part of these requirements. (II.A.3.b)

El Camino College’s Philosophy for Associate Degree and General Education, Board Policy 4025, states, “The College, through the awarding of an associate degree, strives to create an environment which stimulates greater individual creativity and achievement, personal and social responsibility, as well as ethical and technological awareness.” The requirements in Social and Behavioral Sciences and Humanities provide opportunities to broaden students’ awareness of society, culture, history and values. (II.A.3.c)

The team verified by examining the college catalog that El Camino College offers a broad array of associate in arts and associate in science degrees each of which consists of focused study in at least one area of inquiry (or “major”) or in an established interdisciplinary core. (II.A.4)

The self study lists five vocational programs offered by the college requiring certification by external agencies. Other than the five programs requiring external certification, the Self-Study does not list other vocational programs and certificates; however, the college catalog lists numerous associate of arts degrees and certificates of achievement with

course requirements. The College does not collect post-graduation information about job placement of El Camino students but states in a Planning Agenda that it will compile aggregate placement data of graduates in vocational fields offered by the college (II.A.5).

The catalog contains full course requirement information for each degree and certificate program; however, course SLOs do not appear in the catalog either directly or by reference to another document. Moreover, the self study acknowledges that the majority of course syllabi do not list student learning outcomes, since faculty are still learning how to develop and use them. The self study states that a syllabus template was developed (by ECC Compton Center faculty) in spring 2008, and is to be reviewed by El Camino faculty in fall 2008, but the team could not verify that such a template was developed and reviewed. The team verified that the course outline template has no provision for student learning outcomes. The team's conclusion is that the college lacks an effective means to communicate information to students about student learning outcomes (II.A.6).

Team members verified current articulation agreements between El Camino and several CSU and UC campuses on ASSIST. The College does not have a degree audit system in place, but has presented its intention to do so in a Planning Agenda. The team verified by meeting with the articulation officer that the college compares incoming transfer courses with its own courses primarily on the basis of course content, or by student learning outcomes when such outcomes are part of the course outline of both the sending institution and El Camino College. The team verified with the articulation officer that course outlines are reviewed by UC, CSU and UC transfer officials to determine the transferability of such courses for UC, CSU-GE and IGETC. The team verified that El Camino has a Board of Trustees' policy on catalog rights, which is published in the College Catalog. In addition, the team was able to establish that the Public Relations and Marketing Office publishes the Communications Guide & Publications Standards booklet to help ensure that the College represents itself accurately and with integrity in all its publications and statements (II.A.6.a; II.A.6.b; II.A.6.c)

The team verified that El Camino has a policy approved by the Academic Senate and Board of Trustees governing academic freedom and is published in the College Catalog. The team verified that the college has a Board of Trustees' policy (Standards of Student Conduct, Board Policy 5500) regarding student academic dishonesty and its consequences, and that such policy is published in the college catalog. (II.A.7.a; II.A.7.b; II.B.2.a)

### **Conclusions:**

El Camino's instructional programs, with a few exceptions meet the standards listed in section II.A. Instructional Programs, including achieving the College's mission, use of appropriate delivery modes, inclusion of general education requirements in degree programs, attainment of licensure standards for vocational programs, and publishing of policies and practices governing transfer of credit, catalog rights, academic freedom and student honesty. There are concerns, however, about the college's progress in evaluating the quality and effectiveness of courses, programs and degrees because of the state of its

program review process (including its curriculum review timelines) and its current level of performance in establishing and assessing student learning outcomes and implementing improvements resulting from assessments. If the team were to identify progress on the program review rubric it would be between developmental and proficiency.

Given the intent and wording of Standard II.A and its sub-standards, the college should undertake several actions to attend to deficiencies. First, the college should continue its efforts to establish and assess student learning outcomes at all required levels, and to implement improvements resulting from those assessments. While the visiting team was impressed with the dialogue taking place and the development of structure, and experimentation, the current state of the development of SLOs is such that the team feels that the college must complete the full development and publication of a *college-wide* timeline for achieving the “proficiency” level of SLO development by 2012.

In addition, the college still falls short of completing a program review process that is implemented college wide, inclusive of the Compton Center programs and tied to curriculum review. The team is concerned that the program review process, in its latest iteration, is so new that the team cannot affirm that the program review process at El Camino college has reached the status of “Sustainable Continuous Quality Improvement” as defined in the *ACCJC Rubric for Evaluating Institutional Effectiveness—Part I: Program Review*.

### **Recommendations:**

2. The college should immediately define and publish a timeline in respect to how it will develop and implement student learning outcomes at the course, program and degree levels, establish systems to assess student learning outcomes and use the results of such assessments to make improvements in the delivery of student learning, to ensure that the College shall attain, by 2012, the level of Proficiency in the *ACCJC Rubric for Evaluating Institutional Effectiveness—Part III: Student Learning Outcomes*. The college should immediately implement processes to communicate to students expected student learning outcomes in course outlines, course syllabi, college catalog and/or other effective channels (II.A.1.a; II.A.1.c; II.A.2.a-b; II.A.2.f; II.A.6)
3. The college should revise its curriculum review processes and cycles so that all curriculum across the college is reviewed consistently, that the cycle of review assures the currency of the curriculum, and that the curriculum review and program review processes are integrated so that an important element of program review (the determination that program curriculum needs revision, addition or deletion to remain current) will be part of the actual program review process. (II.A.2; II.A.2.a; II.A.2.b; II.2.A.2.c; II.2.A.2.d; II.A.2.e)
4. The college needs to assure that online courses and programs are consistent in meeting the same level of rigor as on campus programs, that all services avail-

able on campus are available online, that student learning outcomes are incorporated into these offerings and that this information is clearly communicated to students taking these courses. (II.A.1.b; II.A.2.; II.A.2.a.2; II.A.6; II.A.7)

## **STANDARD II.B: STUDENT SUPPORT SERVICES**

### **General Comments:**

The college serves a diverse population of nearly 30,000 students at the main campus in Torrance and at the ECC Compton Center. The student services faculty recognizes the value of partnerships with academic affairs as key to the improvement of student support services. The counselors regularly promote their activities to students through classroom visits and offer informational workshops to faculty to build awareness of support programs and services. Student Services works closely with the Institutional Research office in gathering data for program assessment to meet the college's goal of retention and student success.

There is a very clear commitment to providing, as soon as practicable, the same level of service to students at the ECC Compton Center as is already available at the Torrance campus. In order to effectively implement the 2006 agreement, training for ECC Compton Center counseling and classified staff members on ECC forms, counseling software, and procedures was provided in order to blend services. Student support program administrators expressed to the visiting team a strong desire to improve student services through continued collaborative partnerships. An example of an improvement in services which resulted after the 2006 agreement was the implementation of telephone and web registration which was not previously available to ECC Compton Center students.

Student support programs are engaged in ongoing evaluation of data to improve student services. Faculty and staff clearly strive for improvement through creative use of their resources, teamwork, and focus on developing activities and services that draw more students into their offices and centers for service. Faculties have made steady progress and participate in ongoing conversations around student learning outcomes and program review. In a meeting with team members, ECC student organization leaders enthusiastically described student support services as a close network where students are referred to appropriate services through their affiliation with their individual program counselors. They spoke highly of the dedication of ECC faculty who encouraged their academic success and growth as learners. Along with other students approached by team members at activities during the team visit, students expressed great satisfaction with the quality of the student experience at the college.

### **Findings and Evidence**

Since the last report, Student and Community Advancement has developed a systematic process and timeline for the completion of program reviews. All student support program



reviews were completed as of September 2008. Program requests are prioritized at the Deans' level and submitted to the Vice President of Student and Community Advancement who makes data-driven decisions on program allocations. Annual program plans recommended for funding are entered into *Plan Builder* to be reviewed by the Planning and Budget Committee for consideration of supplemental campus funding sources. The program review documents adopt a variety of metrics to identify and evaluate institutional success at providing services that support student success. These documents include a blend of qualitative and quantitative information. Virtually all include evaluation of data that have the potential to improve unit effectiveness. There is consistent discussion of the human, facilities, and technical resources necessary to provide minimal service levels as well as the enhancements that would support improved levels of service and student outcomes. The support provided by the Institutional Research office clearly has improved the level of data available for planning. (II.B; II.B.1)

The program review for First Year Experience/Learning Communities is especially rich in providing longitudinal qualitative and quantitative data and might serve as a model for other units in seeking to refine and improve their program review documents. Many, though not all, student support program review documents identify student learning outcomes. Consistent with other areas at El Camino College, faculty make frequent use of student surveys to canvas student views of the quality of the services they receive, and that data is included in several surveys followed by discussion of how student needs can be better met. (II.B)

In reviewing reports and planning documents, there is evidence that student support programs are committed to the use of a variety of data for demonstrating program effectiveness. There is clearly a "culture and practice that supports continuous improvement." The self study describes a fall 2006 "Zen of SLOs" event as "a pivotal moment" and it appears that this event was effective in providing faculty and staff an understanding of how self-conscious attention to the use of evidence for planning can lead to improved program services and increased student success. (II.B.3.b)

Recent surveys and data-gathering efforts include the spring 2006 Opinion Survey on college services, programs and campus environment which was repeated in spring 2008 and will serve as a baseline for future improvements. The 2006 survey indicated library and learning support, computer support, financial aid, counseling, and tutoring as most satisfactory in that order with plans to incorporate CCSSE survey data as a follow up to the initial survey. An October 2005 community survey was conducted that measured satisfaction as well as demographic changes in the community. That survey reflected growth in specific target populations which provided data for program improvements affecting the matriculation process. Regularly gathered data on student educational goals since 2003 revealed in spring 2006, an 11.8% increase in transfer as a goal and a 9.4% decrease in undecided majors after students received matriculation services. The results of the 2008 CCSSE national survey which replaces the ACT Student Opinion Survey done in 2006 have been received by the college and will be integrated into planning activities. (II.B.3.c and d)

In response to data indicating forty-one percent of ECC students listing transfer as their primary educational goal and thirty-five percent of students are listed as undeclared majors, the Career and Transfer Centers have taken steps to assist a large number of college students with targeted activities. With the goal of increasing the number of declared majors, the college offers career and transfer related events and services attracting large numbers of students enrolled in both day and evening classes at both sites. Follow-up data on students declaring a major and transfer rates to colleges and universities, provided through Institutional Research, build a culture of responsibility for addressing strengths and weaknesses within the transfer program that will be incorporated into learning outcomes assessment. (II.B.1)

At the time of the visit, five programs have completed a process of student learning outcomes assessment and reflection with the results being used to identify strengths, weakness, or gaps in performance. SLO Summits which include ECC Compton Center faculty have been offered since January 2008. These provide opportunities for dialogue and needed training from campus SLO leaders. The timeline for the development of SLOs at the Compton Center is fall 2008-2011. A counselor serves as one of the coordinators on the Assessment Learning Committee (ALC) and provides leadership in this area. On site discussions with faculty and administrators as well as review of reports, agendas and minutes indicate the beginning of ongoing dialogue for interpreting evidence of student learning outcomes. (II.B.4)

The college's concern for increased integration of student services and academic programs to support students resulted in the grouping of 25 student support programs together under the acronym SSTARS, which stands for "Student Success Transfer and Retention Services." This program provides evidence of the active collaboration among student services and academic affairs units and within its community. SSTARS supports ECC's mission "to offer quality comprehensive educational programs and services to ensure educational success of students from our diverse community." The results of an idea originating from a 2003 counselor focus group, the program currently supports students with book scholarships through an annual fundraising event in the community that is attended and supported by four year transfer institutions and community partners. (II.B.1; II.B.3.d.)

The college provides a commendably broad range of services and targeted programs designed to meet the identified needs of a wide range of student populations. A notable example is the First Year Experience program which had its origins in institutional analysis of success rates for Hispanic students, which led in turn to the college's application for a Title V grant. That grant was awarded and supported the establishment of the program from 2000-2005, after which the college provided \$80,000 for the 2005-06 academic year. This history is notable because it demonstrates the college's (1) attentiveness to student success data disaggregated by ethnicity, (2) initiative in seeking grant funding to establish new programs, and (3) willingness to sustain the program once it was established and had exhausted its grant funding. As students approach the conclusion of their eligibility for the First Year Experience program, there are curricular connections to the Honors Transfer Program to transition students to another program that combines instruc-

tional and student support services to promote student success. The First Year Experience program is slated for replication at the ECC Compton Center in 2009-10. (II.B3.a,c and d.)

Based on meetings and interviews, the college emphasizes student clubs as an extracurricular learning opportunity that supports the full development of student capacities. The various student support programs, based on cohort and the fabric of instruction at El Camino bring students from diverse backgrounds together. Staff and students describe El Camino College as an institution where both staff and student diversity is grounds for unselfconscious celebration. Students described the opportunities for extracurricular involvement as abundant. (III.B.3.b-d)

Assessment of placement instruments is current on the Torrance campus with revalidation slated to next take place in 2009. Test validations are not current at the ECC Compton Center and a validation study will begin in spring 2009. Both sites use Accuplacer for reading, English composition, and mathematics placement testing, and The College Board, the test provider, conducts extensive testing to assure institutions that the instrument is without test bias. (II.B.3.e)

Separate catalogs and class schedules that clearly delineate locations of classes at both campus locations are printed annually and made available to students. The catalogs are also found on the college website, [www.elcamino.edu](http://www.elcamino.edu). The mission, philosophy, values, and guiding principles are found in print and on the website. Student policies, academic regulations, transfer credits, grievance and complaint procedures are found in print and on the web. Students are also able to access pertinent college information on a webpage that displays answers to key questions most frequently asked of counselors. The college provides a student handbook which contains information on the student code of conduct and directory information to college services. The schedule of classes both in print and online provides clearly stated information on course offerings and prerequisite information. (II.B.2.a-d)

Evidence was provided that indicates the college reviews and tracks student complaints and formal grievances. (II.B.2.d)

Admissions and records offices at both sites provide for secure backup of files with the majority of student records centralized at the Torrance campus. Student records are stored in a locked records vault to which no students have access. Paper documents are routinely shredded once they have been electronically captured and electronic records are backed-up and stored off-site on a regular basis. (II.B.3.f)

### **Conclusions:**

The college meets this standard. The college offers a broad and a well-conceived range of student support programs that retain and engage the student through their college experience. However, program review reports range in the levels and variety of data ele-

ments reported. A few programs included survey results, student contact numbers, persistence rates, course completion rates, student progression rates within in a course sequence, and faculty development activities. Other documents revealed that data analysis was limited to results of opinion surveys designed for these purposes. The college's movement toward a nationally-benchmarked survey such as CCSSE will increase the availability of data for analysis and strengthening of program services. Also, with the extensive use of surveys, it would benefit student support service faculty and staff to receive training on both the good and legitimate use of surveys as well as a broader range of other methods of measuring the effectiveness of student support services.

The college has taken positive steps to develop a process for student learning outcomes assessment for student support programs. The team suggests that the college continue to place a high priority on integrating assessment of student learning outcomes into the student services program review process and use the results for program improvement in alignment with the mission and values of the college. The team also suggests that the college provide students within support program cohort's information about student learning outcomes and the program's performance relative to the stated outcomes.

The college is to be commended for the extraordinary comprehensiveness of the services offered at the Torrance campus and the smaller array of services currently available at the ECC Compton Center which are expected to provide students with more efficient access to services after being renovated this year.

**Recommendations:**

None.

**STANDARD IIC: LIBRARY AND LEARNING SUPPORT SERVICES**

**General Comments:**

The El Camino College Learning Resource Unit including the ECC Compton Center Library and Learning Resource Center support student learning and contributes to student success. The Learning Resource Unit on the El Camino Campus houses the Schauerman Library, Music Library, Learning Resources Center, and the Media Services department. Within the Learning Resource Center on the El Camino Campus the Tutorial Program, the Basic Skills Study Center, and the Library Media Technology Center provide students with assistance and support that enables their academic success. The Schauerman Library also houses the distance education support center and media services which are dedicated to ensuring student and faculty success via technology mediated and online instruction. The ECC Compton Center Library and Learning Resources Center provides support to students, faculty, and staff through its special resource center, Humanities Writing Center, Math Tutoring Center, and computer labs.

A bond issue passed by the citizens of the Compton CCD was used to build a new state-of-the-art Library and Learning Resource Center. Unfortunately, the facility is not useable due to structural defects that may take another year to correct. The former library is still being used and services are now provided in several locations on the campus. While efforts have been extended to bring the technology access up to the level of the Torrance campus that is a project in progress.

There is evidence that communication and collaboration is practiced between El Camino and the ECC Compton Center Libraries and Learning Resource Centers. The ECC Compton Center Library has been under the supervision of El Camino's Learning Resource Unit since October 2006. However, greater oversight and assistance is needed at the ECC Compton Center with basic library operations and in coordination with the eventual move into in the new Learning Resources facility.

As with other transitional activities between the Torrance campus and the ECC Compton Center, library and learning resources have been working out quirks in services to students. El Camino College is to be commended for its effort to give students in the Compton service area full access to library and learning resources. Currently the catalog systems are different on the two sites and the Torrance students do not have the same access to ECC Compton Center resources that the Compton students have to the El Camino resources.

### **Findings and Evidence:**

The El Camino Library has been innovative in supporting the learning resources needs of distance education students by implementing the Ask-A-Librarian online reference service and establishing electronic reserves. However, to assist in the further development and practice of electronic reserves, the college needs to develop a policy on copyright. (II.C.1)

Instructional programs are supported by the library's book collection, periodicals, videos/DVDs, and electronic databases and enable students to be successful in their academic pursuits. Through the Humanities Division the library offers two one-unit fully transferable courses covering the components of information competency. In addition, the Library has taken a lead on campus in advocating for Information Competency as a graduation requirement. (II.C.1.; II.C.1.b)

The visiting team was impressed with many innovations and partnerships the library has made. Despite limited resources and staffing the library launched an Ask-A-Librarian online reference service in 2004, established electronic reserves, and negotiated use agreements with CSU, Dominguez Hills, and CSU, Long Beach for El Camino College students. The team was further impressed with the proactive role the Learning Resource Unit has taken with the development and assessment of Student Learning Outcomes. In an effort to communicate their SLOs to students the library has placed their SLOs on posters through the library and in various learning support rooms and labs. (II.C.1.c;

#### II.C.1.e)

While on campus, the team noted progress on SLOs within the Learning Resource Unit. The library has a representative on the SLO Campus Steering Committee and has identified and measured program and service level SLOs. In particular, a program level SLO addressing information competency was assessed in spring 2007 through the use of a pre and post-test in eight library orientation sessions. The results of this assessment have been evaluated and bibliographic instruction is being refined as a result. (II.C.2)

In addition, the team noted on both campuses the Learning Centers' commitment to assisting the learning needs of students. For example, the Learning Centers on both sites have licenses for the Plato and New Century software systems to assist students with basic skills deficiencies in reading and math. (II.1.a)

Currently, the El Camino College library and the library at ECC Compton Center are utilizing different library catalogs and have subscriptions to different electronic databases. Access to El Camino College library resources is available to student at the ECC Compton Center through "myECC." However, the same access to library resources at the ECC Compton Center is not available to students from the Torrance campus.

#### **Conclusions:**

The college meets this standard. As noted, the El Camino College Learning Resource Unit including the ECC Compton Center Library and Learning Resource Center has been innovative and responsive in supporting student learning and contributing to student success. As the college moves forward and the new Learning Resources facility comes on-line at the ECC Compton Center continued collaboration and integration of services will be required to providing ongoing access to library resources.

El Camino College's Learning Resource Unit has also made great strides in implementing student learning outcomes. However, greater dialogue is necessary in the integration of SLOs between the Learning Resource centers on both campuses. Furthermore, since Learning Resources is currently conducting its first formal program review, the use of program data in combination with SLOs assessment results will be necessary to move Learning Resources to a higher level of implementation to ensure sustainable continuous quality improvement.

The ECC Compton Center's new Learning Resource facility needs to continue to develop protocols to ensure the safety and effective maintenance of the new library building so services in the existing facility can be moved. This new facility will assist the ECC Compton Center in providing the appropriate resources and services necessary for its growing student populations.

In order to ensure comparable and universal access to library services for El Camino College students regardless of location, the libraries on both campuses need to continue to integrate their library systems (i.e. catalogs and databases). In addition, the program re-

view process may need to address a sound case for appropriate and sustainable funding needs to be secured to ensure that library resources are sufficient in quantity, currency, depth, and variety.

**Recommendations:**

None.

## **STANDARD THREE: RESOURCES**

### **Standard A – Human Resources**

#### **General Comments:**

Standard III provided particular challenge to the visiting team because of the complication of the memorandum of understanding (MOU) created by the loss of accreditation by the Compton CCD, the appointment of a Special Trustee by the California Community College System Office, the passage of AB 318 by the California Legislature and the subsequent agreement where El Camino CCD has agreed to offer community college programs on the Compton CCD site as an educational center.

As it relates to human resources there is a further complication because the legislation retained Compton CCD as a legal governmental agency and maintains fiscal and legal responsibility for the employees of the former district. El Camino College offers educational services at this site, but the faculty and staff are paid through resources allocated through AB 318 and apportionment collected by the attendance of students at that site and awarded to Compton Community College District. From a managerial standpoint the faculty and staff retain their collective bargaining units and negotiate with the Special Trustee. The Academic Senate is also retained. All of this complicated organization is jointly operated based on the MOU between El Camino College and the Special Trustee. A Provost was appointed by both the El Camino College Board of Trustees and the Special Trustee of Compton CCD with joint reporting relationships.

From a human resources perspective the relationships described above were contentious from the approval of the MOU in August of 2006 by the two parties and adopted by the ACCJC through a substantive change in the same year. The first year of the agreement resulted in slow progress getting the two organizations to work together. Fortunately, the visiting team found an extensive change in this relationship at the time of the visit and can report that the parties have accepted the terms of the agreement. Extensive changes have occurred in working relationships among the faculties and staff and there is an evident commitment to make the MOU work.

Progress is being made in negotiating issues such as faculty evaluation, staff development, and actions on areas of staff development between the bargaining units of each district and the academic senates. There is an acceptance of the need to adapt El Camino language and procedures to move forward in establishing progress on the standards of the accreditation process.

All of the standards related to human resources are being met at El Camino College, but attention will be required to complete the implementation of these standards at the ECC Compton Center. Examples of these issues that will be further addressed in the findings would include adopting the AAUP code of professional standards, completing faculty evaluation, and the need for both sites to move to the next level in implementing student learning outcomes. In addition, The Compton Center does not have an integrated plan-



ning process. As a consequence, personnel plans are absent and it is not possible to evaluate the extent to which there is a process whereby personnel needs will be identified and addressed. Section 14.A. of the Memorandum of Understanding between the El Camino Community College District and the Compton Community College District delineates the locus of responsibility for staffing at the Compton Educational Center and calls for a staffing plan. Section 19 provides oversight of business office functions in coordination with the special trustee. Implementation of this provision must have the highest priority. Personnel planning related to institutional mission and goals is not done, consequently the staffing plan has yet to be developed.

Administrative leadership at the ECC Compton Center has been sporadic since the loss of accreditation and the completion of the MOU that created the partnership between the two districts to provide educational services at the center. This has included instability at all levels including the Special Trustee, and the Provost/CEO. This lack of leadership extends to the middle management as well. Some stability has been achieved this academic year with the assistance of El Camino College in working with the current Special Trustee. While there are still a number of interim appointments in the management ranks the administrative coverage is in place to move the organization forward.

### **Findings and Evidence:**

There is a concern related to evaluation at both sites. It appears that student learning assessment in faculty evaluations is not institutionalized throughout the organization. It has been negotiated in the contracts but not institutionalized at both sites because of the stage of organization in SLO development. A code of ethics has been developed by the faculty at El Camino, but is not yet adopted by the ECC Compton Center faculty. The Board has an ethics policy, but one does not exist for management employees, and the campus is working on an ethics statement for the institution that has not yet been adopted. The college has also been addressing its board policies and procedures through implementing the Community College League of California model. Employee personnel files and records are secure. (III.A.1.c; III.A.3.b; III.A.1.d)

In the area of employing qualified personnel to support programs and services, the college has implemented well defined hiring processes for classified, faculty, and administrators through establishing and following policies and procedures, appropriate job credential requirements, job description review and multi constituent screening committees. During the visit, it was observed that the Compton Center has many classified staff who have outdated job descriptions. It was reported that there are several positions filled with individuals who have obsolete skills for current requirements. The Center recognizes that job classification studies must be done to match skills with position requirements. The issue of classified staff job descriptions is further complicated by the fact that AB 318 leaves the Compton CCD Merit System in Place. Addressing corrections to classifications still have to follow the Merits System Policies and Procedures.

In El Camino College's initial review of qualifications of the ECC Compton Center faculty, there were several faculty members who did not meet minimum qualifications.

These problems have now been resolved. Human resource planning is lacking and therefore not integrated with institutional planning. As the integration of the ECC Compton Center with the El Camino Campus proceeds, integrated planning must receive high priority. (III.A.1.d; III.A.6; III.B.1.a)

The college takes diversity and equity seriously as most of the college's employee base has increased in diversity since 2003. The college makes a statement that it continuously evaluates the policies, needs, and effectiveness of its human resources, although no evidence is cited. Cross training at both the El Camino Campus and the ECC Compton Center reflect positive steps recognizing a lack of knowledge in certain areas in Human Resources and Administrative Services at the ECC Compton Center. (III.A.4.b; III.A. 6)

Both the El Camino College faculty contract and the Compton CCD faculty contracts have language that provides for the assessment of progress on SLOs to be included in the evaluation process. However, this may be hindered until the implementation of SLOs at the class, program, degree and certificate level reaches the sustainability level. (III.A.1.c.)

The college has a sufficient number of staff, administrators and faculty through careful monitoring of personnel and financial considerations. The ECC Compton Center does not have an integrated planning process. As a consequence, personnel plans are absent and it is not possible to evaluate the extent to which there is a process by which personnel needs will be identified and addressed. Attention is currently being given to address the El Camino College Educational Plan and integrate that plan and the developing planning process at the ECC Compton Center. (IIIA.2.)

El Camino College has been undergoing a process for reviewing personnel policies and procedures to bring them into uniformity with the CCLC service. The process has been ongoing for several years as evidenced by the College Council agendas. The college has established policies and procedures as verified in Board Policy 7100, 7120, 7310 and 4119 for all hiring processes and interviews with faculty, staff, and managers indicate these processes are followed and the employment of personnel is fair and equitable on the El Camino Campus. In the area of securing personnel records the college has implemented appropriate procedures and Board policies appear to be well known and followed for both campuses. (III.A.3; III.A.3.a; III.A3.b)

El Camino College has a mature and developed Staff Development program and has backed up its commitment with increasing funding for professional growth for classified staff and the New Faculty Learning Academy. The college has a process to evaluate its programs through direct feedback after each opportunity. (III.A.5.a; III.A.5.b)

### **Conclusions:**

The El Camino campus partially meets Standard III A. This finding is based on the Agreement which vests personnel with the Compton District and the recently-revised

Agreement which is being implemented. Work needs to be completed at the El Camino College campus and the ECC Compton Center to close the development of SLOs to provide information for inclusion in evaluation of faculty at both sites. Progress on the development of an institutional code of ethics needs to be completed; while the ECC Compton Center indicates that faculty evaluations are in the planning stages, the site needs to get on with completing the evaluation cycle. A classification study is needed for, many classified positions and key administrative and support positions have been filled. Currently, human resource planning is absent at the ECC Compton Center. Therefore, the College, specific to Compton Center deficiencies, does not meet this Standard.

### **Standard III B - Physical Resources**

#### **General Comments:**

One of the major changes taking place since the last accreditation visit was the completion of an MOU between El Camino CCD and the Special Trustee of Compton CCD to have El Camino College offer instruction at the Compton College site as an educational center of El Camino College.

A residual of the status of Compton College accreditation was misuse of local bond funds for campus facilities. At the time El Camino College started to operate instructional programs at the site, two of the buildings (The Health Sciences Center and the Library and Learning Resource Center) had such serious construction problems that they could not be occupied. Several of the other buildings were suffering from benign neglect and the facilities staff at Compton CCD did not have the skill sets to resolve the problem. This resulted in El Camino College entering into the management of the facilities so that they could effectively provide facilities for the instructional program.

As stated in other sections of this report, it took some time to get the faculty and staff to work toward solutions to problems and therefore, it took some time to address the facilities as well. During the current academic year, the management team has been stabilized, facilities management staff has been replaced, and progress is evident all over the campus. Services are being returned and even food service will have returned to the ECC Compton Center shortly after the visiting team visit. Working with the California System Office, new construction funds have been infused into the ECC Compton Center to address basic infrastructure, retrofitting, and correction to the buildings that are currently offline.

El Camino College is currently completing major projects on campus funded under its own \$394 million local bond issues. This will rehabilitate facilities, increase parking, and provide for needed instructional space.

#### **Findings and Evidence:**

College facilities and physical resources are adequate to meet its educational mission on the El Camino campus; however, physical facilities at the ECC Compton Center are minimally adequate to meet the educational needs of that community. Comprehensive planning has been institutionalized at the El Camino site; the college recognizes and acknowledges that facilities master planning at the Compton Center is lacking. The Compton facilities are challenging although it must be noted that substantial efforts have been made to bring the facilities up to at least an adequacy level in which to conduct instruction. A draft facilities plan has been completed reflecting a site plan rather than facilities needs based on educational and other programming needs. This is a gray area in determining the scope of responsibility of the parties to the Agreement. Since the facilities belong to the Compton CCD it should be its responsibility to do educational and facility planning. This is noted in the Agreement, Section 20.A, which assigns “capital improvement projects associated with the facilities in Compton at which the Center is located” exclusively to the Compton District Board. This may interfere with the El Camino College to meet Standard III.B.1a in which “the institution plans, builds, maintains, and upgrades or replaces its physical resources in a manner that assures effective utilization and the continuing quality necessary to support its programs.” El Camino College extended its involvement into facilities management out of necessity to get classroom space online. (III.2.a; III.2.b; III.B.1; III.B.1.a; III.B.2.a; III.b.2.b)

The El Camino campus appears to be well developed in the areas of physical plant, safety and emergency planning and has a mature active public safety department. The El Camino campus is providing safe and sufficient physical resources although the facilities are aging. The college passed a bond improvement program to rehabilitate facilities at the El Camino site and Compton also passed a bond several years ago. The college also has developed a comprehensive maintenance and operations program under the leadership of the Facilities Planning and Services Division for the El Camino site and is in the draft stages of a facility master plan for the ECC Compton Center. The El Camino site is well planned and maintained and provides an inviting sense of space for students and the community. The Compton site, while less aesthetically inviting, is minimally adequate for conducting instruction while improvements are underway. While the Compton Center facilities are wanting, the current physical plant team is doing a commendable job on improving the facilities at the ECC Compton Center and is partly the result of the MOU (Sec. 19) which provides for greater management through El Camino College (III.B.1.a; III.B.1.b)

Through programs that deal with American with Disabilities Act, the Emergency Evacuation procedures, and the Police Services unit the college has developed appropriate risk management and safety measures for providing a safe learning and working environment on all college sites. (III.b.1.b.)

The El Camino campus has implemented program review to assess the adequacy of facilities for education programs and issues are integrated into the budget and in the facilities master planning through the Facilities Steering Committee. The college demonstrates adequate and appropriate linkage of facilities with institutional goals. This is verified by review of the facilities master plan inclusion in the Comprehensive Master

Plan and interviews with users of the facilities. (III.B.2.a. & b)

Two distinct pictures emerge from the visit. The El Camino campus is attractive, well maintained, inviting, and adequate to support the college's mission. Recent construction and modernization projects augment this picture. The Compton Educational Center is dated, in disrepair, two buildings are insufficient for occupancy, and sections of buildings are out of service. This picture also includes yeoman efforts to address emergency needs and create an improved learning and working environment at the Compton Center.

### **Conclusions:**

El Camino College partially meets Standard III B. This finding is based on the Agreement which vests facilities and capital activities with the Compton District and the recently-revised Agreement maintains that separation, although the Compton site has significant issues that are being addressed through bond and state capital outlay funding. Planning, evaluation, and action appear to be a mature ongoing process at the El Camino campus and developing strategies at the ECC Compton Center are encouraging.

## **Standard III C - Technology Resources**

### **General Comments:**

El Camino College has continued to grow in its effective use of technology since the last accreditation visit. There have been expansions to the infrastructure backbone, improvements and expansions of computer labs, and changes to the software used for planning, curriculum review, and institutional research. The Technology Committee responsibilities have been expanded as part of the new planning process. There is certainly concern about the replacement of technology and the need to commit to replacement costs. Most of these concerns are not much different than any other campus under the current budget constraints. However, it is evident that El Camino College has made a commitment to maintain its technology infrastructure to meet the instructional needs of its students.

This report must address the technology of the ECC Compton Center. This is complicated again by the fact that the facilities belong to the Compton CCD and changes are subject to joint agreement. El Camino has taken steps to ensure access for students and efforts have been made to mend the backbone and ensure student access to technology on that site.

### **Findings and Evidence**

El Camino College has a standing technology committee and two subcommittees to assist in identifying and planning technology resources. Although technology planning is occurring and a Technology Plan update is planned, a consistent cycle of evaluation of technology resources is not well established. The college has been assessing its technol-

ogy needs in the classroom using a 2006 computer inventory as a benchmark document. Technology needs were submitted to the Planning and Budget committee who recommended institutionalization of a technology replacement budget. The efforts appear to be well supported and verifying interviews establish that technology planning and resource development has been consistent since 2005 under new leadership in the technology department. These efforts include the needs of the ECC Compton Center where there is a migration of software to assure communication compatibility. (III.C.1)

The college has been struggling with HVAC and facility issues for its IT infrastructure at the ECC Compton Center and is making advances in this area. The college states in the self-study that it does not fully comply with the Standard which calls for funding to support the development, maintenance, and enhancement of its programs and services. (III.C.1.c; III.C.1.d)

Technology resources are reviewed through the El Camino Technology Committee with two subcommittees to look at the academics and the administrative areas of the college. Recommendations for changes go to the Planning and Budget Committee where they may be endorsed and recommended to the President for funding. Several initiatives have been funded for implementation to improve the technology services since 2006. There is some concern expressed in the self study report about the sustainability of funding for technology services. The ECC Compton Center is not addressed specifically, which is of concern to the team. The college notes that the recent tying of the Technology Committee to the Planning and Budgeting Committee has assisted in meeting the standard of technology enhancing operations and effectiveness of the institution. (III.C.1; III.C.1.a)

El Camino College has entered into extensive efforts to address the technology needs at the ECC Compton Center within the resources and the impact of the partnership. While a great number of changes have been implemented, there is still a need for planning that will have to be addressed specifically for this site. That responsibility may fall upon the Compton CCD as it works on long range planning and other activities that will make them eligible to seek future accreditation.

In the area of providing quality training for effective application of technology the college appears to meet the standard although it is dealing with the integration of the new enterprise resource system into the college culture. The college is trying to step up its training to assist in this area. (III.C.1.b)

The college has adequate staff and resources dedicated to the planning, acquiring, maintenance and upgrading of the technology systems and note the efforts at integrating the El Camino and ECC Compton Center staff. The college has recently conducted a technology infrastructure upgrade. The two locations are operating with two library systems and it is noted that this should be reviewed for effectiveness. There appears to be a problem with the cooling of the equipment rooms and the issue of equipment compatibility. (III.C.1.c)

El Camino College expresses some concerns about its own ability to distribute and utilize

technology resources. Despite a demand for more services, the lack of funding prohibits expanding current services. Although the self-study report identifies a process to plan improvements initiated with the Technology Committee, the college appears to have areas where there is no true integration with ongoing funding. The self-study identifies some deficiencies in meeting this standard and this area will require additional efforts by the college. (III,C.1.d)

The technology planning appears to be integrated to a comprehensive Educational and Facilities Master planning process. Information is provided to both the Technology Committee and the Planning and Budget Committee. (III.C.2)

The college meets Standard III C although there is some concern about the commitment to technology. There appears to be some struggle with integrating technology into the overall college culture although it appears that over the past two years that much work has been accomplished for integrating technological requirements into the college budget and planning processes.

### **Conclusions**

Overall the college meets Standard III C. The college has made strides at integrating technology into planning and budgeting through assessing its needs and requirements and working to get a plan in place for continued improvement. The college appears to understand that it needs to improve in this area and is working to accomplish improved technology and stabilize funding for technology maintenance and expansion of technology.

### **Standard III D – Financial Resources**

#### **General Comments:**

Among the major changes taking place since the last accreditation visit has been the acquisition of a local bond issue in the amount of \$394 million for construction projects at the El Camino Campus. El Camino College has faced some challenges with the conversion to a new process following the equalization bill that changed the funding formula for community colleges. However, El Camino College is in a position of fiscal strength and is dealing well with the current state budget problems.

As with other areas under Standard III the completion of the Agreement between El Camino College and the Special Trustee for the Compton CCD will address the challenges being faced in this standard. The visiting team has had to take care to separate the application of standards in relation to El Camino College fulfilling its Agreement and the responsibilities for Compton CCD in operating its resources through the Special Trustee. This is challenged by Agreement language which states “that Compton shall not assume any responsibility that requires status as an accredited institution” yet much of the fiscal issues – which are accredited institution specific -- are outside El Camino College’s direct control specific to salary, benefits, and facilities. These represent the majority of any

community college budget.

There is interesting overlap caused by the need of El Camino College to have oversight of instructional programs and to account for instructional costs related to the two sites separately. El Camino College is requiring the ECC Compton Center staff to use Datatel for this need and that has been questioned by the FCMAT team. Compton CCD is on People Soft which is used by the County Schools in Los Angeles. These challenges had to be carefully separated as the visiting team evaluated how El Camino College was applying the standards to both sites.

### **Findings and Evidence:**

The self study report clearly notes a lack of integration of financial planning to the mission of goals of the college. Although considerable activities have taken place to provide an infrastructure for fulfilling this need, planning is not significantly factored into financial decision-making ; this is pronounced at the ECC Compton Center. The newly appointed provost recognizes the importance of sound planning as the foundation for resource allocation. Careful monitoring and the implementation of budget controls – absent to date – are intended to provide a baseline to manage fiscal resources in future years. There appears to be adequate attention paid to meeting long-range financial goals and the El Camino campus is fiscally sound. (III.D.1.a; III.D.1 c)

The college has a Planning and Budget Committee (PBC) that meets regularly and maintains minutes of its meetings as well as having established a regular budget calendar. It is not clear how budget recommendations get through the process but minutes reflect there is some level of activity related to the Planning and Budget Committee trying to create a linkage between planning and budgeting. The college has sufficient financial resources to support student learning programs and services as demonstrated through the fiscal trend analysis of CCFS 311 posted on the System Office website and the current and previous annual budgets. (III.D)

El Camino Colleges' self-study report acknowledges that it has not completely integrated its planning and budgeting process with the mission and goals of the college. The process described includes tracking through *Plan Builder*, software the college has recently implemented and is using it as a tool. There is not sufficient evidence that fiscal planning is integrated with the mission and goals of the college. Although there is a comprehensive master plan it is not clear how it is used in fiscal planning. (III.D.1.a)

The college meets the standard of assessing finances realistically. The college has demonstrated that it understands its liabilities, and revenue availability. The liability for retiree health benefit was identified in 2005 in an actuarial study and the district has set aside funding to begin covering the liability. (III.D.1.b)

The college developed a process for insuring that short range financial planning included long-range financial priorities. Planning activities start in the fall leading to budgeting in the spring using *Plan Builder* as a tool for financial planning and budget development.



The college has a Budget Development Calendar, which allows for transparency of the process. The College has been refining a systematic process for integrating planning and budgeting for a couple of years. The ECC Compton Center is being integrated into this planning and budgeting process since it is the means of establishing and approving annual budgets. While the process and planning tool appears to be robust and has potential for being effective, the visiting team is concerned the college has failed to complete a cycle of planning. (III.D.1.c; III.D.d)

El Camino College's financial system has integrity and is monitored for its effectiveness through the external audits done each year. The self-study discusses a process for reviewing and correcting audit exceptions and it was verified through a review of the audits that the college has corrected almost all past deficiencies for the El Camino site. (III.D.2.a)

The fiscal soundness of the ECC Compton Center is of great concern. (Eligibility Requirements 17 and 18) The State has provided a \$30 million loan from which the Center can draw funds. To date, approximately \$13 million has been drawn down. The current annual budget shows a \$3.2 million operating deficit for Center operations. The ECC Compton Center provost and ECC college president are keenly aware that the Center cannot operate indefinitely with expenditures exceeding revenues. The ECC Compton Center has received for 2006-2007 an "Unqualified Opinion with a Going Concern" noting that the entity's financial condition is such that there is a doubt as to the ability to continue in the future. As noted in the audit the college is undergoing what is called "recovery and maintenance". For 2007 Compton CCD received 29 Findings, Questioned Costs, Federal and State Findings many of which are material in nature. The 2007-2008 audit has not been completed at the time of the visit.

Due to the absence of integrated planning which drives the resource allocation process, it is difficult, at best, to manage resources and allocate resources consistent with the Center's mission. The ECC Compton Center does not meet Standard III.D. In addition, the ECC Compton Center does not meet Eligibility Requirements 17 and 18. It can be argued that this fiscal problem and the necessary planning need to be addressed by Compton CCD and not El Camino CCD. Steps have been proposed by the Special Trustee at Compton CCD to implement the strategic plan and planning process of El Camino College on the ECC Compton Center as a method to getting that site in line for planning in the future. (III.2.a)

There was very little discussion about the distribution of appropriate financial information throughout the institution in the self study report although interviews and board materials, and Budget and Planning Committee minutes verify widespread distribution of financial information. The self study does describe where financial information is distributed, although not how it is distributed at the ECC Compton Center. (III.D.2.b)

A review of the standard that requires sufficient cash flow describes how the college addresses risk, and notes the strong reserves of the college. The budget, audit and CCFS 311s verify increasing reserves and fiscal stability over the past few years. There does not

appear to be any issues in this area at the El Camino site. The question should arise as to the capability of El Camino to financially sustain ECC Compton Center for any length of time without substantial right sizing for the Compton organization to match its student base. (III.D.2.c)

El Camino College practices effective oversight of its fiscal resources as the audits have indicated unqualified opinions and findings that are not serious material weaknesses for internal controls. The El Camino campus meets the standard related to all financial resources used with integrity. The college has policies and procedures that are followed in this area. (III.D.2.d; III.D.2.e)

The District has a process of Board Agenda review to insure that all contractual agreements adhere to District policies and procedures to maintain the integrity and support the mission of the college as evidenced in policy and procedures and Board Agenda packages. The Administrative Services area has completed a program review to assess the effectiveness of financial management processes and has developed actions consistent with improving the area as evidenced in the program reviews. However this final review was just completed in the last six weeks. (III.D.2.e; III.D.2.f)

### **Conclusions:**

The college meets Standard III D in almost all areas, although it is still struggling with the integration of budgeting with planning. It appears the institution has tried to put a process in place to fully address Standard III D. The college has effective oversight and compliance in fiscal areas as noted in the audits and the fiscal trends of the district. The college is fiscally stable and does not appear to have any real financial issues except the lingering fiscal issues at ECC Compton Center in generating commensurate revenues to support the current staff. This latter issue is an area that will need to be addressed.

### **Recommendations:**

5. El Camino College and the ECC Compton Center need to fully integrate SLO assessment into the faculty evaluation process. The /ECC Compton Center must implement its faculty evaluations and use the results of these evaluations to encourage instructional improvements and faculty development plans. (III.A.1.b; III.A.1.c)
6. The ECC Compton Center must develop a fiscal management plan, matched to its revenues, to assure the fiscal soundness of the institution. (III.D.2.c, III.D.2.d, III.D.2.g; III.D.3)
7. The Compton Educational Center should develop a staffing plan which assures the effectiveness of human resources, includes written criteria for all personnel, and that assigns individuals to duties appropriate to their expertise and the needs of the Center (III.A.1.a, III.A.1.b).

8. The Compton Educational Center develop a facilities master plan, linked to educational planning, and integrate this plan with the Center's overall planning process (III.B.I.a, III.B.2.a, III.B.2.b)

## **STANDARD FOUR: LEADERSHIP AND GOVERNANCE**

### **General Comments:**

Two issues were identified by the visiting team that addresses leadership and governance of El Camino College. The first issue is relatively minor and is centered on a difference between the Board of Trustees and the Academic Senate at El Camino College on whether collegial consultation will be based on “mutual consent” or “rely primarily upon.” This has resulted in some contentious moments and at the time of the visit, the Academic Senate was asking for an assistance team from the Community College League of California (CCLC) and the Statewide Academic Senate.

In August of 2006, the Board of Trustees of the El Camino CCD passed a resolution to provide instructional programs for the Compton CCD service area by operating that campus as the ECC Compton Center. While that action was passed on a three to two vote, the Board of Trustees has fully supported the action. A revised Agreement between the El Camino Community College District and the Compton Community College District was Board approved on June 18, 2008. This resolution was passed on a five to zero vote. The revised Agreement of 2008 further clarifies the responsibilities of the partners to the document. It ensures El Camino College oversight of instruction and services that will impact its accreditation status, and further clarifies the responsibilities of El Camino College and the Compton CCD through the Special Trustee.

The previous visiting team report reflected concerns about the maintenance of Board Policies and Administrative Regulations. The Board of Trustees has actively addressed continuous update of its policies and procedures and had been implementing its policies as a participant in the League Policy Development Process. However, a review of the Ethics Policy of the Board it was found that the board has not complied with the standard IV.B.1.h to define a policy for dealing with behavior that violates its code.

While the self study report reflected difficulty making progress in working with the Compton CCD faculty, the visiting team was pleased to find there is collaboration between the ECC Compton Center and the El Camino College Academic Senate with the Center’s Faculty Council as a standing committee of the El Camino Academic Senate. Although the decision-making that affects the operation of the ECC Compton Center is complex, the Compton Special Trustee and the President of El Camino College confer on all matters that require the approval of the El Camino Board of Trustees and reach consensus before decisions are finalized and implemented

Finally, the visiting team was pleased to find that the collaboration among the faculty of the two sites had significantly improved and the ECC Compton Center was seriously attempting to meet the standards of accreditation. While the first year was contentious, there is an atmosphere of hope and evident improvement that has transpired this second academic year.

## **Findings and Evidence:**

### **A. Decision-Making Roles and Processes**

One of the recommendations from the previous visiting team addressed the lack of linkage in the process for planning, program review, budgeting, and moving toward continuous improvement. The constituencies of El Camino College set out to clarify this process and completed activities to clarify the process and bring closure to how this is communicated. Among the issues that had been previously identified was the process of program review, making progress on establishing student learning outcomes, and linking this information to continuous improvement.

The 2007 – 2010 Strategic Plan describes the vision, mission, and philosophy statements values, guiding principles, and goals for the college. The goal development in 2007 was extended to the El Camino College and ECC Compton Center faculty. This was validated through review of survey information, planning documents and minutes of 23 councils and committees.

To ensure broad-based communications and participation in the governance process ECC Compton Center consultation committees were formed within three categories: (a) Shared Governance; (b) Academic Senate; and (c) Faculty Council of El Camino College Academic Senate (IV.A.1)

In addition to having candid discussions within meetings, the college fosters participation and inclusion in many ways. Flex days which were originally created as opportunities for faculty development include classified staff as well. It is fair to note that the attendance prevalent during group interviews was that of administrators. However, the team was also able to interview the President of the Academic Senate, the President of the Classified Senate and the President of the Student Senate through one-on-one interviews and the views stated above were confirmed regarding the consideration and time provided for the presentation or the analysis of various points of view prior to President or Board approval. (IV.A.1; IV.A.2)

The merging of the Compton Center created resistance from that faculty and staff at the beginning; however, this resistance has been resolved. An enormous amount of work was generated from the combination of two very different entities in curriculum, admission and registration processes to name a few. During these times, the District was in a crisis mode. They were facing an angry community which had been left without a college. The curriculum taught by Compton College CCD no longer exists. (IV.A.1; IV.A.2)

There is a sense among the classified staff that not all positions vacated are restored even though the work required has increased. Some administrators are better at advocating for resources for their departments than others. From time to time this has created some morale problems. However, the bond that holds all groups together is a sense of purpose and

a determination to serve students well. (IV.A.3)

So that employees keep abreast of all of that is happening, communication takes place through College Council and also goes out by e-mail and through the President's Newsletter. However, the evaluation of governance and decision making structures is not consistent. There has been an evaluation of College Council and the Planning and Budget Committee, but not of the other various groups. This standard is only partially met; however, the college has included evaluation of all collegial consultation committees in the planning agenda. The leadership stated to the team that the evaluation of committees has already started and is on-going as a planning phase. Improvement in college-wide communication remains a goal. (IV.A.5)

One of the processes used to ensure that the linkage was taking place from this changed planning process was to incorporate a planning tool called *Plan Builder*. This tool was just being implemented at the time of the visit and most of the progress on establishing these new procedures appears to have only been in place during the last year. A concern was raised about the effectiveness of the process when it was discovered that approximately 25 percent of the programs at El Camino College had not been reviewed since 1993 and the campus revealed that curriculum guides were only reviewed every 10 years. The process had certainly been established, but the visiting team concerned that the cycle of activity from planning to continuous improvement had yet to be accomplished. (IV.A.4;IV.A.5)

## **B. Board and Administrative Organization:**

The visiting team met with the Board of Trustees, reviewed policies and procedures, talked with appropriate constituent groups and reviewed other evidence. This review provided evidence that the Board of Trustees sets and reviews policies, curriculum hiring, contracts, facilities, salaries, budgets and legal matters in open and public meetings. Policies and procedures set forth the Board's responsibilities to ensure the integrity and effectiveness of student learning. The Board is regularly provided information about student success, planning, and reviews this information to ensure the quality of education. (IV.B.1)

The Board adheres to a defined process when hiring and when evaluating the president. (IV.B.1.j)

Members are elected representatives of the service area of the El Camino College District; the Board represents all segments of the community by advocating for their needs. The visiting team reviewed minutes, policy, and held discussions with constituent groups and had discussions with members of the board to determine the board assumes ultimate responsibility for educational, legal and financial matters; they review and evaluate all facets of planning and assessment, as well as student learning programs and services and the allocation of resources to support them. The Board approved El Camino College Vision, Mission, Philosophy, Values and Guiding Principles. These statements specifically outline that El Camino will be the college of choice for successful student learning, car-

ing student services and open access; that it will meet the educational needs of its diverse community and ensure student success by offering quality, comprehensive educational opportunities. (IV.B1a,b and c)

Board Policy 2010 provides for Board size with five members elected at-large by qualified voters and one non-voting student member. The trustees serve four year staggered terms with elections occurring every 2 years for some members. This allows for community input every two years. (IV.A.1.d)

Board members attend the Effective Trustee Workshop and other conferences presented by CCLC for ongoing and new Board development and orientation. The President disseminates a monthly letter to Board members to update them on all matters of interest. The President may meet monthly with new Board members. A mentoring process was also developed for new Board members as they begin their Board membership. The Board uses a self evaluation process developed by the California Community College League to determine its effectiveness and to set priorities. This is done annually. A summary of evaluation responses is publicly presented and discussed. Board Policy 2715 defines the standards of ethical conduct for Board members; however it lacks a policy for sanctioning those who violate this policy. (IV.B.1.e,f,g, and h)

The governing board is informed about and involved in, the accreditation process. They receive information on the accreditation standards through reports and presentations with an opportunity for discussion. The Board of Trustees approved the Accreditation Self-Study, Progress Reports and Substantive Change Proposals before they are sent to the Commission. (IV.B.i)

Board Policy 2430 delegates administrative authority to the president tasking him with extensive responsibility in carrying out policies adopted by the Board and executing decisions requiring administrative actions. The President is evaluated annually by the Board in closed session during the course of two or three meetings. The President begins the process with a self-evaluation detail progress on meeting goals and objectives and describing accomplishments; finally, the president and the Board set performance goals for the next year. Members of the constituent groups are also provided an opportunity to evaluate the President. (IV.B.j)

The Board delegates day-to-day operational responsibility of the college to the President. The President serves as the educational and administrative leader of the college and is evaluated annually by the Board of Trustees. While the President has primary responsibility to manage the institution, he delegates authority to the vice presidents to provide leadership in their areas of responsibility. These include planning and budget development, course and program offerings, enrollment management, student support services, fiscal and facilities management and human resources. In order to oversee improvement of the teaching and learning environment, the President has established procedures, systems and tools to establish a collegial process that sets values, goals and priorities; ensure that planning and evaluation rely on high quality research and analysis on external and internal conditions; ensure that educational planning is integrated with resource planning

to achieve student learning; and establish procedures to evaluate overall institutional planning and implementation efforts. The observations of the visiting team found that while the structure to carry out these delegated responsibilities was in place, that there is significant room for improvement to ensure that the process is being followed particularly as it relates to program review, student learning outcomes, and completion of the planning cycle for all programs and services of the college. (IV.B.2.a-d)

The President communicates annual goals and State of the District to employees at the general session meeting held annually at the start of the new school year. The President ensures, through his vice presidents, that each area of the college operates according to law, board policies and institutional mission. The President takes responsibility for establishing procedures to ensure sound fiscal practices for budget planning and expenditures. Using a collegial approach the President develops and presents the annual budget to the Board for approval. (IV.B.2.a-e)

### **Conclusions:**

El Camino College substantially meets Standard IV with the exception of completing its policy on Board Ethics to include consequences for violating the Code of Ethics

El Camino College is to be commended for taking the extraordinary action to ensure that students served by the Compton CCD would be able to maintain access to a community college education in their community. The support of the Board of Trustees in that endeavor is exceptional. The visiting team was pleased to find that the faculty and staff at the ECC Compton Center have taken the task of addressing the standards of WASC seriously and is moving forward on that task. The recently amended MOU approved by the Board of Trustees will provide guidelines for the partnership that should facilitate future progress.

There is a need for the Board of Trustees to maintain its vigilance of the communication taking place to complete the recommendations that are set forth in this visiting team report, particularly with respect to completing the work on planning, program review, budgeting, and continuous improvement to ensure that the cycle is completed and all constituents including students are informed of this progress.

### **Recommendation:**

9. The Board of Trustees of El Camino Community College District must include in its code of ethics a clearly defined policy for dealing with behavior that violates this code. (Standard IV.B.h)